PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW

Historical Trajectories of the Third Portuguese Empire: Re-examining the Dynamics of Imperial Rule and Colonial Societies (1900-1975)

Interdisciplinary

Special Theme Issue

Volume 25 Number 1

Summer 201

ISSN 1057-1515

ABER

PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW

Editors: Cláudia Castelo, Philip J. Havik, and Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo

VOLUME 25 • NUMBER 1 • 2017 PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW

Chief Editor: IVANA ELBL

Associate Editors: TIMOTHY COATES ANTÓNIO COSTA PINTO JOSÉ C. CURTO MARIA JOÃO DODMAN MARTIN M. ELBL

EDITOR EMERITUS: DOUGLAS L. WHEELER

International Editorial Board

JULIET ANTUNES SABLOSKY Georgetown University Francis Dutra UCAL, Santa Barbara

Carlos Balsas Arizona State University

> MARCELO BORGES Dickinson College

CAROLINE BRETTELL SMU, Dallas (TX)

MICHEL CAHEN CNRS / Sciences Po, Bordeaux SUSANNAH HUMBLE FERREIRA University of Guelph

> HAROLD JOHNSON University of Virginia

ROBERT A. KENNEDY York University (Toronto)

STEWART LLOYD-JONES ISCTE, Lisbon

FERNANDO NUNES Mount St. Vincent University WILSON ALVES DE PAIVA Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Goiás

> RENÉ PÉLISSIER Orgeval,France

MARIA FERNANDA ROLLO Universidade Nova de Lisboa

STANLEY PAYNE U. of Wisconsin, Madison AN IMPRINT OF BAYWOLF PRESS & ÉDITIONS BAYWOLF (2012 –) Peterborough, Ontario, K9H 1H6 http://www.trentu.ca/psr (mirror); http://www.maproom44.com/psr

FORMERLY PUBLISHED BY THE PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (2002-2011)



Printed and bound in Peterborough, Ontario, Canada. Design, digital setting, general production: Baywolf Press 桊 Éditions Baywolf

Pro Forma Academic Institutional Host, 2002-2017: Lady Eaton College (Trent University)

© 2017 Baywolf Press & Éditions Baywolf and Portuguese Studies Review. All rights reserved.

This publication is protected by copyright. Subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions governing relevant collective licensing agreements or open access distribution nodes in which the publisher participates, no commercial reproduction or transmission of any part, by any means, digital or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or inclusion in data storage and retrieval systems, may take place without the prior written consent of *Baywolf Press* # *Éditions Baywolf*.

National Library of Canada Cataloguing Data Portuguese Studies Review ISSN 1057-1515 Semiannual v. : ill. : 23 cm 1. Portugal–Civilization–Periodicals. 2. Africa, Portuguese-speaking–Civilization–Periodicals. 3. Brazil–Civilization–Periodicals. 4. Portugal–Civilisation–Périodiques. 5. Afrique lusophone– Civilisation–Périodiques. 6. Brésil–Civilisation–Périodiques. DP532 909/.0917/5691005 21

Library of Congress Cataloguing Data Portuguese Studies Review ISSN 1057-1515 Semiannual v. : ill. : 23 cm 1. Portugal–Civilization–Periodicals. 2. Africa, Portuguese-speaking–Civilization–Periodicals. 3. Brazil–Civilization–Periodicals. DP532 .P67 909/.091/5691 20 92-659516

SPECIAL THEME ISSUE

HISTORICAL TRAJECTORIES OF THE THIRD PORTUGUESE EMPIRE: RE-EXAMINING THE DYNAMICS OF IMPERIAL RULE AND COLONIAL SOCIETIES (1900-1975)

50

Issue Guest Editors

CLÁUDIA CASTELO Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade de Lisboa

PHILIP J. HAVIK Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical (IHMT), Universidade Nova, Lisbon

> MIGUEL BANDEIRA JERÓNIMO Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra

PORTUGUESESTUDIESREVIEWVOLUME 25, No. 12017

Contents

Introduction

Historical Trajectories of the Third Portuguese Empire: Reexamining the Dynamics of Imperial Rule and Colonial Societies (1900-1975)	Cláudia Castelo, Philip J. Havik, and Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo	3
The Health of the Empire: Knowledge, Transfers, and Laboratories		
From Hospitals to Villages: Population Health, Medical Services and Disease Control in Former Portuguese Africa	Philip J. Havik	17
Sleeping Sickness Control and the Transnational Politics of Mass Chemoprophylaxis in Portuguese Colonial Africa	Samuël Coghe	57
African Knowledge and Resilience in Late Portuguese Colonial Empire: the Agro-Pastoralists of the Southwestern Angola	Cláudia Castelo	91
The Labours of the Empire: On Scales and Comparisons		
A "Very Delicate Position": Portuguese "Native Labour" Policies and International Non- metropolitan Labour Standards in the Aftermath of Second World War (1945-1949)	José Pedro Monteiro	121
On Private Coercive Power in Angola: Towards a Comparative Approach	Teresa Furtado	151
<i>The (Re)ordering of the Empire: On the Development of Control</i>		
On the "Efficiency" of Civilization: Politics, Religion and the Native Settlement in Portuguese Africa in the 1940s	Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and Hugo Gonçalves Dores	179
The Good and the Bad Concentration: <i>Regedorias</i> in Angola	Bernardo Pinto da Cruz and Diogo Ramada Curto	205

The Administration of the Empire: Plans and Repertoires and Improvisation		
The Colonial State and its Non-citizens: "Native Courts" and Judicial Duality in Angola	Maria da Conceição Neto	235
The Colonial Budgets, a Sophisticated Portuguese Late Imperialism Propaganda Device	Luís Filipe Madeira	255
Decolonisation, Improvised: A Social History of the Transfer of Power in Cabo Verde, 1974–1976	Alexander Keese	291
The Cultures of the Empire: Gender, Identity, Memory		
Portuguese-speaking Goan Women Writers in Late Colonial India (1860-1940)	Filipa Lowndes Vicente	315
War Narratives Then and Now: Ex-Combatants' Memories of Angola	Maria José Lobo Antunes	347

CONTRIBUTORS

MIGUEL BANDEIRA JERÓNIMO is a Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Social Studies-University of Coimbra, Portugal. He has been working on the historical intersections between internationalism(s) and imperialism, and on the late colonial entanglements between idioms, programs and repertoires of development and of control and coercion in European colonial empires. He is the author of *The "Civilizing Mission" of Portuguese Colonialism* (c. 1870-1930) (2015), and the co-editor of *The Ends of European Colonial Empires* (2015). In 2017, he co-edited *Internationalism, Imperialism and the Formation of the Contemporary World*. He is also co-editor of the book series "História & Sociedade" at Edições 70 and "The Portuguese Speaking World: Its History, Politics and Culture" at Sussex Academic.

CLÁUDIA CASTELO, historian, has a PhD by the Instituto de Ciências Sociais, Universidade de Lisboa. Since 2014, she is a research fellow at the Centro Interuniversitário de História das Ciências e da Tecnologia, Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade de Lisboa, where she coordinates the project "Field Scientists in the 'Luso-Tropical Setting': Knowledge, Ideology and Governance in Late Portuguese Empire".

SAMUËL COGHE is Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the University of Giessen. He received his PhD in History from the European University Institute in Florence and has been Postdoctoral Fellow at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science and at the Free University in Berlin. He has published several articles on the history of colonial medicine and demography in Portuguese Angola and on the abolition of the slave trade and slavery in the nineteenth-century South Atlantic. He is currently working on publishing a book manuscript on population politics in Portuguese Angola, while also engaging with a new research project on colonial agriculture.

MARIA DA CONCEIÇÃO NETO is an Angolan historian teaching at the University Agostinho Neto (Luanda) since 1990. She was for a while a researcher in the Angolan National Archives. She received her African History PhD from SOAS (London, 2012) and her main research and published articles have focused on colonial Angola in the twentieth century.

TERESA FURTADO is a Research Fellow for the PhD Program in Global Studies at the New University of Lisbon (FCSH-UNL) with a dissertation project on colonial concessionary enterprises in Angola, in particular their autonomy in the governance of African workers. Her PhD research is funded by FCT – Foundation for Science and Technology.

HUGO GONÇALVES DORES is a PhD in History by the University of Lisbon (2014). He is currently a Postdoctoral Researcher at the Centre for Social Studies (University of Coimbra) with a project on educational policies in late colonialism in a comparative perspective. He has been working on religious/missionary and educational issues in colonial contexts.

PHILIP J. HAVIK (PhD Social Sciences, Leiden University, The Netherlands) is senior researcher at the Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical (IHMT) of the Universidade Nova in Lisbon, while also teaching at the same institution. His multidisciplinary research centers among other upon the study of public health and tropical medicine, health systems, colonial and postcolonial governance in sub-Saharan Africa, with special emphasis on Lusophone countries. His recent publications include "Guinea Bissau's Rural Economy and Society: A Reassessment of Colonial and Postcolonial Dynamics," in Patrick Chabal and Toby O. Green, eds., *Guinea Bissau: From Micro-state to 'Narco-state'* (Hurst, 2016).

ALEXANDER KEESE is a Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF) Research Professor at the Université de Genève, Switzerland. He is the author of *Living with Ambiguity: Integrating an African Elite in French and Portuguese Africa*, 1930–61 (Stuttgart: Steiner, 2007), of (with Philip Havik and Maciel Santos), *Administration and Taxation in Former Portuguese Africa* (1900–1945) (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015), and of *Ethnicity and the Colonial State: Finding & Representing Group Identifications in Coastal West African and Global Perspective* (1850–1960) (Leiden: Brill, 2016).

MARIA JOSÉ LOBO ANTUNES received a PhD in Anthropology from Universidade Nova de Lisboa. She is a postdoctoral research fellow at CRIA - Centre for Research in Anthropology.

FILIPA LOWNDES VICENTE, a historian, is a researcher at the Institute of Social Sciences (ICS) of the University of Lisbon. In 2015 she was a visiting professor at King's College (University of London) and in 2016 at Brown University (Providence, USA). Among other books and articles she has published *Other Orientalisms. India between Florence and Bombay*, 1860-1900 (New Delhi: Orient BlackSwan, 2012).

LUÍS FILIPE MADEIRA graduated in Affaires Publiques et Internationales at the Université Catholique de Louvain (Belgium) and was a research fellow at the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), London University. He obtained his PhD at the Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Bordeaux, and currently lectures in Political Sciences at the Universidade da Beira Interior in Portugal.

JOSÉ PEDRO MONTEIRO is currently a researcher at the Centre for Social Studies (University of Coimbra, Portugal). He holds a PhD in History, with a doctoral dissertation "A internacionalização das políticas laborais 'indígenas' no império colonial português (1944-1962)". His main research interests are late colonialism, decolonization, colonial labour and its international and transnational dimensions.

BERNARDO PINTO DA CRUZ is a PhD candidate in Global Studies at the New University of Lisbon (IPRI-UNL) with a dissertation project about indirect rule and uneven degrees of district-level public goods distribution. His doctoral research is funded by Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia (FCT).

DIOGO RAMADA CURTO is professor at the Universidade Nova de Lisboa, and researcher at the IPRI. He is co-author, with Bernardo Cruz and Teresa Furtado, of *Políticas coloniais em tempo de revoltas: Angola circa 1961* (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 2016).

Abstracts

From Hospitals to Villages: Population Health, Medical Services and Disease Control in Former Portuguese Africa (*Philip J. Havik*)

The present paper addresses the trajectories of public health and disease control in a Portuguese colonial context, tracing developments in terms of rural health infrastructures from the 1920s to the late 1960s. The debates on the projects and their implementation in Angola, Guinea and Mozambique, and beyond, constitute crucial markers for services' capacity to guarantee the economic productivity of indigenous populations. To achieve this goal, health services and vertical campaigns sought to engage with local communities, change their health seeking behaviour and adapt facilities to the terrain. Campaigns for the control and eradication of sleeping sickness, a rural disease, provided opportunities for developing innovative approaches to health management. After 1945, attempts were made to implement a model for combining disease control with population health in a rural environment in Portuguese West Africa by adapting health facilities, which would eventually be challenged by a nationalist liberation movement in the 1960s.

Sleeping Sickness Control and the Transnational Politics of Mass Chemoprophylaxis in Portuguese Colonial Africa (*Samuël Coghe*)

This article analyses two campaigns of mass chemoprophylaxis against sleeping sickness in Portuguese colonial Africa: preventive mass atoxylization (1926-1932), which was virtually confined to Angola, and pentamidinization campaigns in Angola and Guiné (1948-1970s), which were part of a broader international scheme. It argues that while the medical knowledge and practices involved in both schemes were the product of multiple inner- and inter-imperial exchanges, the logics behind their rise and fall were intimately linked to ideas of national prestige and inter-imperial competition. By revealing not only inter-imperial transfers, but also important differences in approach *within* Portuguese Africa, the article further argues that mass chemoprophylaxis was hardly a 'national' Portuguese method. Local epidemiological, political and financial circumstances as well as a certain path dependency connecting both campaigns were crucial instead. Based on many untapped sources, the article contributes to the much under-researched history of Portuguese colonial medicine from a broader, transnational perspective.

African Knowledge and Resilience in Late Portuguese Colonial Empire: The Agro-Pastoralists of Southwestern Angola (*Cláudia Castelo*)

Tensions between African pastoralists and the European livestock farmers increased during the last decades of Portuguese colonial rule, in proportion to the growth of large cattle ranches owned by Portuguese settlers in southwestern Angola. For a long time, the "traditional" cattle rearing system was considered irrational and unproductive, and the pastoralist populations classified as nomads. The Mission for Angolan Agricultural Surveys (MIAA), created to respond to a request from FAO, did intensive fieldwork among the Angolan rural populations, collecting unprecedented data on their ways of life. Called upon by the colonial authorities to provide information on the "nomad problem", it demonstrated agro-pastoralists'resilience vis-a-vis the natural environment and the ongoing modernisation policies, while exposing the disruptions caused by the ranching system. The paper reveals that from inside the colonial state apparatus,

alternative development ideas emerged based upon "vernacular science" that competed with the "repressive developmentalism" in the colonial war context.

A "Very Delicate Position": Portuguese "Native Labour" Policies and International Non-metropolitan Labour Standards in the Aftermath of Second World War (1945-1949) (*José Pedro Monteiro*)

This article explores the ways in which colonial and imperial officials assessed social and labour realities and policies in the Portuguese colonial empire in the aftermath of World War II. By recovering their diagnosis and political and societal imaginations in relation to the evolving international debates on colonial labour, this article provides a more nuanced appraisal of Portuguese engagement with international institutions, specially the International Labour Organization, during these years. By doing so, the article contributes to the study of colonial labour dynamics and debates in a period still relatively understudied and sheds light on the very much neglected international resonances of the former.

On Private Coercive Power in Angola: Towards a Comparative Approach (Teresa Furtado)

This article is an attempt to put into perspective the extended role that private colonial enterprises played during the late Portuguese colonialism. Examining two colonial companies operating in Angola, *Companhia Geral dos Algodões de Angola* (COTONANG) and *Companhia de Diamantes de Angola* (DIAMANG), the article establishes a comparison between different patterns and programs of control and welfare provided by those entrepreneurial companies. The focus is on the nature of their internal administration and coercive supervision of the African labour, but also on the existence of some degree of autonomy and infrastructural capacity vis-àvis the colonial state, mainly during the beginning of the colonial war.

On the "Efficiency" of Civilization: Politics, Religion and the Native Settlement in Portuguese Africa in the 1940s (*Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo* and *Hugo Gonçalves Dores*)

This text explores a particular debate, with distinct but interrelated political and religious genealogies and intersections, about the potential advantages and inconveniences of the specific policies of resettlement and concentration of "native" population in the Portuguese colonial empire, illuminating how the latter were conceived as instruments of political and socio-economic control and development. The interaction between the state and the church and between political and ecclesiastical arguments and purposes about the projects of evangelization, "civilization" and development of colonial societies in the 1940s and 1950s is also analysed.

The Good and the Bad Concentration: *Regedorias* in Angola (*Bernardo Pinto da Cruz* and *Diogo Ramada Curto*)

Rural divisions and population arrangements in colonial settings are today as prone to confusion and subjective representations as they once were. In this paper, we focus on the Angolan late colonial experience of villagization and population resettlement and ask if there is a clear distinction between proto-urban settings in rural areas and colonial penal camps. We argue that the history of colonial prisons and (model) villages must consider the strategies of distinction put at work by local and metropolitan authorities. Among these distinctions, the architectural and aesthetical features of village projects became part of a conflict, opposing at once colonial civil administrators and metropolitan actors, on one side, and military officers, on the other. Together, the administrative and the military rationales for top-down social engineering projects make up the core of an important, yet overlooked debate on what constituted the good and the bad types of African concentration.

The Colonial State and its Non-citizens: "Native Courts" and Judicial Duality in Angola (*Maria da Conceição Neto*)

The administration of justice played a decisive role in the way colonial subjects perceived "the state". Actions of foreign rulers and their local auxiliaries were more important to characterize that state power than any political discourses, colonial doctrines or legal subtleties. Between 1926 and 1961, the overwhelming majority of the Angolan population lived under a "Native Statute" (*Estatuto dos Indígenas*) which put them apart from the Portuguese system of justice and created the *Tribunais Privativos dos Indígenas* (literally "Natives' Private Courts"). Failure to fully establish this parallel judicial system based on codification of customary law ended in the pragmatic use of Portuguese *Administradores* as all-powerful judges applying a mixture of written and non-written laws and rules. Detailed evidence from Angolan archives shows how the system was used mainly to get unpaid and/or forced labour to state activities and colonial enterprises, and to assure white supremacy in a racially divided society.

The Colonial Budgets, a Sophisticated Portuguese Late Imperialism Propaganda Device (*Luís Filipe Madeira*)

This article aims to demonstrate that the balanced budgets registered annually in the public accounts of each and every African colony under Portuguese was essentially an elaborate accounting ploy that did not in the least reflect the effective financial flows within empire. During the last decades of the Portuguese rule under the *Estado Novo* or New State, it enabled the government of the overseas territories to boast one of its allegedly most remarkable achievements as far as colonial administration was concerned. To demonstrate actual accounting mechanisms and financial flows, the revenues and expenditures registered in each colony's annual accounts are reorganised here according to alternative criteria for public budgeting, less permeable to the manipulation of accounts. Subsequently, the reformulation of public accounts is then corrected for revenues and expenditures which despite being essential for to the governance of each African colony, were not registered in the respective official accounts.

Decolonisation, Improvised: A Social History of the Transfer of Power in Cabo Verde, 1974–1976 (*Alexander Keese*)

During the turbulent events in the Portuguese empire leading up to the decolonisation period after 25 April 1974—and beyond—the Cape Verdean evolution has been treated as a straightforward story. A neat takeover by a Cape-Verdean-led rebel movement from Guinea-Bissau; an early boost of social projects shortly before and during independence, earning the movement maximum support in the archipelago, and a period of promising socio-economic developments continuing until, probably, the rupture between Praia and Bissau after the 1980 coup d'état on Guinean soil; all those seem to be the ingredients of an initially "successful" decolonisation. A social history of the takeover and turnover has never been attempted. This article attempts to shed light on the complexities of the transfer of power, especially in terms of the experiences of Cape Verdean (urban and rural) populations.

Portuguese-speaking Goan Women Writers in Late Colonial India (1860-1940) (Filipa Lowndes Vicente)

This article proposes a path for the analysis of Goan women's written production within the late colonial context in Portuguese India. There are multiple questions to be made in the intersection of gender and a modern print culture, which grew enormously at a global level in the nineteenth and twentieth century. Both phenomena are intertwined—women started writing and publishing globally in a significant way when printed reproductive words became a much more easy, cheaper, and democratic. To understand Goan women's participation in the culture necessarily implies wider insights into women's access to knowledge within a public sphere. The many cases of Goan women where mobility, migration and circulation are an intrinsic and determinant aspect of their authorial voices as well as an added possibility of intellectual emancipation encourages us to pursue histories that go beyond clear geographical borders.

War Narratives Then and Now: Ex-Combatants' Memories of Angola (*Maria José Lobo Antunes*)

This essay aims to explore the way Angola and its people are remembered by ex-combatants who served in the Portuguese colonial war. Far from being a simple reproduction of past events, memory reconstructs what has ceased to exist. This paper proposes to examine the ambiguities that emerge from these ex-combatant's narratives. Trapped between two times (the past and its contemporary evocation), we will argue that these memories reflect the contradictions that stem from distinct historical moments, as well as to their respective processions of ideas, values and national rhetorics.

INTRODUCTION

5

Historical Trajectories of the Third Portuguese Empire: Re-examining the Dynamics of Imperial Rule and Colonial Societies (1900-1975)

Cláudia Castelo Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade de Lisboa

Philip J. Havik Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical (IHMT), Universidade Nova, Lisbon

> Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra

N HIS STUDY OF THE (BRITISH) IMPERIAL ARCHIVE, Richards concluded that the idea of actual domination of vast territories beyond Europe by Britain in the late nineteenth century largely amounted to a "fictive thought of imperial control." The role of information and knowledge in holding together the heterogeneous imperial mosaic was therefore much more relevant than it appeared to be in the imperial imagination. His critique of historians of the British empire, i.e. that they tended to confer a lot more unity on it than was justified, reflects not only upon the British case but also on the historiography of other empires. The question of how rule related to local situations and improvisation thus has a particular relevance for the reading of the paper trail of empire. The growing imperial bureaucracy in the 1800s, described by Richards as the 'paper empire', was faced with a problem in terms of organizing and unifying an increasing amount of information and knowledge that was being collected. The need for registering, classifying and collating data and transforming it into a policy tool represented a formidable challenge. Not surprisingly, it would eventually be transformed by the powers that be into a means of actually ordering a global empire, reducing it to "file cabinet size."1

PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) 25 (1) 2017 BIBLID 25 (1) (2017) 3-13 IISSN 1057-1515 print – \$ see back matter ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr



^IThomas Richards, *The Imperial Archive: Knowledge and the Fantasy of Empire* (London: Verso, 1993), I, 3-4.

^{© 2017} Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

In her work on the archival grain, Stoler turns her attention to the imperial archive as the "operational field"-and center-of "projected total knowledge", as Richards called it.² Seeing the gathering and ordering of knowledge as a processual dynamic and regarding the archive as an "epistemological experiment," she proposes its use as a tool for "fieldwork". This familiar reference to the anthropological method and privileged site of research serves as a reminder of the multifaceted nature of researching the content of the imperial archive and putting it into historical context. Above all, it is important to note here that imperial archives are also colonial: the documents were not only produced by metropolitan vogons, but also compiled by officialdom in the colonies themselves. This hybrid transcontinental and polyvalent body of data thus contains sources that upon closer scrutiny permit an evaluation of stated policy intentions and their implementation on the ground as a dynamic process. Given the hierarchical and compartmentalized nature of the institutions involved, the political and spatial contexts in which documentation was produced and circulated tend to vary considerably. Thus, characterizing the archive as a "repository of meanings" implies a deconstruction of explicit and tacit narratives whose significance and understanding is subject to change over time and context.³ As empire perfected the methods and means by which it collected, circulated and analyzed information, it strove to standardize the guidelines and procedures that regulated the process.

However, this exercise was by no means straightforward owing to the imperial archives' inherent asymmetry. Whereas much has been published over the last three decades on imperial archives, their colonial satellites above all those located in former colonies, have not received similar treatment. Indeed, as Mahila states, "the content and use of colonial archives in Africa do not feature prominently in the literature of archival science."⁴ In view of the social, economic, political and racial criteria that informed the

²Ann Laura Stoler, "Colonial Archives and the Arts of Governance." *Archival Science* 2 (2002): I-2, 87-I09; and Ann Laura Stoler, *Along the Archival Grain. Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009).

³Erik Ketelaar, "Tacit Narratives: The Meanings of Archives," *Archival Science* 1 (2001): 131–141.

⁴Ellen Ndeshi Namhila, "Content and Use of Colonial Archives: An Underresearched Issue," *Archival Science* 16 (2) (2016): III–I23 (III).

collection of data relating to colonizers and colonized, using a colonial archive as a "repository of meanings" demands a careful scrutiny of location, subject, content, and context.

In the case of historiography of the (Third) Portuguese Empire, which has been the subject of intense debate over the last decades⁵, the archival collections that became available over the last forty-five years both in Portugal, in Africa⁶ and in Asia, have enabled researchers to gradually penetrate the empire's organization and dynamics.⁷ The assembling, classification and availability of documentation to the wider public and research community has been gradual and asymmetrical largely depending on the archives' location, conservation, funding and means of dissemination. Since 2010 digital tools for on-line access to inventories of the records of the *Ministério do Ultramar* (1951-1974) constitute an invaluable data base for the research community.

⁶Philip J. Havik, *Lusophone Africa in the Archives: Institutions and Collections;* https://net-works.h-net.org/system/files/contributed-files/archiveslusophoneafrica2016.pdf

⁷Although the Third Portuguese Empire was centred on Africa, three remnants of Portugal's First Empire in Asia, i.e. Goa, Macau and Timor formed part its global possessions well into the twentieth century.

⁵Richard J. Hammond, Portugal and Africa, 1815–1910: A Study in Uneconomic Imperialism (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1966); Valentim Alexandre, Origens do colonialismo português moderno (Lisbon: Sá da Costa, 1979); Malyn Newitt, Portugal in Africa: The Last Hundred Years (London: Longman, 1981); William Gervase Clarence-Smith, The Third Portuguese Empire (1825-1975): A Study in Uneconomic Imperialism (Manchester: Manchester UniversityPress, 1983); Cláudia Castelo, "O modo português de estar no mundo": o Luso-tropicalismo e a ideologia colonial portuguesa (1933–1961) (Oporto: Edições Afrontamento, 1998); Valentim Alexandre, Velho Brasil, Novas Áfricas: Portugal e o Império (1808-1975) (Oporto: Afrontamento, 2000); Omar Ribeiro Thomaz, Ecos do Atlântico Sul (Rio de Janeiro: UFRJ/Faperj, 2002); Manuela Ribeiro Sanches, ed., Portugal não é um país pequeno: contar o império na póscolonialidade (Lisbon: Cotovia, 2006); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, ed., O Império colonial em questão (Lisboa: Edições 70, Colecção História & Sociedade, 2012); Nuno Domingos and Elsa Peralta, eds., Cidades e Império: dinâmicas coloniais e reconfigurações pós-coloniais (Lisbon: Edições 70, 2013); Patrícia Ferraz de Matos, The Colours of the Empire: Racialised Representations during Portuguese Colonialism (New York: Berghahn, 2013); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, eds., Portugal e o fim do colonialismo: dimensões internacionais (Lisboa: Edicões 70, 2014); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, "A Modernizing Empire: Politics, Culture and Economy in Portuguese Late Colonialism," in M. Bandeira Jerónimo and A. Costa Pinto, eds., The Ends of European Colonial Empires: Cases and Comparisons (Basingstoke: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2015), 51-80; Philip J. Havik, Alexander Keese e Maciel Santos, Administration and Taxation in Former Portuguese Africa 1900-1945 (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015); Diogo Ramada Curto, Bernardo Pinto da Cruz and Teresa Furtado, Políticas coloniais em tempo de revoltas - Angola circa 1961 (Porto: Afrontamento, 2016).

6

Unfortunately, most of the documentation produced by the *Ministério das Colónias/Ministério do Ultramar* is not included in that database since the Arquivo Histórico Ultramarino was not a part of that inventory program.⁸ The dispersal of these archives following the Carnation Revolution in 1974 had made them largely inaccessible for decades, impeding an assessment of the records as an organic whole, and thereby incurring a loss of oversight and obscuring understanding of context of a highly complex bureaucracy.

However, these collections have so far, unlike other imperial archives, only been the subject of limited epistemological debate, but for a few notable exceptions. As a result it is difficult to promote an epistemological debate about the Portuguese imperial archive without an inventory of the documental universe.9 The fact that the governance of the Portuguese Third Empire would involve three different political regimes, i.e. the Monarchy (until 1910), the First Republic (until 1926) and the New State suggests successive political and ideological transitions had an impact on colonial policies and practices and the ordering of memory. While the central metropolitan archives that once pertained to the Colonial Ministry created in 1910¹⁰ enable broad oversight of colonial affairs, the collections in the former colonies are "crucially important" for containing "detailed reports and information at grass roots level about local conditions and the daily lives of Africans themselves, which were no passed on to Lisbon." II Owing to the fact that "record-keeping was often 'thin', erratic, and episodic while the colonial production of knowledge was marked by fluidity and complexity,"

⁸For more information, check the following link: http://arquivos.ministerioultramar.ho-los.pt/source/presentation/pag.php?pag=0

⁹Jill R. Dias, "Portuguese Archives in the History of Africa," in *Proceedings of the 5th National Congress of Librarians, Achivists and Documentalists: Multiculturalism.* Papers (Lisbon: Associação Portuguesa de Bibliotecários, Arquivisticas e Documentalistas/BAD, 1994), II: 21-33; Jill R. Dias and Rosa Cruz e Silva, eds., *Construindo o passado angolano: as fontes e a sua interpretação* (Lisbon: Comissão para as Comemorações dos Descobrimentos Portugueses, 2000); Patrice Ladwig, Ricardo Roque, Oliver Tappe, Christoph Kohl and Cristiana Bastos, *Fieldwork between Folders: Fragments, Traces, and the Ruins of Colonial Archives* (Halle: Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology, 2012; WorkingPapers, nº. 141).

¹⁰Pedro Tavares de Almeida and Paulo Silveira e Sousa, "Ruling the Empire: The Portuguese Colonial Office (1820s-1926), *Revista da História das Ideias* 27 (2006): 137-169.

^{II}Dias, "Portuguese Archives in the History of Africa," 30.

archival 'fieldwork' is often confronted with fragmentation, discontinuities, omissions and silences.¹²

During the 1960s and 1970s, armed conflict between Portuguese authorities and liberation movements endangered the preservation of collective memory in Angola, Guinea Bissau and Mozambique. Both the latter and Angola were to experience civil wars that lasted until 1992 and 2002 respectively. During the armed conflict in Guinea Bissau in 1998-99, the country's historical archives in the capital were partly destroyed; efforts have since been made to preserve and restore the surviving collections. Despite these circumstances, recent research demonstrates that important archival material produced by the local level of colonial administration survived the civil wars (see some of the contributions in the present volume).¹³ However, memory is also kept in company or personal archives which while being crucial for biographical purposes, are not always readily traceable or accessible to the researcher. In recent years, former colonial officials and leaders of liberation movements have though increasingly sought to publish their memoirs, as the last generations that experienced the colonial era are progressively ageing and disappearing.

Besides colonial state archives, in the Portuguese case company archives constitute key sites for insightful fieldwork on the operation of private enterprises in colonial spaces. Above all, the issue of African labour, which has been a prominent focus of reports and studies since the early 1900s, has benefited from these collections in the case of Angola, Mozambique and São Tomé e Príncipe. In recent years, a series of publications have documented the intricacies of organization, methods, strategies and resistance regarding African labour recruitment drives and working conditions in cotton, diamond and coffee production in these territories. In this respect, the relevance of the archives of international organizations has also been demonstrated.¹⁴ Missionary archives have equally provided valuable sources for

¹²Ladwig et al., Fieldwork between Folders, 3.

¹³Ladwig *et al., Fieldwork between Folders*, 15-20. The Fundação Mário Soares (FMS) has coordinated efforts since the Bissau war to recover surviving collections of the country's national archives. The Fórum dos Arquivos de Língua Portuguesa (FALP) has with the support of the Portuguese National Archives and Portuguese Development Cooperation, as well as UNESCO, provided assistance to archives in Lusophone countries in Africa and Asia (East Timor).

enquiries into imperial and colonial dynamics.¹⁵ Personal collections from the colonial period have also become the subject of interest in recent years, above all with regard to photographic archives and family albums. While academic incursions into this field has been rare, the publication of an innovative multi-disciplinary study which provides a both broad and detailed inventory and analysis of collections of images on the Portuguese empire in personal as well as public archives has filled an important knowledge gap.¹⁶

Four aspects should be emphasized here in terms of the content and context of Portuguese imperial archives, their relevance for an understanding of colonial situations and comparisons with the paper trails left by other European empires. The continental and insular colonies that formed the mainstay of the country's imperial project until 1974/5, illustrate its dispersal and lack of territorial unity and continuity. None of these colonial spaces maintained common borders, each forming autonomous units maintaining with direct links to Lisbon rather than with each other. Also, the empire's

¹⁴Eric Allina, Slavery by Any Other Name: African Life under Company Rule in Colonial Mozambique (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2012); Catherine Higgs, Chocolate Islands: Cocoa And Slavery in Colonial Africa (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2012); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and José Pedro Monteiro, "Internationalism and the labours of the Portuguese Colonial Empire," Portuguese Studies 29 (2) (2013): 142-163; Jeremy Ball, Angola's Colossal Lie: Forced Labor on a Sugar Plantation, 1913-1977 (Leiden: Brill, 2013); Alexander Keese, "The Constraints of Late Colonial Reform Policy: Forced Labour Scandals in the Portuguese Congo (Angola) and the Limits of Reform under Authoritarian Rule (1955-1961)," Portuguese Studies 28 (2) (2012): 186-200; Alexander Keese, "Forced Labour in the 'Gorgulho Years': Understanding Reform and Repression in Rural São Tomé e Príncipe, 1945-1953," Itinerario 38 (1) (2014): 103-124; Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, The 'Civilising Mission' of Portuguese Colonialism, 1870-1930 (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015); Todd Cleveland, Diamonds in the Rough: Corporate Paternalism and African Professionalism in the Mines of Colonial Angola, 1917-1975 (Athens: Ohio University Press/Swallow Press, 2015); Jorge Varanda and Todd Cleveland, "(Un)healthy Relationships: African Labourers, Profits and Health Services in Angola's Colonial-Era Diamond Mines, 1917–75," Medical History 58 (1) (2014): 87-105; José Pedro Monteiro, "A Internacionalização das políticas laborais "indígenas" no império colonial português (1944-1962)," PhD dissertation (ICS-UL, Lisbon, 2017).

¹⁵Eric Morier-Genoud, "The Catholic Church, Religious Orders and the Making of Politics in Colonial Mozambique," PhD Thesis (State University of New York, 2005); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, A diplomacia do Império. Política e religião na partilha de África (1820-1890) (Lisboa: Edições 70, 2012); Didier Péclard, Les incertitudes de la nation en Angola (Paris: Karthala, 2015); Hugo Gonçalves Dores, A Missão da República. Política, religião e o império colonial português em África (1910-1926) (Lisbon: Edições 70, 2015).

¹⁶Filipa Lowndes Vicente, ed., *O império da visão: Fotografia no contexto colonial português* (1860-1990) (Lisbon: Edições 70, 2014).

protracted survival-with the exception of Goa's incorporation into the Indian state in 1961-until after most European colonies had gained independence by the early 1960s singles the Portuguese empire out from its British, French and Belgian counterparts. This asymmetry also related to intraimperial relations: whereas from the early 1960s to the end of empire, Angola, Guinea-Bissau and Mozambique would experience a phase of intense armed conflict in a Cold War setting, Cabo Verde and São Tomé e Príncipe remained largely unaffected by the 'winds of change'. In addition, the dictatorial nature of the regime that ruled the Third Empire for most of its trajectory, the New State or Estado Novo, needs to be taken into account at the level of the production and circulation of information. From 1926 to 1974, censorship was a powerful instrument for filtering information by authorities at all levels, and drown out dissenting voices; thus researchers are obliged to exercise particular caution while screening documents for information, owing to subtle nuances and omissions which determine their meaning in a given context.

The editors of the present special issue have aimed to bring to the fore recent, innovative research on a wide variety of territories and topics that explore the imperial archive and memory to bring to life colonial situations in different locations. From the outset, it was our intention to demonstrate the geographical, social, economic, political and cultural diversity of empire through a broad thematical prism. The most recurrent topics with regard to the Portuguese empire such as (forced) labour, race, ideology, economic underdevelopment and conflict, have been complemented with studies that take a closer look at the state and colonial administration, colonial accounts, private enterprise, science, public health, violence and gender. Their contributions show to what extent archival 'fieldwork' has succeeded in unearthing and deconstructing the ongoing business of empire and colonial rule on the hand, and the role of colonial and indigenous societies on the other in different spaces, periods and contexts. The time frame of these contributions, from the late nineteenth century to the end of empire, and the spatial focus including Cape Verde, Guinea-Bissau, Angola, Mozambique and Goa, provide an example of the current state of the art of archival fieldwork on the 'modern' and 'late' Portuguese colonial empire and its populations. They illustrate the variety and the richness of contemporary research on Portuguese imperial and colonial history, demonstrating a solid critical engagement with its multifaceted archives and memory, and also with published literature in particular cases and contexts.

This special issue is divided in five sections, which illustrate some of the most important avenues of research being developed today.

In the first section, The science of empire: knowledge, transfers, and laboratories, Philip J. Havik, Samuël Coghe and Cláudia Castelo exemplify the need to undertake further investigations into the historical development of public health and scientific knoowledge systems in colonial contexts, identifying key actors and projects, but also the actual consequences of their implementation in diverse historical conjunctures and local conditions. All highlight the intersections and transfers between international, imperial and colonial institutions, and reveal the need for multiscalar approaches. Havik's focus on the rural dimensions of welfare and public health, dealing with organizational and managerial as well as with trans-colonial political and scientific dimensions, analyses different approaches to disease control and population health. The tracing of the evolution of policies, practices and debates in colonial and nationalist circles, provides novel insights into the historical genealogies of contemporary health systems and infrastructures targeted at vulnerable populations. Coghe tackles two under-researched vertical campaigns of mass chemoprophylaxis against sleeping sickness in Portuguese colonial Africa and treats them as windows on the ways in which medical knowledge and practices in loco were an outcome of multiple engagement between intra- and interimperial and international actors and institutions, acting and competing in different spaces. The attempts to "nationalise" such knowledge and practices and their local variations are assessed here against the background of intra-imperial engagement with methods and programmes as well as international competition in the interwar period and after 1945. Castelo stresses the need to understand local contexts in terms of scientific interventions regarding agro-pastoral systems in the arid and semiarid regions of south-western Angola. The specification of "vernacular science" is seen as crucial here, as well as the exploration of its connections with other spaces and instances, i.e. its engagement with international politics and development policies and the existing connections with interimperial dynamics.

In the second section, *The labours of the empire: on scales and comparisons*, José Pedro Monteiro and Teresa Furtado offer novel insights into a number

of empirical, methodological and analytical problems that animate contemporary historiography. Already touched upon in the previous section, the articles further address the importance of promoting a multiscalar approach to the study of colonial phenomena, and mobilise comparative tools for analysis, using it on many levels as a heuristic device. Both authors provide examples of why these two methodological and analytical strategies are fruitful. Monteiro focuses on the politics and policies of "native labour" within the Portuguese empire, exploring the extent to which international and transnational dynamics interacted with metropolitan and colonial processes. Among other important aspects, this contribution critically examines the political and social imagination contained in social policies, and related rationales of "reform", in the post-war years. Furtado compares the private policies of social welfare and control, including "counterrevolutionary" initiatives enacted by DIAMANG and COTONANG in Angola. As in the case of Monteiro's contribution, the problem of colonial "native" (forced) labour and entrepreneurial politics is a crucial element in this promising research project, which also focuses on the policies of population control and intervention in the realm of health services, amongst others.

In the third section, The (re)ordering of the empire: on the development of control, Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and Hugo Gonçalves Dores on the one hand, and Bernardo Pinto da Cruz and Diogo Ramada Curto on the other, address, in different but connected ways, the combined centrality of population control and resettlement and developmental rationales in late colonialism. Jerónimo and Dores address an early manifestation of their articulation, inspired by other historical contexts, rationales and dynamics, by looking at the aldeamentos (villages) and the reduciones (reductions) of the Society of Jesus in Brazil and Paraguay. The "efficiency" of civilization-the "reform of the spirits" and the disciplining of the (working) bodies-was considered an outcome of pre-existing tested, and allegedly successful, models, despite their violent and extractive historical record. Again, the transfer and selective appropriation of imperial frameworks is highlighted here. So is the importance of bringing the ecclesiastical and religious dynamics back into the study of colonialism, promoting the study of their intersections with political and even economic ones. Cruz and Curto focus on another angle with respect to plans of population concentration, associated with novel policies of rural reordering and "detribalization containment", which

were epitomized by the creation and implementation of *regedorias* from 1961 onwards. Highlighting interimperial and regional inspirations and illuminating particular cases, the text argues that late colonialism in Angola was "proto-totalitarian", based on variegated technologies of social control and coercion operating at many levels, and organized around "good" and "bad" concentrations.

In the fourth section, The administration of empire: repertoires, improvisations, and aftermaths, Maria da Conceição Neto, Luís Filipe Madeira and Alexander Keese tackle some of the administrative repertoires, assessing their formulation, intentions and actual consequences. Neto deals with the administration of justice, highlighting the tapestry of normative contexts and institutions in which rule was enacted and legitimized in the context of the indigenato: the colonial judicial system essentially aimed to ensure the legalization of (forced) labour recruitment and the maintenance of racial privileges. Exploring examples from Angola, Neto shows how the failure of colonial administrations to elaborate a legal code based upon customary law resulted in a system in which administrators presiding over "native courts" acted as all-powerful judges, thereby criminalising African societies along racial lines. Madeira addresses a crucial, yet understudied problem: the "creative accounting" of colonial finances, and the ways in which this was used as a political tool and a propagandistic instrument, at home and abroad. The depiction of the financial administration of the colonial empire as a balanced system served many purposes; understanding the mechanisms at play also enable a more rigorous assessment of the late colonial political economy. Keese provides an excellent example of why a social history of decolonization "on the ground" is a fundamental historiographical necessity. Focusing on Cabo Verde, this text raises methodological and analytical questions that could guide research on other colonial case-studies. The "improvised" administration of decolonization, the transition from colonial rule to independence, posed many problems for the new elites, including the need to administer multiple imperial and colonial legacies, that need to be more systematically studied.

Finally, in the fifth section, *The cultures of empire: gender, identity, memory*, Filipa Lowndes Vicente and Maria José Lobo Antunes exemplify the pressing need to further develop the historical scrutiny of questions of gender, identity and memory in colonial contexts, mobilizing a solid empirical basis. Vicente provides look into the rich production of writing by Goan women, originating essentially from local Brahmin Catholic families, in the late colonial context of Portuguese India. By contextualizing their authorial voices and trajectories, she aims to add their voices to (Portuguese) colonial studies in order to provide insights into women's biographical itineraries and kinship networks as well as providing a model for the construction of memory by means of written and oral narratives in other geographical and social spaces within the late Portuguese empire. Antunes tackles another crucial topic, that has benefited from numerous recent contributions, including her own: the memories of war and what they may reveal regarding past and contemporary political situations, in which a particular identitarian rhetoric and a form of imperial nationalism prevailed, and still prevails in many ways. She confronts the inherent contradictions between the ideal-typing of empire in a Lusotropical perspective inherited from colonial times based upon racial harmony and cultural adaptation, and local realities characterised by coercion and violence imposed by 'white' colonial rule on Africans. Antunes demonstrates the longevity of colonial narratives-and the lack of contemporary alternative discourse-in ex-combatants' memories. The last contribution of this special issue uses first-hand testimonies as historical sources, an approach that enables new questions (along and against the grain) to the imperial archive, and enriches the history of the Third Portuguese Empire.

The Health of the Empire: Knowledge, Transfers, and Laboratories

55

From Hospitals to Villages: Population Health, Medical Services and Disease Control in Former Portuguese Africa

Philip J. Havik Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical–NOVA, Lisbon

Introduction

Over the last decades, health management has become a major issue in the debate on the organisation and performance of health systems in Africa. The 1993 Bamako Initiative was an attempt to implement the reforms in primary health care envisaged at the Alma Ata conference in 1978 for the African continent as a whole. These proposals for targeting and involving local communities in the operation of health services which followed the emergence and rapid spread of HIV/AIDS were based upon notions of social medicine and population health which emerged in industrialised countries during the early 1900s. By defining health as "a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being," the Alma Ata meeting built upon the World Health Organisation's stated goals to set major challenges for public health systems, by focusing on the 'delivery gap' between developed and underdeveloped countries and the state's responsibility for the provision of primary care.¹ Taking into account economic, social and socio-cultural differences and inequalities, and the tenets of social welfare, policy makers were essentially revamping existing notions that underpinned the emergence of social medicine in the late 1800s and the social hygienist movement which initially popularised it. Social medicine would be adopted by international organisations such as the League of Nations Health Organisation (LNHO) and the International Health Division of the Rockefeller Foundation (HDRF) by relating the collective responsibility for public health to improvements in citizens' individual well-being.² Embedded in the broader framework of social reform, the movement would have a major impact on

Portuguese Studies Review (PSR) 25 (1) 2017

BIBLID 25 (1) (2017) 17-56 | ISSN 1057-1515 print – \$ see back matter ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage

JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr

and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr



^IDeclaration of Alma-Ata, International Conference on Primary Health Care, Objectives I-V, Alma-Ata, USSR, 6-12 September 1978.

 $[\]ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$ 2017 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

thinking, policy and practice during the interwar period, both in industrialised countries and their respective colonies.

As the historical trajectories of health services in Africa are being mapped in increasing detail, the delivery of health care to local populations has come under increasing scrutiny in a colonial and post-colonial context. Although the microbiological or Pasteurian revolution and the social hygiene movement would evolve simultaneously during the last quarter of the 1800s, they were to have a very distinct impact upon health systems. Whereas the former, which would give rise to tropical medicine, centered attentions on the combat against epidemics and the control of endemic diseases in tropical regions, the latter which would evolve into social medicine rather focused on the industrialised world.³ The demographic impact of WWI and the influenza epidemic was to play a decisive role in the extension of medical care and notions of social welfare to empire during the 1920s.⁴ One of the key challenges facing colonial authorities was the capacity to provide adequate medical services for European settlers in tropical environments as well guaranteeing the supply of an able indigenous workforce. The 'biomedical turn' in empire implied extending services to urban inhabitants and to the large majority living in remote rural areas, which required different approaches to public health and infrastructures depending on the target populations. As strategies focusing on developmental and welfare-led initiatives gained a greater momentum in British and French colonies⁵, international bodies such as the WHO and UNCEF provided guidelines for public health and disease control. In the process, investment in health systems broadened to encompass the combat against endemic diseases, which besides sleeping sick-

18

²Iris Borowy, "International Social Medicine between the Wars: Positioning a Volatile Concept," *Hygiea International*, 6, 2 (2007): 13-35 [34].

³Borowy, "International Social Medicine,"I3-35; Michael Worboys. "Malaria and the Invention of Tropical Medicine: from 'Diseases in the Tropics' to 'Tropical Diseases'," in David Arnold, ed., *Warm Climates and Western Medicine: The Emergence of Tropical Medicine, 1500-1900* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2003), 181-207.

⁴Ulrike Linder, "The Transfer of European Social Policy Concepts to Tropical Africa, 1900–50: The Example of Maternal and Child Welfare," *Journal of Global History* 9 (2014): 208–231.

⁵M. Havinden and D. Meredith, *Colonialism and Development: Britain and Its Tropical Colonies*, 1850-1960 (London: Routledge, 1993); Tony Chafer, *The End of Empire in French West Africa: France's Successful Decolonization* (Oxford: Berg, 2002).

ness and malaria, also targeted tuberculosis, leprosy, filariasis, schistosomiasis, onchocerciasis and yaws. These and other diseases later became known as neglected tropical diseases or NTDs.⁶

Whereas the development of health systems in colonial territories under British, French and Belgian rule has been subject of published research since the 1970s, contributions on Portuguese Africa have so far been limited.⁷ This despite the fact that Portuguese Africa would experience a belated end of empire in 1974/5 and that its colonies were thus exposed to colonial public health policies during a significantly extended period. The present paper addresses the trajectories of public health policies in a Portuguese colonial context with a view to a better understanding of policies and debates on health infrastructures in rural settings between the 1920s and 1960s. Analysing different project proposals and their implementation in Angola, Guinea and Mozambique, it holds that the period in question was crucial for the development of thinking on population health and disease control. Campaigns for the control and eradication of sleeping sickness, a rural disease, would constitute the main theatres for the development of innovative approaches to population health management. It is argued here that different concepts

⁶Peter Hotez, "Neglected Tropical Diseases in Sub-Saharan Africa: Review of Their Prevalence, Distribution, and Disease Burden," *PLOS* 3 (8) (2009): e412.

⁷Samuël Coghe, "Inter-imperial Learning and African Health Care in Portuguese Angola in the Interwar Period," Social History of Medicine 28 (I) (2014): 134-154; Philip I. Havik, "Reconsidering Indigenous Health, Medical Services and Colonial Rule in Portuguese West Africa," in CEAUP, ed., O colonialismo português: novos rumos para a historiografia dos PALOP (Oporto: Humus/Centro de Estudos Africanos, University of Oporto (2013), 233-66; Anna Crozier, Practising Colonial Medicine: The Colonial Medical Service in British East Africa (London: I.B. Tauris, 2007); Alison Bashford, Imperial Hygiene: A Critical History of Colonialism, Nationalism and Public Health (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2004); Walter Bruchausen, "Practising Hygiene and Fighting the Natives' Diseases: Public and Child Health in German East Africa and Tanganyika Territory, 1900-1960," Dynamis 23 (2003): 85-113; Danielle Domergue-Cloarec, La santé en Côte d'Ivoire, 1905-1958 (Paris: Académie des Sciences d'Outre-Mer, 1986); Frederick Shapiro, "Medicine in the Service of Colonialism: Medical Care in Portuguese Africa (1885-1974)," PhD Dissertation (University of California, Los Angeles, 1983); Simone Clapier-Valadon, Les médecins français d'Outre-Mer (Paris: Anthropos, 1982); Petrus G. Janssens, "The Colonial Legacy: Health and Medicine in the Belgian Congo," Trobical Doctor II (1981): 132-140; Judith Lasker, "The Role of Health Services in Colonial Rule: The Case of the Ivory Coast," Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry I (1977): 277-297; M. Kivits, Le fonds de la Reine Elizabeth pour l'assistance médicale dans le Congo (FOREAMI) 1930-1960: pionnier dans la santé rurale en Afrique," Annales de la Societé Belge de Médicine Tropicale, Parasitologie et Mycologie I (4) (1971): 389-407.

of disease control in a rural environment were integrated into a 'model' for health management in Portuguese Guinea after 1945. Largely evolving in an empirical fashion, it would erect facilities for the combat of a single disease into a broad network of fixed and mobile units for the screening and treatment of a range of diseases that encompassed the populations as a whole. However, the said model was eventually challenged by services set up by the nationalist movement PAIGC in liberated areas during the 1960s which focused on social medicine and created new health facilities infrastructures adapted to the terrain. Based upon published and archival documents, the analysis focuses on policies and debates regarding the organisation of services, the design and implementation of health infrastructures and their implications in terms of population health.

Rural dimensions of welfare and public health

As some authors have convincingly demonstrated, the First World War projected an important shift in views on the relevance of social welfare and medicine.⁸ The issue rapidly gained international dimensions as trans-national organisations such as the League of Nations Health Organisation (LNHO) began to advocate the introduction social medicine.⁹ The latter had emerged in before WWI in European countries in the early 1900s, under the epithet of social hygiene, gaining ground in the 1920s.¹⁰ Closely associated with the issues of sanitation, nutrition and endemic diseases, attentions increasingly focused on rural populations. Both the LNHO and the Health Department of the Rockefeller Foundation sponsored projects for rural health units in Asia and Latin America.¹¹ The Bandung conference in 1937 would serve to put rural hygiene as a public health issue on the international agenda, above all in an Asian context, following similar initiatives in Europe

⁸Iris Borowy, "Shifting between Biomedical and Social Medicine: International Health Organizations in the 20th Century," *History Compass* 12 (6) (2014): 517–530; Borowy, "International Social Medicine," 13-35; Dorothy Porter and R. Porter, "What was Social Medicine? A Historiographical Essay," *Journal of Historical Sociology* 1 (1) (1988): 90–106.

⁹Iris Borowy, Coming to Terms with World Health: The League of Nations Health Organization 1921-1946 (Frankfurt: Peter Lang; 2009).

¹⁰Dorothy Porter, ed., *Social Medicine and Medical Sociology in the Twentieth Century* (Amsterdam: Rodopi 1997).

^{II}Randall Packard, *A History of Global Health: Interventions in the Lives of Other Peoples* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2016): 66-79.

(Budapest, 1930 and Geneva, 1931) and Africa in Cape Town (1932) and Johannesburg (1935), the first such initiatives held in Africa.¹² Portuguese representatives were present at the latter meeting, the first dominated by British delegates while the second also included leading officials from French, Belgian and Portuguese colonies. The debates resulted in recommendations for the implementation of rural services, the role of local communities and the recruitment of African staff, while advocating collaborations and exchanges between health personnel pertaining to different colonies. Motivated by markedly economic considerations, these proposals prioritised the need for a healthy African workforce and the incorporation of locally trained nurses, lab technicians and midwives.¹³

Three simultaneous developments took place in the interwar period which would have an impact upon public health in rural areas in colonial Africa. First, the emergence of policies centering on the social conditions of vulnerable populations in the 1920s and the advocacy of a welfare oriented approach which emerged in industrialized countries triggered debates on their applicability in empire.¹⁴ Second, as colonial administrations expanded to occupy the remote corners of empire, health services followed in their wake, bringing health professionals in contact with isolated and highly dispersed populations. Third, a rethinking of approaches occurred to disease control in the tropics as policies evolved from cordons sanitaires and internment camps for 'infected persons' to mass vertical campaigns as attempts were made to eradicate sleeping sickness. Although the 1929 world crisis would delay policy implementation, authorities did nevertheless experiment with novel forms of service delivery and infrastructures to extend care to indigenous populations. In the 1930s and 1940s, new vaccines and chemotherapies were introduced, as maternity and child care and the screening for endemic diseases was included in public health programs. Proposals for the extension of colonial medical services to rural areas generally hinged on three different concepts in terms of infrastructures, building hospitals in district capitals on the one hand, and sanitary posts and (village) dispensaries in

¹²Socrates Litsios, "Bandoeng Revisited," *Social Medicine* 8 (3) (2014): 113.28; Borowy, *Coming to Terms*, 226-8; Packard, *A History*, 84-8.

¹³Borowy, Coming to Terms, 23I-4.

¹⁴George C. Abbott, "A Re-Examination of the 1929 Colonial Development Act," *Economic History Review* 24 (1) (1971): 68-81 [70].

rural areas. During the 1920s the concept of rudimentary 'bush' infirmaries emerged, which combined the principal functions of primary and secondary health care, with in- and out-patient facilities with a preventive and curative capacity, facilities for minor surgery, a pharmacy and social care.

The debates surrounding service delivery would constitute a 'turning point' in colonial territories as "the focus of medical care shifted demographically (from providing healthcare only for European officials to the entire population), geographically (from focusing principally on urban areas to opening up rural ones) and in its medical focus (from curative medicine to public health)."¹⁵ Whereas clinical and outpatient services had been gradually put in place with the building of hospitals in urban areas, they were now increasingly directed towards African populations by means of rural infirmaries and mobile teams. Rural dispensaries, which would multiply after 1945 for the treatment of tuberculosis, largely relied on locally trained nursing staff—overseen by medical doctors—for which training facilities were created focusing above all on nursing and midwifery. Lab technicians and locally trained laboratory technicians were also increasingly integrated into hospital services and vertical control programs.

As programs for disease control multiplied in the interwar period, e.g. against sleeping sickness under the auspices of the LNHO, they built upon previous experiences in Central Africa during the early 1900s.¹⁶ The recommendations of experts underlined the need for putting in place control mechanisms over the movements of African populations by means of demographic and medical censuses, medical passports, and the resettlement of affected populations to more salubrious locations.¹⁷ Colonial planning stressed the need for residential segregation of populations along racial lines based on the notion of population control and 'disease reservoirs' that allegedly threatened settler communities.¹⁸ Thus, African residents were to be regrouped in townships or native wards in urban peripheries, and rural inhab-

¹⁵Anna Crozier, "The Colonial Medical Officer and Colonial Identity: Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania before World War Two," PhD Dissertation (University College, London: 2005), 167.

¹⁶Daniel Headrick, "Sleeping Sickness Epidemics and Colonial Responses in East and Central Africa, 1900–1940," *PLOS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 8 (4) (2014), e2772.

¹⁷F.K. Kleine, L. Van Hoof and H. Lyndhurst Duke, "General Recommendations for the Control of Sleeping Sickness in African Dependencies," in *Final Report of the League of nations International Commission on Human Trypanosomiasis* (Geneva: LNHO, 1928): 391-2.
itants moved to more salubrious areas or to 'model villages'.¹⁹ As programs for medical care and disease control expanded after 1945, public health policies reworked the notion of population health and sanitation into new, comprehensive forms of demographic, economic and health related initiatives in the context of the civilizing mission.²⁰ These ideas gradually evolved through international debates towards a broader notion of integrated service provision which extended to housing, health, sanitation, farming and schooling.²¹ Such projects were eventually implemented in different colonial contexts from the 1940s onwards, including Angola, Guinea and Mozambique, where they were later restyled in a more militarized form during the colonial wars (1961-1974).²²

The transnational dimensions of debates on service management and delivery would have a direct impact on the Portuguese colonial context during the first West African Conference on Tropical Medicine held in Luanda, Angola, in 1923. A series of contributions by British, French, Belgian and Portuguese experts discussed the form such services could take in terms of medical extension to remote rural communities. Some contributions raised the need to bring them into the orbit of modern biomedicine while weening them away from the 'nefarious' influence of indigenous healers.²³ Viewed as a tool for persuasion and propaganda, an idealized, imaginary African com-

¹⁸Liora Bigon, "Bubonic Plague, Colonial Ideologies, and Urban Planning Policies: Dakar, Lagos, and Kumasi," *Planning Perspectives* 31 (2) (2016): 205-226.

¹⁹Philip D. Curtin. "Medical Knowledge and Urban Planning in Colonial Africa," in Steven Feierman and John M. Janzen, eds., *The Social Basis of Health and Healing in Africa* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), 235-55; Samuël Coghe, "Reordering Colonial Society: Model Villages and Social Planning in Rural Angola, 1920-45," *Journal of Contemporary History* 52 (I) (2017): 16-44.

²⁰Bárbara Direito, "Políticas coloniais de terras em Moçambique: o caso de Manica e Sofala sob a companhia de Moçambique, 1892-1942," PhD Dissertation (Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas, Universidade Nova de Lisboa (FCSH-UNL), Lisbon, 2013), 54-5.

²¹Helen Tilley, *Africa as a Living Laboratory: Empire, Development, and the Problem of Scientific Knowledge, 1870-1950* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013), 172.

²²Direito, "Políticas coloniais de terras," 303-4; Cláudia Castelo, "'Novos Brasis' em África desenvolvimento e colonialismo português tardio," *Varia História* 30 (53) (2014): 507-532.

²³Alberto G. Germano da Silva Correia, "Os processos práticos de hospitalização dos indígenas e a sua assistência médica em Angola," *Revista Médica de Angola* 2 (5) (1923): 179-200.

pound or village was taken as a starting point. Among the participants of the meeting, health officers based in Angola and Mozambique presented 'blueprints' of low-cost facilities adapted to rural conditions and indigenous patients. The model of the '*enfermaria-sanzala*' (village infirmary) or '*enfermaria regional*' (regional infirmary) emerged, which was to be built in accordance with a 'modernised' version of indigenous architectural concepts. Rejecting European designs and borrowing from African traditions while adapting them to suit modern hygienic conditions, would be impermeable, well-ventilated and lit, fitted with rudimentary hospital equipment and a skeleton staff.²⁴ Thus, 'bush-' or village infirmaries run by nursing staff but regularly visited by MDs appear to herald a novel approach to rural care. Not only did they combine fixed and mobile services, but also took on local characteristics in terms of architecture and building materials.

These infirmaries adopted the archetypal African round thatched 'hut' although raised on a cement floor and fitted with windows—resistant to adverse weather conditions.²⁵ Each infirmary—directed by a medical doctor assisted by trained (local) nurses—was to be organised in geometrically aligned rows of huts at a short distance of each other, divided into two sexsegregated sections by a central mall. A separate area was reserved for isolating patients with (highly) contagious diseases. Support services were to be housed in separate rectangular units, including a morgue and incinerator, while residences were provided for medical and nursing staff, including indigenous nurses and midwives. These infirmaries would form part of a network of regional health facilities which encompassed sanitary posts whose design was similarly based on the 'native' hut, and staffed by trained indigenous nurses and auxiliaries.

With time, these projects which had gained increasing support among health services and policy makers, were put into practice in Angola, Guinea and Mozambique. However, some factors were condition their introduction in empire, such as the 1929 world crisis and the establishment of the authoritarian New State regime which reduced colonial autonomy and imposed

²⁴Silva Correia, "Os processos práticos," 188/9.

²⁵F. Ferreira dos Santos, "Assistência médica aos indígenas e processos práticos da sua hospitalização," *Revista Médica de Angola* II (5) (1923): 51-71; Cristiana Bastos, "O género de construções cafreais': o hospital-palhota como projecto colonial," *Etnográfica* 18 (1) (2014): 185-208 [199-202].

balanced budgets.²⁶ Meanwhile, international criticism of Portuguese colonial policies from the mid-1920s owing to widespread forced labour practices²⁷ had prompted authorities to embark on propaganda efforts which included welfare oriented projects for indigenous populations. Demographic concerns also played a crucial role, as metropolitan and colonial circles debated the need for reducing high (child and adult) mortality rates.²⁸ Also, venereal diseases were making inroads in urban and rural areas, which heightened the need for medical services to penetrate the interior. But to be successful, services needed to adapt to the terrain and convince African populations of the benefits of biomedicine. One of the principal justifications for 'acculturating' the architecture of its facilities was the activity of local 'traditional' healers, who were the first port of call for most native patients seeking assistance. Thus, a mixture of public health, tropical and social medicine, sanitation and awareness campaigns were viewed as key tools for 'winning over' rural populations to the benefits of biomedicine.

Refocusing medical assistance: population health

The problems faced by colonial authorities in the implementation of public health programs show that some factors such as funding, training and the transfer of technology created constraints for the adequate provision of care to the majority of populations living in large but often thinly populated rural areas. Another issue was that of the organization of health services and their capacity to effectively treat, eradicate and control endemic diseases. While the overall health legislation and policy design largely emanated from metropolitan institutions, their application and development was essentially in the hands of colonial governments. Colonial legislation which had intro-

²⁶Philip J. Havik, "Colonial Administration, Public Accounts and Fiscal Extraction: Policies and Revenues in Portuguese Africa (1900-1960)," *African Economic History* 41 (2013): 159-221.

²⁷Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and José Pedro Monteiro, "Internationalism and the *labours* of the Portuguese Colonial Empire," *Portuguese Studies* 29 (2) (2013): 142-163.

²⁸Samuël Coghe, "Medical Demography in Interwar Angola: Measuring and Negotiating Health, Reproduction and Difference," in Alexandra Widmer and Veronika Lipphardt, eds., *Health and Difference: Rendering Human Variation in Colonial Engagements* (New York/Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2016), 178-204; Philip J. Havik, "Public Health and the Civilizing Mission: Medical Services, Motherhood and Sexually Transmitted Diseases in Former Portuguese West Africa (1920-1960)," *Medical History* (forthcoming, 2017).

duced racial distinctions between *civilizados* (citizens) and *indígenas* (natives) in Angola, Guinea and Mozambique from the early 1900s, would, under the New State (1926-1974), extend these notions to all aspects of daily life. Inspired by physical French *antropologues*, Portuguese anthropologists trained in medical faculties such as the 'Oporto School', would reproduce this racialist discourse to characterize indigenous communities.²⁹ The purported process of 'racial degeneration' affecting indigenous populations was typically ascribed to poor living conditions, unemployment and endemic disease (tuberculosis, leprosy, venereal diseases, alcoholism and mental disorders).

Although this strongly racial and class based perspective was applied to Portugal's colonies, the state did however assume a role in terms of service provision, based upon economic considerations. In order to maintain an able-bodied African workforce, health services were expected to combat and eradicate endemic diseases while applying techniques such as the Pignet index, a measure of (male) robustness, in military and civil recruitment drives.³⁰ In epidemiological terms, sleeping sickness stood high on the colonial-medical agenda as a threat to the indigenous labour force and the rural population at large.³¹ Thus, initiatives towards introducing a 'native' medical service bear the hallmarks of hygienists and tropical medical experts who spearheaded the neutralization of "indigenous disease reservoirs".³²

The design of services for African populations illustrated the confluence of budgetary constraints and the limitations imposed by racially segregated services. Mostly they took the form of outpatient facilities, rudimentary sanitary posts or *ambulâncias* and dispensaries, which were introduced in the 1920s and 1930s in Portuguese colonies. The different state funds targeting

²⁹Patrícia Ferraz de Matos, "Mendes Correia e a Escola de Antropologia do Porto: contribuição para o estudo das relações entre antropologia, nacionalismo e colonialismo," PhD Dissertation (Lisbon: ICS-UL, 2012).

³⁰Rui M. Pereira, "Raça, sangue e robustez: os paradigmas da antropologia física colonial portuguesa," *Cadernos de Estudos Africanos 7/*8 (2005): 211-41.

³¹Isabel Amaral, "A Doença do Sono/Tripanossomíase: o elemento catalisador do progresso da medicina tropical portuguesa (1901-1966)," in A. Mota and A.G. Marinho, eds., *As enfermidades e as suas metáforas: epidemias, vacinação e produção de conhecimento* (São Paulo: USP, 2015), 13-30.

³²Coghe, "Medical Geography," 181; Philip J. Havik, "Public Health and Tropical Modernity: The Combat against Sleeping Sickness in Portuguese Guinea (1945-1974)," *Manguinbos: bistória, ciências, saúde* 21 (2) (2014): 641-666.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

Sleeping Sickness Control and the Transnational Politics of Mass Chemoprophylaxis in Portuguese Colonial Africa¹

Samuël Coghe University of Giessen

Introduction

Trypanocidal drugs played a key role in the fight against sleeping sickness or Human African Trypanosomiasis (HAT) in the twentieth century. This deadly disease was already observed and described by European doctors in parts of Western Africa, including Portuguese-ruled northern Angola and the island of Príncipe, in the 1860s and 1870s, sporadically even earlier, but it was only around the turn of the century, when the disease had gained terrifying epidemic proportions in West-Central Africa and in the Great Lakes region in East Africa (particularly Uganda and Tanganyika), that it drew broader European attention.² In a true "scientific scramble for sleeping sickness", all colonial powers now organised research missions to investigate the cause of the disease, map its incidence and determine effective measures against it.³ When in 1903/4 Castellani and Bruce identified trypanosomes (*gambiense*, later also *rhodesiense*) as the causative agent of the disease and

³Overviews can be found in Kirk Arden Hoppe, *Lords of the Fly: Sleeping Sickness Control in British East Africa, 1900-1960* (Westport, Conn.: Praeger, 2003), 11-15, 28 (quote) and Helen Tilley, *Africa as a Living Laboratory: Empire, Development, and the Problem of Scientific Knowledge, 1870-1950* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 2011), 174-6.



^I The author would like to thank Myriam Mertens as well as Philip Havik and Cláudia Castelo, for their insightful comments.

²For early accounts, see Maryinez Lyons, *The Colonial Disease: A Social History of Sleeping Sickness in Northern Zaire, 1900-1940* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 64-6; Jean-Paul Bado, *Médecine coloniale et grandes endémies en Afrique 1900-1960: Lèpre, trypanoso-miase humaine et onchocercose* (Paris: Karthala, 1996), 38-9. For sleeping sickness in Angola and Príncipe in the last decades of the nineteenth century, see Jill Rosemary Dias, "Famine and Disease in the History of Angola, c. 1830-1930," *The Journal of African History 22* (3) (1981): 371-3; Samuël Coghe, "Population Politics in the Tropics: Demography, Health and Colonial Rule in Portuguese Angola, 1890s-1940s," PhD Thesis (European University Institute, Florence, 2014), 47-64.

tsetse flies or *glossinae* as their main vector, sleeping sickness therapy, which had thus far proved ineffective, changed dramatically. Doctors and pharmaceutical researchers in Europe now started to develop drugs that targeted these particular parasites in the human body.⁴

Over the decades, researchers like Paul Ehrlich in Frankfurt, Wolferstan Thomas, Anton Breinl and Warrington York at the Liverpool School of Medicine or the Swiss microbiologist Ernst Friedheim would develop a whole series of trypanocidal drugs. These would then be tested in the field by selected colonial doctors and/or institutions with whom they maintained privileged and often transnational ties. In mostly ruthless and involuntary experiments on almost invariably African patients, colonial doctors tried to determine the effectiveness and side effects, the best dosage and application methods of these new drugs.⁵ Yet the quest for successful chemotherapy, let alone for the therapia magna sterilisans (Ehrlich) that would cure with a single dose or 'magic bullet', turned out to be very difficult (and still continues today), since virtually all drugs proved to be either ineffective or to have harmful side effects.⁶ Especially in its second stage, when the trypanosomes have entered the patients' central nervous system and begun to cause the disease's most typical and obvious symptoms such as confusion, poor coordination and a disturbed sleep cycle, the disease was (and is) hard to cure. Nevertheless, during and after the colonial era, some of the drugs would be-

⁴On the search for the aetiology of sleeping sickness, including some important Portuguese contributions, see Isabel Amaral, "Bacteria or Parasite? The Controversy over the Etiology of Sleeping Sickness and the Portuguese Participation, 1898-1904," *Manguinbos. História Ciências Saúde* 19 (4) (2012): 1275-1300, and Coghe, "Population Politics," 65-86.

⁵See, for instance, Deborah Neill, "Paul Ehrlich's Colonial Connections: Scientific Networks and Sleeping Sickness Drug Therapy Research, 1900-1914," *Social History of Medicine* 22 (1) (2009): 61-77; Wolfgang U. Eckart, "The Colony as Laboratory: German Sleeping Sickness Campaigns in German East Africa and in Togo, 1900-1914," *History and Philosophy of the Life Sciences* 24 (2002): 69-89; Rita Headrick, *Colonialism, Health and Illness in French Equatorial Africa, 1885-1935* (Atlanta: African Studies Association Press, 1994), 318-34; Myriam Mertens and Guillaume Lachenal, "The History of 'Belgian' Tropical Medicine from a Cross-Border Perspective," *Belgisch Tijdschrift voor Filologie en Geschiedenis* 90 (4) (2013): 1249-72; Guillaume Lachenal, *Le médicament qui devait sauver l'Afrique: Un scandale pharmaceutique aux colonies* (Paris: La Découverte, 2014), 19-73.

⁶Headrick, *Colonialism*, 319; Neill, "Paul Ehrlich"; World Health Organisation, "Human African Trypanosomiasis (Sleeping Sickness)," http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/ fs259/en/

come widely applied such as atoxyl, suramin, tryparsamide, pentamidine and melarsoprol.

Because of these difficulties, medical authorities did not want to rely on drug treatment only to fight sleeping sickness. They also adopted preventive strategies. They designed and implemented measures aimed at eradicating the tsetse fly in certain areas, most notably by destroying its habitat. Another strategy was to reduce infectious man-fly contact by (forcibly) relocating people, often whole villages, from tsetse infested areas or by isolating diagnosed patients in so-called concentration camps located in tsetse free areas, so that they could no longer transmit the disease. These measures, however, provoked much resistance on the part of the African population and closed concentration camps were gradually abandoned in the interwar period.⁷ In addition to these ecological (or entomological) and spatial (or epidemiological) approaches, there was also a third preventive approach. It was based on the observation that trypanocidal drugs like atoxyl or tryparsamide could not only be used for treating and curing sleeping sickness patients, but simultaneously also had a preventive effect. By destroying the trypanosomes in the peripheral blood circulation, they rendered infected people non-infectious.⁸ These three approaches were not mutually exclusive, but the latter was applied especially in Western Africa, where the gambiense form of HAT caused a different epidemiological pattern and where the breeding habits of its main vector, the *glossina palpalis*, rendered ecological measures more difficult.9

The eminent German doctor Robert Koch had already developed this 'treatment as prevention' approach when studying malaria in German New

⁷Lyons, *Colonial Disease*, 110-4, 190-4, 214-9; Hiroyuki Isobe, *Medizin und Kolonialgesell-schaft: Die Bekämpfung der Schlafkrankbeit in den deutschen "Schutzgebieten" vor dem Ersten Weltkrieg* (Münster: LIT, 2009), 71-91, 178-86, 238-64. For the abandonment of closed concentration camps, see Samuël Coghe, "Reordering Colonial Society: Model Villages and Social Planning in Rural Angola, 1920-1945," *Journal of Contemporary History* 52 (I) (2017): 22-23.

⁸For these different approaches, see, for instance, Michael Worboys, "The Comparative History of Sleeping Sickness in East and Central Africa, 1900-1914," *History of Science* 32 (1994): 89-102; Hoppe, *Lords*, 11-15.

⁹Deborah J. Neill, *Networks in Tropical Medicine: Internationalism, Colonialism, and the Rise of a Medical Specialty, 1890-1930* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2012), 103-64, especially 108 and 164.

Guinea and German East Africa around 1900.¹⁰ Koch generally believed that with regard to infectious diseases, the universal treatment of individual disease carriers would have a strong prophylactic effect at population level and ultimately lead to the eradication of these diseases. While for malaria its practical implementation failed, this model would effectively guide anti-sleeping sickness campaigns in large parts of Western Africa. Indeed, when in 1907, Robert Koch, reporting from his drug experiments in East Africa, pointed out the 'preventive effect' of atoxyl to the participants of the First International Conference on Sleeping Sickness in London, this was a crucial argument for the latter to recommend the general use of this arsenical drug, despite its high toxicity and already known severe side effects such as blindness and death.^{II} It thus paved the way for the massive use of atoxyl, and later other trypanocidal drugs as well, in large-scale campaigns of so-called "therapeutic prophylaxis" in German, French, Belgian and Portuguese West African colonies. During such campaigns, medical teams would seek out infected Africans and give them injections with trypanocidal drugs, not only to treat them but also, and often only, to 'sterilize' or 'clear' their blood.¹²

While these three prophylactic approaches have been at the centre of the expanding historiography on sleeping sickness in Africa in the last two and a half decades, this article focuses on a different 'preventive' use of trypanocidal drugs, which has thus far received very little attention. Based on many untapped sources, it analyses two mass campaigns in Portuguese colonial Africa, mainly in Angola, in which the health services used trypanocidal

¹⁰See Guillaume Lachenal, "A Genealogy of Treatment as Prevention (TasP): Prevention, Therapy, and the Tensions of Public Health in African History," in Tamara Giles-Vernick and James L. A. Webb Jr., eds., *Global Health in Africa: Historical Perspectives on Disease Control* (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 2013), 76-80.

^{II}Proceedings of the First International Conference on the Sleeping Sickness, held at London in June 1907 (British Parliamentary Papers, Session 1908, [Cd 3778]), 28-9, 58. See also Neill, "Paul Ehrlich," 70-1.

¹²Ch. Jojot, "Le secteur de la prophylaxie de la maladie du sommeil du Haut-Nyong (Cameroun)," *Annales de Médecine et de Pharmacie Coloniales* 19 (1921): 423-42, especially 431 (quote); Noémi Tousignant, "Trypanosomes, Toxicity and Resistance: The Politics of Mass Therapy in French Colonial Africa," *Social History of Medicine* 25 (3) (2012): 625-43, especially 631; Lachenal, "Genealogy," 80; Headrick, *Colonialism*, 311-84; Myriam Mertens, "Chemical Compounds in the Congo: Pharmaceuticals and the 'Crossed History' of Public Health in Belgian Africa (ca. 1905-1939)," PhD Thesis (University of Ghent, 2014), 74-5, 84-5, 95-7, 197-234.

drugs in a purely preventive manner, that means by administering them to the healthy part of the population in order to protect them against infection. While the first of these chemoprophylactic campaigns, preventive mass atoxylization (1926-1932), was more or less confined to Angola and has gone completely unnoticed by historians, pentamidinization in Angola and Guinea (1948-1970s) was part of an international scheme which involved almost all colonies in Western Africa and which has been recently analysed in a brilliant way by Guillaume Lachenal.¹³

The article examines the rationalities and practicalities of both schemes from a transnational perspective. Thereby, it also searches to explain why the Portuguese resorted to mass chemoprophylaxis both earlier and longer than other colonial powers. It argues that while the medical knowledge and practices involved in both schemes were the product of multiple inner- and inter-imperial exchanges, the logics behind their rise and fall in Portuguese Africa were intimately linked to ideas of national prestige and inter-imperial competition. By revealing not only inter-imperial transfers, but also important differences in approach *within* Portuguese Africa, the article further argues that mass chemoprophylaxis was hardly a 'national' Portuguese method, even if some contemporaries made this claim. Local epidemiological, political and financial circumstances as well as a certain path dependency connecting both campaigns were crucial instead.

The rise of preventive mass atoxylization in Angola

Until the mid-1920s, Portuguese efforts to fight sleeping sickness in Angola were rather hesitant and piecemeal, certainly compared to the small cocoa producing island of Príncipe, which became the target of an unprecedented

¹³See especially Lachenal, *Le médicament*. Surprisingly, preventive mass atoxylization has not been noticed by Jorge Varanda either in his work on the sleeping sickness campaigns by Diamang, a large private mining company in northeastern Angola, see especially Jorge Varanda, "Um cavalo de Tróia na colónia? As missões de profilaxia contra a doença do sono da Companhia de Diamantes de Angola (Diamang)," in Luís Silva Pereira and Chiara Pussetti, eds., *Os saberes da cura: antropologia da doença e práticas terapêuticas* (Lisboa: Instituto Superior de Psicologia Aplicada, 2009), 79-110. Basic studies on sleeping sickness in Portuguese Africa are Martin Frederick Shapiro, "Medicine in the Service of Colonialism: Medical care in Portuguese Africa, 1885-1974," PhD Thesis (University of California, 1983), 221-300, and, more recently, Sebastião Nuno de Araújo Barros e Silva, "The Land of Flies, Children and Devils: The Sleeping Sickness Epidemic in the Island of Príncipe (1870s-1914)," PhD Thesis (University of Oxford, 2013).

and ultimately successful eradication campaign in the years leading up to the First World War, or to the neighbouring Belgian Congo and French Equatorial Africa.¹⁴ Certainly, the methods employed in Angola, where the disease covered most of the northern part of the colony, were not fundamentally different. Like in other colonies, doctors drew maps of infested areas, African workers were hired to clear brushwood along the rivers where the tsetse flies liked to breed, villages were resettled, the movement of people from infested areas was, at least in theory, curtailed and, in a few places, ill people were isolated in sleeping sickness concentration camps, where they received injections with trypanocidal drugs, most notably atoxyl. Yet, in the first quarter of the twentieth century, campaigns remained limited in scope as they suffered from a severe lack in personnel and money.¹⁵

This pattern changed in the 1920s. In 1923, in the wake of the First West African Conference on Tropical Medicine in Luanda, two anti-sleeping sickness missions were sent to the Congo (1923-1926) and Zaire (1923-1924) districts.¹⁶ And, in 1926, the fight against sleeping sickness became the cornerstone of Angola's new programme of rural African healthcare or Assistência Médica aos Indígenas (AMI), which was funded through a 7 million escudos loan from Lisbon. As I have argued elsewhere, this programme as well as its focus on sleeping sickness was the result of various mutually reinforcing factors: growing international critique of Portugal's colonization methods; concomitant pressure on Portugal to improve healthcare provisions and join the international efforts against sleeping sickness, the most mediatized disease in colonial Africa at the time; deepening anxieties among Portuguese colonial elites that, without ostensible reforms, Portugal might not only further lose prestige as a colonial power but eventually even (some of) its colonies; and internal fears that epidemic and endemic diseases, especially sleeping sickness, were rapidly depleting the African population and hence

¹⁴Compare with Silva, "The Land"; Lyons, Colonial Disease; Headrick, Colonialism, 311-84.

¹⁵Luís Baptista de Assunção Velho, "A Tripanossomose humana em Angola (Relatórios etc.)," *Revista Médica de Angola* 2 (1921): 7-196; António Damas Mora, *A luta contra a moléstia do sono em Angola (1921-1934)* (Relatórios da Direcção dos Serviços de Saúde e Higiene de Angola, volume 2), typescript (Luanda, 1934), 9-26.

¹⁶Carlos de Almeida, "Relatório do chefe da Missão do Congo Dr. Carlos de Almeida, referente ao triénio: 1923-1924; 1924-1925; 1925-1926," *Revista Médica de Angola* 5 (1927): 22-79; Frederico Leopoldino Rebêlo, "Relatório do Chefe da Missão do Zaire referentes ao periodo Agôsto de 1923 a Setembro de 1924," *Revista Médica de Angola* 5 (1927): 80-91.

compromising the colony's (economic) future.¹⁷ By the mid-1920s, tackling sleeping sickness had become a political and economic necessity for Portugal as a colonial nation.

From 1926 onwards, the AMI programme allowed to do this in a systematic way in Angola. The heavily infested northern part of the colony was divided into four 'sanitary' zones, subdivided into twelve 'sanitary' sectors (see Map I). Within each sector, itinerant medical teams regularly screened, registered and treated the population which, summoned by the administrative and/or medical authorities, gathered at so-called concentrations, fixed points within walking distance, every two or four weeks. This system was an adaptation of the 'prophylactic sectors' that had already been probed by Eugène Jamot in the sleeping sickness missions in French Equatorial Africa (AEF) and French-mandated Cameroon and by Jacques Schwetz in the Belgian Congo. The Angolan sector system, however, differed from its French and Belgian predecessors in two main aspects: it included a network of village infirmaries and health centres and medical teams were not only to fight sleeping sickness, but also to implement a broader programme of rural African healthcare. The AMI programme included tackling other endemic diseases and reducing infant mortality.¹⁸ Similar innovations would subsequently be adopted in the French and Belgian colonies as well, although tensions between 'vertical' sleeping sickness campaigns and broader 'horizontal' approaches would subsist throughout much of the colonial era.¹⁹

Yet with regard to sleeping sickness there was still another important difference. In the French and Belgian sectors, doctors followed Koch's approach of 'treatment as prevention' or 'therapeutic prophylaxis', which consisted in 'sterilizing' the blood of all infected individuals with atoxyl (or other drugs like tryparsamide) in order to make them non-infectious.²⁰ In Angola, by contrast, the approach was preventive in a more direct sense, as atoxylization was not confined to the infected part of the population, but extended to all healthy individuals as well.

¹⁷Samuël Coghe, "Inter-imperial Learning and African Health Care in Portuguese Angola in the Interwar Period," *Social History of Medicine* 28 (I) (2015): 137-40.

¹⁸Coghe, "Inter-imperial Learning," 147-9.

¹⁹Coghe, "Inter-imperial Learning," 152-4; Mertens, "Chemical Compounds," 186-7, 235-55; Headrick, *Colonialism*, 366-71.

²⁰See footnotes 10 and 12.



Map I. AMI and sleeping sickness sectors in Angola (1927-28)

Source: Província de Angola, Boletim mensal da luta contra a propagação da moléstia do sôno e da assistência médica ao indígena I (1927), Front page.

Preventive mass atoxylization was introduced right from the beginning of the programme in December 1926 by Dr Alfredo Gomes da Costa, the first director of the Cuanza zone.²¹ It consisted of two steps. First, on the basis of a clinical diagnosis, which mainly consisted in palpating the---in the case of sleeping sickness often (but not always) enlarged-cervical lymph nodes, the people at the concentrations were divided into two groups: the healthy and the sick/suspects. Second, all individuals suspected to have sleeping sickness were given a series of curative injections of atoxyl (often in combination with emetic) or newer drugs, while all those considered to be healthy received a differently dosed and spaced series of atoxyl injections for prevention. The standard *prophylactic* procedure was a series of ten, later six, injections of 0.5g of atoxyl every two weeks. In the Congo Zone, where in general concentrations could only be held once a month, doctors resorted to monthly injections of 1g each. The series were repeated at increasing intervals of three, four and six months, so as not to exceed the total dose of atoxyl still considered safe.22

In the late 1920s, preventive mass atoxylization became the most salient, but also most contested feature of Angola's anti-sleeping sickness programme. By the end of 1927, Gomes da Costa's team had already administered some 300,000 injections.²³ From 1928 onwards, the measure was also adopted in parts of the Congo zone and the total number of registered preventive injections rose to more than a million yearly between 1928 and 1930, before the method was gradually abandoned in the early 1930s (see Figure I). Although overlooked by historiography, this was, with almost 5

²¹Alfredo Gomes da Costa, "Relatório anual do chefe da zona sanitária do Cuanza Norte (1927)," *Revista Médica de Angola 6* (1928): 31-33.

²²Good descriptions of this method can be found in "Conferência sanitária luso-belga," *Boletim da Assistência Médica aos Indígenas e da Luta contra a Moléstia do Sono* 2 (12) (1928): 381; Augusto Ornelas and Bruno Pereira de Mesquita, *Relatório da missão médica de assistência aos indígenas do Cuanza, 1929* (Lisboa: Agência Geral das Colónias, 1935), 78-9; Waldemar Gomes Teixeira, *Relatório da Zona Sanitária do Cuanza para 1930* (Dalatando, June 1931), 63-64, in Arquivo Histórico Ultramarino, Lisbon [AHU], MU, AGC 2336; Avelino Manuel da Silva, *Serviço de Assistência aos Indígenas no distrito do Congo, 1930: Relatório elaborado pelo chefe da zona sanitária do Congo* (Lisboa: Agência Geral das Colónias, [193-]), 17-8.

²³António Damas Mora, "A assistência médica aos Indígenas e a luta contra a propagação da moléstia do sono, em 1927," *Boletim Mensal da Luta contra a Propagação da Moléstia do Sono e da Assistência Médica ao Indígena* 1 (1927): 6.

million preventive injections, administered between 1926 and 1932 to a population of roughly 300,000 to 400,000 Africans, the first scheme of mass chemoprophylaxis against sleeping sickness in tropical Africa, before the same idea was implemented at a still larger scale with different drugs after World War II.²⁴



Figure 1. Number of preventive atoxyl injections in Angola (1926-1932)

Sources: Ornelas and Mesquita, *Relatório*, 67-9; Teixeira, *Relatório*, 58; Silva, *Serviço*, 46; Bruno de Mesquita, "Considerações sobre a profilaxia da doença do sono em Angola," Tese de Licenciatura, University of Coimbra (1934), 24, 28; Mora, *Luta*, passim.

Preventive mass atoxylization capitalized on the well-known advantages of atoxyl, which had made it the preferred drug for 'treatment as prevention' campaigns after World War I. Not only could atoxyl be used to break the fly-human transmission cycle, as it destroyed the trypanosomes in the blood, it was also suitable for massive use in the field: it was cheap and easy to administer, so that European doctors entrusted African nurses with the

66

²⁴Numbers for the population under regular medical surveillance in the Cuanza zone can be found in Alfredo Gomes da Costa, "Assistência médica ao indígena e combate à doença do sono," in Fernando Mouta, ed., *Generalidades sobre Angola, para o I.° Cruzeiro de Férias às Colónias Portuguesas* (Luanda: Imprensa Nacional, 1935), 61. Data for the Congo zone are more fragmentary. For 1930, see Silva, *Serviço*, 45.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

African Knowledge and Resilience in Late Portuguese Colonial Empire: The Agro-pastoralists of Southwestern Angola

Cláudia Castelo

Centro Interuniversitário de Histórias das Ciências e da Técnologia, Faculdade de Ciências, Universidade de Lisboa

Introduction

In the present paper, I discuss the agro-pastoral systems of the arid and semiarid lands of southwestern Angola, and their expertise and resilience vis-a-vis the natural environment and the modernisation policy of the Portuguese colonial state in the post-Second World War. My analytical approach is affiliated to the historical scholarship on science and empire that in the last two decades has questioned linear and binary narratives of "colonial science" and addressed the production of knowledge in the colonial and imperial contexts in a more comprehensive and sophisticated manner, looking to the place and the local frame of reference, the role of native informants and "indigenous" expertise, the complex interactions between European scientists and local intermediaries, the construction of hybrid forms of scientific knowledge or "vernacular science", its relation with international development politics and policies, and the inter-imperial and transnational connections, borrowings and comparisons.¹ It also builds upon the interdisciplinary



^IThe special issue on Nature and Empire: Science and the Colonial Enterprise, edited by Roy Macleod, *Osiris* 15 (2000) (namely the "Introduction to Nature and Empire: Science and Colonial Enterprise," I-13, and the articles by Christoph Bonneuil, "Development as Experiment: Science and State Building in Late Colonial and Postcolonial Africa, 1930-1970," 258-281, and David Wade Chambers and Richard Gillespie, "Locality in the History of Science: Colonial science, Technoscience and Indigenous Knowledge," 221-240). Joseph M. Hodge, *The Triumph of the Expert: Agrarian Doctrines of Development and the Legacies of British Colonialism* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2007). William Beinart, Karen Brown and Daniel Gilfoyle, "Experts and Expertise in Colonial Africa Reconsidered: Science and the Interpenetration of Knowledge," *African Affairs* 108 (432) (2009): 413-433. Sujit Sivasundaram, ed., *The Focus: Global Histories of Science, Isis* 101 (1) (2010) (namely the article by Helen Tilley, "Global Histories, Vernacular Science, and African Genealogies; or, Is

scholarship on pastoral societies in Africa (e.g., the Nuer of southern Sudan, the Masai of southern Kenya and northern Tanzania or the Herero of northern Namibia) and their interaction with the late colonial and post-colonial developmental aim of establishing a 'modern' livestock industry. Since the 1990s, that literature has stressed the diversity, heterogeneity, vulnerability, and dynamic adaptive processes of those communities, generally regarded by colonial and post-colonial states and even non-governmental organizations and other development agents as "culturally conservative".² More recently, the production systems and livelihood strategies of agro-pastoralist communities were analysed under the concept of resilience, a concept that bridges natural and social sciences. Resilience constitutes both a knowledge system and a sustainable social-ecological formation and encapsulates both the physical environment and human reaction to political acts, being useful in explaining how communities over the long-term respond to shifting circumstances as diverse as drought and violence.³

The methodology for this paper is based on a thorough enquiry into the "colonial archive", the site of knowledge production and circulation. I have come across the agro-pastoralists' practices—discursively articulated as "resistance" and less often as "knowledge" by agents of the colonial state—in

the History of Science Ready for the World?," 110-119). Helen Tilley, *Africa as a Living Laboratory: Empire, Development, and the Problem of Scientific Knowledge, 1870-1950* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2011). Joseph M. Hodge, "The Hybridity of Colonial Knowledge: British Tropical Agricultural Science and African Farming Practices at the End of Empire," in Brett M. Bennett and Joseph M. Hodge, eds., *Science and Empire: Knowledge and Networks of Science across the British Empire, 1800-1970* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 209-231.

²David M. Anderson and Vigdis Broch-Due, "Poverty & the Pastoralist: Deconstructing Myths, Reconstruction Realities," in David M. Anderson and Vigdis Broch-Due, eds., *The Poor are Not Us: Poverty & Pastoralism* (Oxford, Nairobi and Athens: James Currey, E.A.E.P. and Ohio University Press, 1999), 3-19 [17]. Andy Catley, Jeremy Lind and Ian Scoores, eds., *Pastoralism and Development in Africa: Dynamic Change at the Margins* (London: Routledge, 2012). Micheal Bollig and Micheal Schnegg, "Introduction. Specialisation and Diversification among African Pastoral Societies," in Micheal Bolling, Micheal Schnegg, and Hans-Peter Wotzka, eds., *Pastoralism in Africa: Past, Present and Future* (New York and Oxford: Berghahn, 2013), I-28 [1].

³David M. Anderson and Micheal Bollig, "Resilience and Collapse: Histories, Ecologies and Identities in the Baringo-Bogoria Basin, Kenya," *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 10 (1) (2016): 1-20 [4 and 7].

written records, mostly unpublished and confidential.⁴ Taking Ann Laura Stoler's proposal into account, I have tried to read "against" and "along the archival grain" to grasp power relations, unacknowledged agency and differing political projects within and beyond the state machine.⁵ It was possible to track the construction and confrontation of competing and often ambiguous views on the agro-pastoralist way of life and its possibilities of modernisation. Between these views one notices the colonial government anxieties translated into the creation of commissions for studying the "nomad problem", elaboration of orders and regulations and requests for further research and studies; in brief, the mobilisation of expertise that resulted in a complex flow of information and a huge accumulation of data over the years.⁶

The agro-pastoral universe of southwestern Angola

Until the 1960s the cattle-raising systems of southwestern Angola were not really known outside of the agro-pastoral universe and there was no comprehensive knowledge of this unity. The Mission for Angola Agricultural Surveys (*Missão de Inquéritos Agrícolas de Angola*, hereafter MIAA) which carried out field research between 1962 and 1969 with the agro-pastoralists, contributed to reverse that situation. Currently the available knowledge on the agro-pastoral universe is still the one produced by MIAA in the late colonial period.

In the next paragraphs, I will resort to Elisete Marques da Silva's rigorous characterization of the "milking complex", drawn from MIAA's documents, and other coeval sources, first-hand knowledge and oral testimonies.⁷ The Angolan agro-pastoral universe corresponds to a very large geographical area —south of an imaginary line from Benguela to the south-eastern corner of

⁴James C. Scott has already noticed that "everyday forms of resistance rarely make headlines," (James C. Scott, "Everyday Forms of Resistance," *The Copenhagen Journal of Asian Studies* 4 (1989): 33-62 [49]). Available at: http://rauli.cbs.dk/index.php/cjas/article/view / 1765/1785.

⁵Ann Laura Stoler, "Colonial Archives and the Arts of Governance," *Archival Science* 2, I-2 (2002): 87-I09 [90, 99-I00]. Available at: http://hdl.handle.net/2027.42/ 4I825.

⁶Ann Laura Stoler has already written about "colonial commissions as stories that states tell themselves" (Stoler, "Colonial Archives," 103-107).

⁷Elisete Marques da Silva, "Impactos da ocupação colonial nas sociedades rurais do sul de Angola," *Occasional Paper Series* 8 (Lisbon: Centro de Estudos Africanos/ISCTE, 2003).



Fig 1. Map of agricultural regions of Angola.

Source: Cruz de Carvalho, "Esboço de Zonagem Agrícola de Angola," *Fomento: Técnica e Economia Ultramarinas* I (3) (1963): 67-72.

Angola—that occupies circa 300,000 km² (almost ¼ of the total territory) and includes different environmental conditions and ethnic groups. Its southern limit corresponds to the Angola's southern border.⁸ The unity of this universe results from the pastoral or agro-pastoral character of its African populations, cultures and economy.⁹

This vast area has a subtropical climate with two seasons: a hot and dry season from May until December and a cold season characterised by occasional—sometimes torrential—rainfall from December to April. Catumbela, Cunene and Cubango are the only perennial rivers in the region. The vegetal formations are quite diversified although different forms of savanna prevail. This includes two arid areas (the northern extensions of Namibe and Kalahari deserts) and the Huila Plateau.¹⁰

Throughout the colonial period the population density was low and irregular. In the late phase there was one inhabitant per km² in the southeast and there were 25 inhabitants per km² in the Huila Plateau. According to the 1970 census the total population was approximately 1,100,000 individuals. The large majority was black (92%) and lived in the countryside; the white population (5%) and the mestizos (2%) lived mostly in the urban areas (Lobito, Benguela, Moçâmedes, Porto Alexandre, Sá da Bandeira). In the zone of Cunene's influence, the European presence was very scant and further east became insignificant. The African population belonged to several ethnic groups, each one with a very different demographic weight. The larger groups were: the Nyaneka-Nkhumbi (46%) which were in fact a heterogeneous group; the Ovambo "nation" (I3%), whose most important group was the Kwanyama (living on both sides of the international boarder); and

⁸The neighboring country being German South-West Africa (1884-1915), South West Africa under South Africa rule (1920-1990) and, since independence, Namibia.

⁹Francisco Sá Pereira, "Informação acerca de alguns aspectos da pecuária do Sul de Angola," Unpublished document, Nova Lisboa, MIAA, 10 July 1970, 3. Eduardo Cruz de Carvalho, "'Traditional' and 'Modern' Patterns of Cattle Raising in Southwestern Angola: A Critical Evaluation of Change from Pastoralism to Ranching," *The Journal of Developing Areas* 8 (2) (1974): 199-225 [203].

¹⁰A cultural-geographical picture of the Huíla Plateau resulting from field research done in 1958-1959, supported by the Foreign Field Research Program, conducted by the Division of Earth Sciences, National Academy of Sciences-National Research Council, and financed by the Geography Branch, Office Naval Research, in Alvin W. Urquhart, *Patterns of Settlement and Subsistence in Southwestern Angola* ([Washington]: National Academy of Sciences-National Research Council, 1963).

groups assimilated to the Ovimbundu (32%). For the purpose of this article it is important to mention one of the smaller groups named the Herero (2.5%) and especially a minority subgroup of the Herero, the Kuvale which were called *Mucubais* by the Portuguese.^{II}

The agro-pastoral systems practiced by all the African societies of the agro-pastoral universe were determined by soil and climate conditions resulting in sparse vegetation that did not allow an intensive use of the pastures. Another critical point was the lack of water except in the rainy season when major inundations in the plains of the Cunene and Kwanyama regions took place. The agro-pastoral societies developed systems based on a regular movement of cattle in which the circuits allow a rational use of pastures and water, preventing the overgrazing and the destruction of the natural resources and disease dissemination.¹² In the Benguela-Moçâmedes coastal region and in the Cunene and the kwanyama regions the ecological conditions required annual movements of transhumance, that is, cattle movements for several months in herds and sometimes large herds, to areas far away from the permanent residence of their owners; in other regions, the movements were limited to variable areas around the place of residence. The surface area required by cattle per unit was fairly unequal across regions but was generally quite considerable. Water and land were not considered to be private property but rather were used and maintained by all the members of a certain social unity. Cattle was individual or family propriety although each owner distributed some of his cows to the herds of other members of the same social group and accepted those of other herders into his own herd. The economic use of cattle was mostly for milk production which was the basis of the agro-pastoralists' diet. In the three regions of transition between

^{II}On southwestern Angola ethnic groups, Carlos Estermann (1896-1976), superior of the Huila Mission of the Holy Spirit Congregation, published *Etnografia do Sudoeste de Angola*, vol I: *Os povos não-Bantos e o grupo étnico dos Ambós* (Lisbon: JIU, 1956); *Etnografia do Sudoeste de Angola*, vol. II: *O grupo étnico* Nyaneka-Nkumbi (Lisbon: JIU, 1957); and *Etnografia do Sudoeste de Angola*, vol. III: *O grupo étnico dos Herero* (Lisbon: JIU, 1961). These volumes, edited by Gordon D. Gilbson, were published in English (New York: Africana Publishing Company, A Division of Holmes & Meier Publishers, 1976-1981).

¹²William Beinart has noted that "Transhumance, whatever its context was closely tied up with animal nutrition; and nutrition in turn was imbricated with disease" (William Beinart, "Transhumance, Animal Diseases and Environment in the Cape, South Africa," *South African Historical Journal* 58 (I) (2007): 17-4I [23]).

the major farming area of Angola's central plateau and the predominantly pastoral area of the southwest, the amount and relative regularity of rainfall assured viable farming. The Benguela-Moçâmedes coastal region, due to the unpredictability and scarcity of rainfall, was predominantly pastoral while farming was only an ancillary activity. In the other regions, the agro-pastoralists' economy was complemented by subsistence farming.¹³ Gathering, fishing and hunting were other complementary resources for these peoples.

Colonial occupation

The European commercial occupation of southwestern Angola had begun in the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The main product of commerce was always cattle in exchange for goods of European origin. After a long period of resistance, in 1915 the Humbe and the Kwanyama were subjected to Portuguese colonial rule.¹⁴ Still the European presence continued to be minimal. The expansion of the administrative network and the settlement of Portuguese colonists were slow especially outside the three main poles: Moçâmedes and nearby, the Huila Plateau and the cities of Benguela and Lobito. However, in the interwar years the local communities suffered the colonial state's aggressive tax policies which were closely linked to practices of forced labour, all of which contributed to population flights into South West Africa.¹⁵ For those who stayed on the Portuguese side, the commercial transactions with the European traders became a means to obtain money to pay taxes and penalties. However, in the most peripheral zones of the agropastoral universe the commercial coverture remained sparse. In the 1930s, many comerciantes do mato (bush traders) with no land of their own, distributed their cattle to various African holders. This cattle was fully integrated into the traditional system, thus there was no competition for water or grazing lands between African and European owners. The colonial authorities would disapprove of such a situation, considered a civilisation downgrade for the settlers and a bad example for the colonised.

¹³Carvalho, "Traditional' and 'Modern' Patterns," 208.

¹⁴René Pélissier, *História das Campanhas de Angola: resistência e revoltas 1845-1941* (Lisbon: Estampa, 1986), 141-264.

¹⁵Alexander Keese, "Why stay?" Forced Labor, the Correia Report, and Portuguese-South African Competition at the Angola-Namibia Border, 1917-1939," *History in Africa*, 42 (2015): 75-108, DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/hia.2015.20

From the 1880s onwards there was a long record of the spoliation of Africans' lands and the cattle by Portuguese traders and administrators in the south of Angola. However, the Portuguese disseminated and exaggerated the idea that Mucubais-acknowledged as skilled cattle breeders and insubordinate of the colonial power-were cattle thieves and played off neighboring groups one against the other. These charges were motivated by greed and injured national pride. Finally, in 1940-1941, the Kuvale were brutally pursued by the Portuguese.¹⁶ In September of 1940 they were charged with a serious incident which occurred in the west Gambos and the governor of the Huíla district asked for intervention by the army. The military commander took the opportunity to put an end to a "humiliating situation" for the Portuguese-the insubordination of the Kuvale (a total population around 5,000 individuals)-contributing to their civilisation through new habits of work and attachment to land that would guarantee the payment of tax.¹⁷ The Mucubais war dragged on until February 1941.¹⁸ In addition to an undetermined number of deaths in combat, this resulted in a large number of prisoners being held (3529), against whom many atrocities were committed. A significant number of prisoners was afterwards sent to São Tomé plantations, to the Diamang mines, to a penal colony or "granted" to the municipality and farmers of Moçâmedes. This repression also resulted in the seizing of some 90% of the cattle of the defeated (19701). The forced proletarianisation of the Kuvale was not to last long: within less than twenty years they were able to reconstitute their herds and reproduce their way of life in southwestern Angola due to strategies of savings and diligent care.¹⁹

After the Second World War, the agro-pastoral universe and especially the region of Cunene (which until 1970 belonged to the Angolan district of

¹⁶René Pélissier, *As campanhas coloniais de Portugal, 1844-1941* (Lisbon: Estampa, 2006), 415-419.

¹⁷Abel de Abreu Sotto-Maior, *Operações militares de polícia para repressão das tribus Mucubais insubmissas na colónia de Angola* (Lisboa, 1943), in Ruy Duarte de Carvalho, *Aviso à navegação: olhar sucinto e preliminar sobre os pastores kuvale da província do Namibe com um relance sobre as outras sociedades agropastoris do sudoeste de Angola* (Luanda: Instituto Nacional do Livro, 1997). The link between this war, waged labour and the need for tax collection by the colonial powers is made by Carvalho, *Aviso à navegação*.

¹⁸Ruy Duarte de Carvalho has interviewed a *kuvale* who referred to the "kokambola war" (general, total or worldwide war), *Aviso à navegação*, 11.

¹⁹Pélissier, As campanhas coloniais, 419.

Huíla), was marginal and "'underdeveloped' even by Portuguese standards," being "among the lowest on the priority scale of colonial development for all Angolan districts and subdivisions".²⁰ In the early 1950s, the Angola government tried to promote a "modernising" policy for the livestock sector in the south of the colony, based on the idea that the Cunene floodplain offered good conditions for "modern" cattle raising and for white settlement.²¹ This policy had two recipients: the African populations and the prospective European settlers. For the first, the colonial state conducted—directly or indirectly-actions that were intended to enhance water resources and prevent cattle disease. The Geology and Mines Services were charged with the research, capture and extraction of underground water. Between 1955 and 1957 those works in the Low Cunene region had the collaboration of the company World Mining Consultants, Inc., of New York, thanks to the International Cooperation Administration, a United States government agency responsible for foreign technical assistance and "non-military security" programs.²² In the Huila district the Geology and Mines Services and the Veterinary Services worked together in the improvement traditional water points and the establishment of new ones (namely chimpacas, artificial lagoons, and small brickwork dams). Independently, the Veterinary Services implemented vaccination and animal health care campaigns.²³ The second had to do with land use and aimed at providing space for the settlement of European cattle breeders apart from the African agro-pastoralists.²⁴ The first

²⁰Alexander Keese, "Developmentalist Attitudes and Old Habits: Portuguese Labour Policies, South African Rivalry, and Flight in Southern Angola, 1945-1974," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 41 (2) (2015): 237-253 [240], DOI: 10.1080/03057070.2015.1012908.

²¹"By the early 1950s, Portuguese officials and planners had to readjust their regional policies, in an attempt to improve the appearance of Portuguese colonialism in Angola, and this process finally had to include the regions close to the Kunene river, which for a long time had been entirely neglected territory" (Alexander Keese, "Developmentalist Attitudes and Old Habits," 240).

²²C. A. Neves Ferrão, "A hidrogeologia e o problema do abastecimento de água ao Baixo Cunene," *Garcia de Orta 9* (3) (1971): 515-538 [518].

²³Província de Angola. Serviço de Veterinária. Repartição distrital da Huíla, Relatório de Actividade da Brigada das Chimpacas (Exploração, captação e aprovisionamento de água para o gado, no sul da Huíla). Ano de 1960. Signed by the services' director, Armando Namorado Malacriz. Arquivo Histórico Ultramarino, IPAD, 14630.

²⁴Since the mid-I800s Angola was envisaged as a white settlement colony by the Portuguese state. However, other than occasional projects and measures, there was no official coherent and continuing colonial settlement policy. Only from the 1950s there was a state-

legislation designed to foster and expand commercial ranching in southwestern Angola were the legislative diploma no. 2232 (1950), that established global reserves for cattle raising in the Huíla province, only for "non-natives breeders" along with the order no. 7695 (1951), that approved the regulation of land grants in those pastoral reserves.²⁵ According to the supra cited diploma, livestock farming had in the south of the colony "an enormous field of activity" but the way that the natives carried on that activity was "faulty and negative". Besides, European livestock in the region presented "no attachment to land," since "Europeans owned and kept cattle as the natives did".²⁶ Within the colonial apparatus it seemed that there was a consensus about the need for European settlement and livestock stabilisation in the south of Angola.²⁷

The modernising policy for the pastoral lands of the 1950s and 1960s has to be framed in the colonial development effort of the post-Second World War. Between the post-war and African independence, development was considered a means to reinvigorate and legitimise empire while knowledge, planning and capital were mobilised by the colonial governments in unprecedented ways.²⁸ Portugal was no exception to this trend. Dependent of foreign capital (and benefitting from American consultancy and technical assistance—an issue still largely unexplored), "Portugal would build up its

²⁶Diploma legisltativo n. 2232, *Boletim Oficial de Angola*, I Série, n. 1, 4 January 1950.

led migration of Portuguese to Angola. Cláudia Castelo, "Colonial Migration to Angola and Mozambique: Constraints and Illusions," in Eric Morier-Genoud and Michel Cahen eds., *Imperial Migrations: Colonial Communities and Diaspora in the Portuguese World* (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 107-128.

²⁵Carvalho, "'Traditional' and 'Modern' Patterns," 200.

²⁷William Beinart studying another south African context—the Cape, South Africa has noted that "For much of the nineteenth century, British missionaries and officials (but not only them) railed against the social costs of transhumance for blacks and whites. A more settled agriculture was linked to ideas of civilisation, control, progress, improvement, investment and education" (William Beinart, "Transhumance, Animal Diseases and Environment," 32).

²⁸Frederick Cooper, "Modernizing Bureaucrats, Backward Africans, and the Development Concept," in F. Cooper and R. Packard, eds., *International Development and the Social Sciences* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 64-92 [64]. F. Cooper, "Development, Modernization, and the Social Sciences in the Era of Decolonization: The Examples of British and French Africa," *Revue d'Histoire des Sciences Humaines* 16 (2004), 9-38 [19]. Hodge, *The Triumph of the Experts*.

own repressive version of the developmentalist colonial state" in Angola and Mozambique.²⁹

In the face of the anticolonial response, Portugal would officially deny that it had non-autonomous territories. In the constitutional revision of 1951, the terms colonies and empire were replaced by "overseas provinces" (províncias ultramarinas) and "Portuguese overseas" (ultramar). In addition to the national unity claims, from 1953 until 1974, the Estado Novo conceived of and carried out five-year development plans for its overseas provinces, invested metropolitan funds in those territories and resorted to science and technology as never before. The Portuguese dictatorship tended to envisage colonial development as economic growth through increased production and improved commercial use of the products. The major investments were made in infra-structures for transport and communications, the exploitation of natural resources favouring the replacement of traditional patterns of production by "modern" ones, and large-scale white settlement. The development model of the Portuguese late colonial state was primarily focused on the Portuguese settlers and interests and only belatedly incorporated social concerns with the African populations.³⁰ Nevertheless, from the 1950s modernisation and developmental schemes aiming at the "natives" were put into practice supported by idioms of social change related to a comprehensive doctrine of welfare colonialism.³¹ In contrast to the vision that the colonial war determined socioeconomic reforms hand-in-hand with control and repression,³² recent work has pointed out that the Portuguese politics and policies of imperial developmentalism and the strategies of social engineering were related but not reducible to military and security rationales.³³ It has also acknowledged the important role played by international doctrines,

²⁹Frederick Cooper, *Africa since 1940: The Past of the Present* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 62-63.

³⁰Cláudia Castelo, "Developing 'Portuguese Africa' in Late Colonialism: Confronting Discourses," in Joseph M. Hodge, Gerald Hödl and Martina Kopf, eds., *Developing Africa: Concepts and Practices in Twentieth-Century Colonialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014), 63-86.

³¹Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, "A Modernising Empire? Politics, Culture and Economy in Portuguese Late Colonialism," *The Ends of European Colonial Empires: Cases and Comparisons* (Hampshire: Palgrave MacMillan, 2015), 51-80 [59].

³²Gerald J. Bender, *Angola under the Portuguese: The Myth and the Reality* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1978).

³³Bandeira Jerónimo and Costa Pinto, "A Modernising Empire?," 58 and 70.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

The Labours of the Empire: On Scales and Comparisons

50

A "Very Delicate Position": Portuguese "Native Labour" Policies and International Non-metropolitan Labour Standards in the Aftermath of Second World War (1945-1949)

José Pedro Monteiro Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra

I. Introduction

The main aim of this article is to explore the politics and policies of "native labour" within the Portuguese empire in relation to the international developments that took place between 1945 and 1949, mainly within the orbit of the International Labour Organization (ILO), and related to the so called "native labour" question.

Doing this is a way to tackle two identified shortcomings of the existing literature on the topic. On one hand, this critical period of major world transformations, notably regarding colonial affairs, is addressed by looking into the ways Portuguese government members, officials, inspectors, representatives at international organizations and a few colonial *ideologues* assessed the changes related to international labour standards for the colonies. By exploring the reactions of this set of actors, one can be elucidated about the deep dissonance that existed between the concepts and programmes internationally debated, and promoted, and the national and colonial social and political realities. One can also identify the substantial gap between the rationales and purposes of the social colonial policies formulated by the Portuguese authorities and those elaborated, not without shortcomings and constraints, by other imperial governments.¹ On the other hand, by setting these chronological limits, this text also provides a glimpse about the social



^ISee Alexander Keese, "Slow Abolition within the Colonial Mind: British and French debates about 'Vagrancy', 'African Laziness' and Forced Labour in West Central and South Central Africa (1945-1965," *International Review of Social History* 59 (3) (December 2014): 377-407.

realities in the colonies as they were presented and debated by Portuguese officials and a more detailed view about processes of internal and external assessment or even denunciation of Portuguese labour practices and legislation in its colonies. Most literature has paid due attention to the ground-breaking and highly polemical secret reports presented by the High-Inspector Henrique Galvão in 1947 and 1948.² However, much less is known about the routinized devices of labour "inspection", about their contents, and projected, even if not materialized, reforms. In this article, an effort is made to sustain that initiatives that signalled and intended to prevent and repress abuses were regularly submitted to governing imperial bodies, although with varying ranges and senses of urgency.

Originating from a multitude of sites and motivated by diverse causes, from humanist concerns regarding living conditions of the "natives" to utilitarian views of native manpower, and triggered by local or metropolitan concerns, these instances of critical appraisal of colonial labour policies were also significantly connected to international developments. Since this period was relatively peaceful in what regards international criticisms—comparing to preceding years and with those about to emerge—, historiographical approaches to it significantly have missed the international reverberations along the entire imperial administrative chain. This is in part the result of a cherry-picking approach to the international dimensions of the history of Portuguese colonial social policies that has been focused either in events related to highly-publicized denunciations, whose contents are commonly taken as face value, or in readings of this history merely concentrated on formalized, institutionally sanctioned interactions.

This article bridges the gap between the interwar years, when accusations against Portuguese mobilization of coerced labour were widespread, and the 1950s, when there was a resurgence of international and transnational denunciations of Portuguese native labour policies and practices.³ By exploring this period, the article focuses on the persisting and enduring nexus between international interaction and efforts of imperial self-scrutiny and imagina-

²See, among others, Douglas Wheeler, "The Galvão Report on Forced Labour (1947) in Historical Context and Perspective. Trouble-shooter who was 'Trouble'," *Portuguese Studies Review* 16 (I) (2009): 115-152.

³Regarding the interwar years, see Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, *The 'Civilising Mission' of Portuguese Colonialism, 1870-1930* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2015).

tion of possible reformist initiatives. This nexus was quite evident even in a relatively calm period for the Portuguese officials. It manifested itself in the regular appraisal of international instruments related to social policy on the then so-called non-metropolitan territories, in the persistent demands to closer integration vis-à-vis international labour standards, in the mobilization of international events and normative dispositions in order to promote and guide a more committed effort to prevent and tackle abuses or/and, with increasing frequency, in exercising pressures for substantial changes to existing legislation.⁴ The fact that they did not succeeded is not a justification to ignore them, especially as they impacted heavily on the developments that occurred in the following decades. Insistence on the ratification of a certain number of colonial-oriented ILO conventions, that would eventually take place in the late 1950s, was recurrent during these years. Also, the identification by several actors of the "native labour" question as a crucial marker of a sound and efficient colonial policy and as a fundamental pillar in the Portuguese external claims to imperial legitimacy (and respective ability to govern subject peoples), in a period when external accusations were mainly absent, demonstrates the accuracy of the argument that imperial social policy was never a mere technical, anodyne subject debated occasionally in international fora. On the contrary, it was a crucial and regular topic in discussions regarding foreign policy-making whose political implications were definitely not unforeseen or downplayed by diplomats, rulers and colonial officials alike.

It is crucial, however, to stress that the orientation and scope of the improving measures or eventual reforms advanced were naturally variegated. Some officials tolerated law abuses, even in inspection instances whose first formal task was to assure the well-being of the "natives". Others urged for substantial legislative measures in order to tackle what they saw as a reign of abuses. Regarding international standards, the appraisal of each official varied tremendously and that is one of the reasons why they were not ratified during these years. But globally, there was a wide consensus about the *subordinated* role of the "native" worker in colonial economies and societies. The

⁴For an integrated approach to the impact of the internationalization of native labour in the Portuguese empire see Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and José Pedro Monteiro, "Internationalism and the Labours of the Portuguese Colonial Empire (1945-74)," *Portuguese Studies* 29 (2) (2013): 142-163.

"native" was mainly held as childlike, idle, potentially subversive and unable to give proper use to the new social and political rights being promoted at an international level. An extremely entrenched racialized view of the imagined "native" worker persisted. Therefore, given these circumstances, the failure to meet what was being promoted in Geneva or what was being experimented in other colonial contexts is not surprising. Freedom of choosing a job, of moving from a place to other (especially if the destination was another colony), the right to quit a job or simply not have one were mainly denied. The projected consequences of a liberalized approach to labour policies were depicted as catastrophic. State paternalist guidance of the "native" working force was a prevailing principle in most debates concerning the possibility of reforms. The latter were routinely proposed but never materialized; in all of them racial paternalism prevailed. All these possibilities constituted the unimaginable realm of Portuguese colonial officials, inspectors, rulers and experts. The décalage between the committed efforts of Portuguese officials to guarantee that the law was not violated, or even to improve it, and the ambitious programs of social transformation that the ILO prescribed and that some colonial powers were tentatively and selectively applying was evident. For a significant part of these inspectors and officials, all boiled down to the business of making law effective. For others, the transformation of laws that had roughly twenty years and were not adapted to the new zeitgeist was mandatory. But all of them, during this period, simply did not admit the possibility of the suspension of the reigning dual labour regime and of its cornerstone principle: the moral obligation of all male natives work for a minimum of days each year, something that should be strictly enforced by state authorities.

Addressing the ways that imperial and colonial authorities interacted with legal and political dynamics abroad and how they related them to the information emanating from the several sites that were subject of supervision and inspection is, therefore, the twin purpose of this article. Thus, topics such as the inner dynamics of imperial and colonial administrations or local or regional politics and policies of labour and manpower organization and regulation are only addressed as they work as observatories of the broader trends of internationalization of "native labour" issues. Moreover, there are nowadays several researches that deal in detail with some of these topics. In sum, this chapter builds on several works that have dealt with developments in official imperial thinking, administrative reorganization and
labour policies to show that most, if not all these processes, would benefit from an attempt to connect them to international and transnational debates, norm-setting procedures and events.⁵

This approach has necessarily risks and limitations. Detailed analyses of local or regional mechanics of labour mobilization and codification are avoided in this article, but by bringing the "international" in, here broadly understood, as a factor of constrain *and* as a fundamental tenet of imperial imaginations, one allows for a more nuanced and integrated view of the above-mentioned local dynamics.⁶ The same goes for the study of *classic* diplomatic topics and momentous events of imperial engagement with foreign and global actors. By stressing the more routinized devices of international interaction and adding the social question to the "big picture" of imperial diplomacy, this article unveils crucial events and processes that challenge the idea of an isolated empire or of a somewhat peaceful period of Portuguese imperial diplomacy after the turbulence of the war.

2. Reframing colonial labour policies in the aftermath of the war

World War II (WWII) had a seismic impact on European colonial empires. Yet, the precise impact on each imperial configuration and on each colonial

⁵For each of these topics there is substantial literature. For a few, important, works see, among others, Alexander Keese, *Living with Ambiguity, Integrating an African Elite in French and Portuguese Africa 1930-61* (Munchen: Martin-Behaim-Preis, 2006); Philip J. Havik, Alexander Keese and Maciel Santos, *Administration and Taxation in Former Portuguese Africa, 1910-1945* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015); Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo "A Battle in the Field of Human Relations': The Official Minds of Repressive Development in Portuguese Angola," in Martin Thomas and Gareth Curless, eds., *Decolonization and Conflict: Colonial Comparisons and Legacies* (London: Bloomsbury, 2017), 115-136; Cláudia Castelo, "Developing 'Portuguese Africa' in Late Colonialism: Confronting Discourses," in Joseph Hodge, Gerald Hodl and Martina Kopf, eds., *Developing Africa: Concepts and Practices in Twentieth Century Colonialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014), 63-86.

⁶Regarding local labour practices see, among others, Leroy Vailand e Landeg White, *Capitalism and Colonialism in Mozambique* (London: Heineman, 1980); Alexander Keese, "Forced Labour in the 'Gorgulho Years': Understanding Reform and Repression in Rural São Tomé e Príncipe, 1945-1953," *Itinerario* 38 (I) (2014): 103-124; Alexander Keese, "The Constraints of Late Colonial Reform Policy: Forced Labour Scandals in the Portuguese Congo (Angola) and the Limits of Reform under Authoritarian Rule (1955-1961), *Portuguese Studies* 28 (2) (2012): 186-200; Augusto Nascimento, "Escravatura, trabalho forçado e contrato em S. Tomé e Príncipe nos séculos XIX-XX: sujeição e ética laboral," *Africana Studia* n°7 (2004): 183-217.

territory varied substantially. If WWII encouraged numerous anti-colonial activists to further their demands it also added weight to European colonial empires governments' concerns about the need to preserve, and transform its rule over most African territories.⁷

The activities of the International Labour Organization in the immediate years following the end of the war are illustrative of the ambivalent nature of the latter's impact on global debates about the colonial problem. During the interwar years, the ILO had created a set of conventions that aimed to regulate labour relations in the colonial contexts. These instruments were mainly concerned with freedom at work for "native" populations, prescribing a set of particularistic norms that regulated the diverse modalities of forced labour, contracts and recruitment for indigenous workers and penal sanctions for breach of work contracts.⁸ In 1944, at the Philadelphia International Labour Conference, the organization set in motion a vast plan to substantially transform its normative framework for colonial contexts. Afterwards, the term "colony" was dropped and instead a more neutral concept of "non-metropolitan territories" was adopted. This was not merely a semantic change. Between 1944 and 1947, this organization had been the stage for intense debates that would lead to numerous conventions and recommendations aimed at transforming the nature of the standards that should guide, from then on, a modern social policy in the colonies. ILO new

⁷Regarding the impact of World War II on European colonial empires see, among others, Martin Shipway, *Decolonization and its Impact: A Comparative Approach to the End of Colonial Empires* (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, 2008), 61-86; Martin Thomas, Bob Moore, L. J. Butler, *Crises of Empire: Decolonization and Europe's Imperial States, 1918-1975* (London: Bloomsbury, 2010), 47-72, 182-227, 290-317; Frederick Cooper and Jane Burbank, *Empires in World History: Power and the Politics of Difference* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010), 413-442; Mark Mazower, *Governing the World: The History of an Idea* (London: Penguin, 2012), 191-213, 244-272.

⁸Suzan Zimmerman, "'Special circumstances' in Geneva: The ILO and the World of Non-Metropolitan Labour in the Inter-war Period," in J. Van Daele, M. Rodriguez Garcia, G. Van Goethem, M. Van der Linden, eds., *ILO Histories: Essays on the International Labour Organization and its Impact on the World during the Twentieth Century* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2010), 221-250; Daniel Maul, "The International Labour Organization and the Struggle against Forced Labour from 1919 to the Present," *Labor History* 48 (4) (2007): 477-500; Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, "Uma sociedade de impérios: a imaginação política imperial e o período de entre-guerras," in Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and José Pedro Monteiro, eds., *Os passados do presente: Internacionalismo, imperialismo e a construção do mundo contemporâneo* (Coimbra: Almedina, 2015), 235-270.

conventions on *non-metropolitan territories* placed a new emphasis on the need to subordinate the development of these territories to the well-being of its native populations. They expanded the social domains and policies covered by international norms and supervision regarding colonial territories. They also redefined the place of the "native" worker in the colonial societies by enforcing the need to create unrestrained representative unions, to develop autonomous labour inspectorates, to set wage-fixing machinery and labour dispute resolution mechanisms where native workers had a voice. These were just some of the social innovations proposed for colonial contexts. These efforts paralleled, in a substantial degree, the social transformations that were taking place at least in some of the British and French African territories. They were also connected to broader changes, namely within the United Nations, around the definition of proper and legitimate *modi operandi* of imperial and colonial polities.⁹

To be sure, these transformations did not embody a complete and absolute overcoming of the paternalist spirit that pervaded the organization during the interwar years. Although aiming for a gradual uniformization of labour standards and of social policy instruments between the colonies and the metropoles, the 1947 conventions were still framed in a dualistic fashion that crystallized the "special conditions" of the "non-metropolitan territories". The interwar conventions were still in place. Symptomatically, one of the International Labour Office most pressing concerns was to invite imperial powers to ratify more interwar conventions and extend the limits of their application to the colonies possessed by those who already ratified them. The Portuguese government was increasingly isolated in this topic as the decade unfolded, with Belgians and French ratifying at different paces and still with reservations some of the interwar conventions. Obviously, the new efforts to address the social question coexisted with problems related to freedom at work. Also, the distrust regarding the growing internationalization

⁹Daniel Maul, *Human Rights, Development and Decolonization: The International Labour Organization, 1940-1970* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2012), 31-120. Gerry Rodgers, Eddy Lee, Lee Swepston, Jasmien Van Daele, *The ILO and the Quest for Social Justice, 1919-2009* (Geneva: International Labour Office, 2009), 139-170; Frederick Cooper, *Decolonization and African Society. The Labor Question in British and French Africa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 171-386.

of social practices and policies was unanimously shared by all imperial governments, although in varying degrees and generating different responses.¹⁰

The evolution of international debates on social policy on the colonies disturbed Portuguese authorities deeply, from imperial and colonial officials to representatives and experts at the international bodies. Unlike other colonial empires, the main legislation regulating the juridical and political status of the majority of native population remained untouched. Therefore, the crucial distinction between European and assimilated workers and indígenas ones did not suffer any substantial change. Crucially, the 1928 Código de Trabalbo Indígena was not subject of major alterations since its creation. All these instruments seemed perfectly appropriated for the particular conditions in the colonies. Therefore, the international efforts to apply the new international prescriptions to the colonies apparently did not pay attention to the "deep differences" between colonial territories and could only be the result of "deficient information or unawareness of fundamental principles," as one official from the Ministry of the Colonies stated. Even the interwar conventions should not be ratified, according to him. Regarding the Philadelphia declaration, for instance, he assured that it would apply perfectly to Portuguese legislation, so far it excluded the native populations. Establishing a clear-cut distinction of the "social evolution" of ethnic groups at the colonies, he concluded that "the same principles ... would not be equally applicable in both cases". For instance, allowing the existence of African representative unions would be "counterproductive" and "nefarious" given that these were "populations less socially apt to use them". The principles enshrined in the 1944 Philadelphia declaration were simply "anti-economical" and "anti-social". But even in what regarded forced labour, despite sustaining that it was "perfectly censured" by Portuguese legislation, the official suggested that between "the possible liberty to not work, enemy of all social progress, and forced labour enemy of humanity" the solution was to affirm that labour was mandatory, an "obligation of all men". Proof of the fulfilment of such obligation-a legally minimum period of work per year—should be made by all indígenas.^{II}

¹⁰Maul, *Human Rights*, 152-184.

^{II}Ministry of the Colonies, *Resposta ao questionário do relatório do Relatório preliminar da 29^a Sessão da Conferência Internacional do Trabalho (1946)*, 9 July 1946, Arquivo Histórico Diplomático (AHD)/MU/GM/GNP/RRI/0907/12133.

His was not a lonely voice. The new ILO orientation for the colonies was critically assessed by a plethora of actors within Portuguese imperial administration. In part, this generalized distrust was the result of the combination of economic and financial factors, such as metropolitan dependence on colonial markets and raw materials, administrative ones, given the fragility and limitations of the several Portuguese colonial "states", but also political and cultural ones, related to the authoritarian and extremely nationalistic and racialized nature of the Estado Novo regime and the obvious consequences for the limits of public debate on the imperial solution in its multiple dimensions. For instance, for Nunes de Oliveira, a technical advisor of the Portuguese delegation at the 1946 Montreal International Labour Conference and official at the Ministry of the Colonies, all the meetings there were characterized by a predominant "colonial prejudice". Workers' representatives were chiefly responsible for this situation: their pre-conceived ideas did not change in face of evident and "actual possibilities of application" of the principles debated. "Class spirit prevailed against the awareness of colonial realities", he wrote. But representatives from imperial governments were not spared. The expressed intention by a French delegate of turning all "natives citizens of the world" was belittled. The alleged subservience of the British governmental delegate to his fellow worker's representative was lamented. The same went with the fact that no coordination between imperial representatives was attempted. A common stance would have avoided or mitigated the path took in the meeting. The majority of the measures debated and later proposed were seen as "incompatible or hardly compatible" with "present realities" or those expected to prevail in the near future. Nunes de Oliveira was quite aware of the potential political implications of the transformations being promoted at Montreal, especially for a political regime that allowed no properly institutionalized channels where through the native population could express their grievances. Succinctly, the proclamation of the "more absolute principle of non-discrimination, whatever it is and without no reason", which would supress "all inequalities of a juridical, social, economic and cultural order", was understood to be closely connected to the desire to create an "atmosphere" where the conviction that "the opportunity to proclaim the end of the colonial period has come" prevailed. The nexus between the design and implementation of novel economic, social and cultural policies in the colonies and the political challenges to imperial sovereignty was clearly established. However, the changes envisaged were necessarily limited. Accordingly, Nunes de Oliveira suggested that new efforts of internationalization by the ILO should be blocked. But at least some conventions of the interwar years should be ratified.¹²

Portuguese authorities and representatives at these meetings had a particular privileged view about the transformations that the colonial question and associated debates suffered as a consequence of the war. This happened because Portugal was not participating, at least as a proper member-state, in other international fora such as the United Nations-the Soviets blocked Portuguese admission until 1955. Despite the shared anxiety and critical assessment of the direction these debates were taking, they nonetheless identified the political implications of social and economic questions and, as a consequence, added a sense of urgency to the need to resist further internationalization, while, at the same time, demanded some concessions, namely through the ratification of some interwar conventions. The ratification of the Convention No. 29, related to forced labour, was one example. Other concessions were related to the advancement of some, necessarily limited, reforms, and, crucially, to the development of new mechanisms of imperial self-scrutiny that could turn the relationship with organizations such as the ILO smoother and more efficient. The existing substantial gap between Portuguese legislation (and practices) and international standards, even if always publicly denied, was commonly identified as one obstacle to this strategy, as one official from the colonial ministry recalled.¹³

Even an old-time colonial expert, as José D'Almada, advisor for the Foreign Affairs ministry and a staunch opponent to the internationalization of imperial affairs, was sensitive about the evolving international environment that affected debates on imperial and colonial questions. D'Almada, who at-

¹²Report by J. Nunes de Oliveira, 30 October 1946, AHD, 3º piso armário 19 maço 100; *Relatório do Delegado do Governo e representante do Ministério das Colónias, J. Nunes de Oliveira*, AHD, 2º Piso, Armário 39, Maço 59.

¹³Report from Direcção Geral da Administração Política e Civil, Overseas Ministry, 8 July 1946, AHD/MU/GM/GNP/RRI/0907/12133. In some of the sources mobilized the name of the author is not explicit because it was not possible to identify the author through the existing signature. Given that this paper does not aim to provide a prosopography or the analysis of a single institution, to correlate the signature with the author would imply a more thorough research which would sacrifice what is the central aim of the article, that is, to track Portuguese official reactions to international and inter-imperial developments regarding labour and social policies.

tended the 1945 Paris International Labour Conference, regretted the disproportionate influence of associations such as the Phelps-Stoke Foundation or the Anti-Slavery Society.¹⁴ The latter influenced the decisions about labour policies and their aim appeared to be that "all Africa should be under international inspection and supervision." "Slavery" has been replaced by "labour," "instead of freedom, the talk is about free choice of work, minimum wages, abolition of discrimination between races, languages, religions," "the benevolent trusteeship" was replaced by "the associations of common interest, where natives predominate." Given this appraisal, he asked: "How far will colonial nations go to contemporize with the ideologies of philanthropic societies?"¹⁵

In other report, D'Almada echoed the words of Nunes de Oliveira. Measures prescribed in Paris were not of "easy application" as they did not respond to the "diverse conditions of civilization". Moreover, they were "ideological and not practical at all." The evaluation made by D'Almada is revealing. He was an educated colonial expert with an interwar experience dealing with significantly new historical and political contexts. His views reveal the acknowledgement, shared by many along the imperial administrative chain, of the manifest dissonance between what was being prescribed in international debates, one on hand, and the legislation and realities regarding labour in Portuguese colonies, on the other. Similarly revealing, however, was the widespread assumption that the Portuguese empire had to devise strategies to mitigate the impact of post-war transformations. Oldfashioned colonial methods would surely face hostile challenges in the postwar momentum. D'Almada urged that new and young administrative cadres should be part of the Portuguese delegations, given that "only them have a mentality adjusted to present circumstances;" labour inspectorates should be created as well as new instances of information gathering and management that would be responsible to study issues such as minimum wages or the preparation for agricultural workings. "Very special attention" was demanded for Angola and S. Tomé, where anomalies were "frequent" and "susceptible of inconvenient interpretations." The ratification of some of the in-

¹⁴Regarding the historical relationship between these two associations and the Portuguese empire, see Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, *The Portuguese Civilising Mission*.

¹⁵Report, *"A propósito da reunião do BIT em Paris – Outubro de 1945"*, José D'Almada, Ministry of Foreign Affairs. AHD, 3º Piso, Armário 19, Maço 100.

terwar conventions was also advocated. As a corollary of the association between international developments and the need to organize a proper informational imperial order, D'Almada recommended a new body to be created within the orbit of the Ministry of the Colonies in order to gather, treat, organize information and, finally, to manage its submission to the International Labour Organization.¹⁶

Some of these suggestions were clearly the product of what D'Almada described as a sudden and radical transformation of world order. And they did not materialize. No new department for dealing exclusively with the ILO was created and, just a couple of years later, the author would radically revert its position regarding Portuguese integration vis-à-vis international labour standards, in part as a result of the new bargaining opportunities opened up to imperial governments by the crystallization and deepening of bipolar rivalries associated to the emerging Cold War. However, some initiatives can be traced within the Portuguese imperial administration that aimed to tackle the challenges posed by the new global political context. The creation of the Inspecção Superior dos Negócios Indígenas (High-Inspectorate for Native Affairs) in 1946 was one of them. The inspection was part of the organic of the Ministry of the Colonies and paralleled the already existent High-Inspectorate of the Colonial Administration. It was responsible for the study of "all questions related to the political and economic interests of Portuguese colonies' natives as well as the supervision of the ways by which laws and decrees regarding their political, civil and criminal statute are executed".¹⁷ This was part of a broader and gradual process of rationalization of imperial administration that was *also* envisaged as a mean to counter accusations from abroad, and to give substance and effectiveness to Portuguese claims of imperial legitimacy internationally.¹⁸

¹⁶*Relatório (Missão a Paris, CIT, 15 de Outubro a 6 de Novembro de 1945),* José D'Almada, AHD/MU/GM/GNP/RRI/0907/12133.

¹⁷Decreto-Lei 35962, Diário do Governo, n.º 264/1946, Série I de 1946-11-20. Available in https://dre.pt/application/file/149526 (accessed in October 2016).

¹⁸Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, "A Modernizing Empire? Politics, Culture and Economy in Portuguese Late Colonialism," in Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, eds., *The Ends of European Colonial Empires: Cases and Comparisons* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2015), 51-80.

3. Imperial self-scrutiny and the limits of social and political imaginations of reform

The creation of a specialized body for "native affairs" constituted a revealing evidence that Portuguese authorities had no intention to overcome the political and juridical distinction between citizens and *indígenas*. It also had implications in the so regarded "native labour" policies. That was quite evident in a report made by the above-mentioned High Inspectorate and sent to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, where the major questions regarding "native affairs" were approached. A paternalist mind-set about the "native worker" persisted. Improvements in the processes of recruitment were necessary not to guarantee freedom at work but to provide "a rational organization of labour ... aiming for a higher yield and economy of native manpower". Additionally, it was argued that "more latitude was needed in the mobilization of compelled work for public services." The efforts to prevent abuses were limited and consisted on the assurance of payment of correctional work or on a more tightened control of employers' abuses.¹⁹

The limits of the changes prescribed were also the result of the actual labour and social realities on colonial territories. The inspectorate and its officials had privileged access to information about what was going on locally. During these years, the most pressing concerns were focused on S. Tomé e Príncipe, especially on the so-called *serviçais*, the Angolan and Mozambican native workers that had been sent to the archipelago.²⁰ The conditions of transportation of these workers, the common infractions by the state and private companies that did not assure their repatriation, or proper working and living conditions at the plantations, were some of its most damaging aspects.²¹

¹⁹Letter sent from the High-Inspectorate for Native Affairs (henceforth HINA) to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, AHD, 2° piso armário 49 maço 1.

²⁰See, among others Zachary Kagan-Guthrie "Repression and Migration: Forced Labour Exile of Mozambicans to São Tomé, 1948–1955," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 37 (3) (2011): 449-462. See also Augusto Nascimento, *Desterro e contrato: Moçambicanos a caminbo de S. Tómé e Príncipe (anos 1940-1960)* (Maputo: Arquivo Histórico de Moçambique, 2002).

²¹Report HINA, encarregado de organização, 2 April 1947, Compilation of Reports of the High Inspectorate for Colonial Administration, Arquivo Histórico do Institututo Português de Apoio ao Desenvolvimento (AHIPAD), 1947. Report HINA, encarregado de serviços, 18 September 1947, Compilation of Reports of the High Inspectorate for Colonial Administration, AHIPAD, 1947. As referred above, and especially related to the compilation of the reports at AHIPAD, frequently the authors' name is not typewritten.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

On Private Coercive Power in Angola: Towards a Comparative Approach

Teresa Furtado IPRI / FCSH-UNL

O^N 14 MARCH 1961, João Pereira Neto, an inspector of the Office of Political Affairs at the Overseas Ministry, wrote a report in which he tried to expose the "remote cause" of the anti-colonial revolts that had taken place earlier that year at the Baixa de Cassange reserve, in Angola.¹ Pereira Neto had visited the cotton-growing area of Cassange the previous summer, where he noticed the "existence of food scarcity" and the "highly unfavorable conditions" of the labour market, controlled by the Companhia Geral dos Algodões de Angola (COTONANG).² At a time when multiple critiques made against another concessionary company working in the colony, the Companhia de Diamantes de Angola (DIAMANG), were gaining international resonance,³ Pereira Neto considered that the cotton-growing scheme was infinitely more inhumane and oppressive:

Assuming that the real salary of the contracted worker, including housing and food, clothing and transportation, medical assistance, etc., is therefore the triple



^IConcerning the Baixa do Cassange revolt, see Diogo Ramada Curto, dir., Bernardo Pinto da Cruz and Teresa Furtado, eds., *Políticas coloniais em tempo de revoltas–Angola circa 1961* (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 2016), 151-188; Diogo Ramada Curto, Bernardo Pinto da Cruz, "Terror e saberes coloniais: Notas acerca dos incidentes na Baixa de Cassange, janeiro e fevereiro de 1961," In Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, ed., *O Império Colonial em Questão (séc. XIX-XX). Poderes, saberes e instituições* (Lisboa: Edições 70, 2013), 3-35; Dalila Cabrita Mateus and Álvaro Mateus, *Angola 61–Guerra Colonial: Causas e Consequências* (Alfragide: Textos Editores, 2011), 42-57; Aida Freudenthal, "A Baixa de Cassanje. Algodão e revolta," *Revista Internacional de Estudos Africanos* 18-22 (1995-1999): 245-283.

²AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto n.º 41: Considerações sobre a cultura algodoeira da Baixa do Cassange,"

³Gilberto Freyre, Aventura e rotina: sugestões de uma viagem a procura das constantes portuguesas de caráter e ação (Rio de Janeiro: Livraria José Olympio Editora, 1953); Nuno Porto, Modos de objectificação da dominação colonial: O caso do Museu do Dundo, 1940-1970 (Lisboa: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, 2009), 502-515.

of the monthly monetary fraction he earns, and knowing that the latter is the double of the medium wage of a farmer working at the Baixa, one must conclude that any worker employed by DIAMANG (...) earns, just by doing his job, a real salary at least six times higher than the profit a family of cotton-growing farmers of the Baixa de Cassange gets in a year.⁴

Even at the much attacked DIAMANG, where not all women work, they still plough the earth whose products are sold to the Company. In turn this provides them with profits that are equivalent or superior to the ones they would get if they executed any other task (...). This way, the head of the family's income, added to that of the women's plowings is still much higher than the one a Baixa de Cassange's farmer earns.⁵

Is it possible to make a comparative exercise similar to the one Pereira Neto was doing at the time? Drawing on official documents produced by Portuguese colonial bureaucracy, can we compare the private operations of control and welfare provided by those two entrepreneurial organizations?

The resorting of private companies to forced labour was a normal practice during Portuguese colonialism. Even though there were variations in the ways this scheme was implemented, in the areas where those companies operated it marked the rhythm and physical demand of the African lives. A larger comparative study of the African experience within each of these capitalist environments in Angola is yet to be done. The secret report of Pereira Neto sheds some light over the possibility of finding some new research avenues. This is because his comparison was not naïve: DIAMANG was, as recent studies recognize, the biggest and most bureaucratized company working in colonial Angola.

This article aims to compare these two colonial companies, regarding not only their internal administration and coercive supervision of the African labour but also their autonomy and infrastructural capacity during the late Portuguese colonial empire. The first part of this study attempts to establish a dialogue between some institutional variables, such as population's mobility, private propaganda mechanisms, corporate health programs and internal coercive dispositives. The second section draws on the correspondence between Ernesto Vilhena, member of DIAMANG's administration, and Oliveira Salazar, the Portuguese dictator, to assess the internal capacity of this

⁴AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 25.

⁵AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 27.

mining company to defend, *quasi*-autonomously, its territory. Such analysis always presents some theoretical and empirical problems when one tries to reach a conclusive argument. These lacunae, as well as some new avenues of research, are highlighted in the conclusion.

"Take Care of the Angolan Worker": forced labour and welfare private paternalist practices and discourses

Pereira Neto's timid praise to DIAMANG could have been sustained on the company's annual reports to the Portuguese state. There we find the same kind of socio-economic concerns, especially in those issued by the company's internal agency in charge of indigenous welfare in the domains of personal and domestic hygiene and agricultural production-the SPAMOI (Serviços de Propaganda e Apoio à Mão-de-Obra Indígena / Services of Propaganda and Support to the Indigenous Labour Force). First there was a clear biopolitical concern, which grew stronger during the course of the 50s and 60s, related to the physical development of African miners. In the aforesaid reports, that were supposed to inform the State on the current situation of the mining industry and internal welfare policies, some sections analyzed only the health conditions of mining workers.⁶ Since the late 1920s, following what had already been applied in other colonial mining companies, DIAMANG used the Pignet Index in order to classify the African aptitude to diamond extraction. The assessment aimed at dividing the newcomers into five biological categories: very strong, strong and good, acceptable, weak and very weak.7 In theory, those who belonged to the final category were to re-

⁶As stated by Jorge Varanda, in 1921 the company's health services had only one doctor. Eight years later, in 1929, there were 2 doctors, 7 European nurses and 20 indigenous "nurses," educated and trained by DIAMANG. This growth continued and in 1945 the health staff of DIAMANG was composed by 6 doctors, 30 European nurses, a certified native nurse, 17 nurse assistants and 161 medical auxiliaries. By the end of 1950s there were 59 European at DIAMANG's health services, 17 of which were doctors. But perhaps more symptomatic of the health infrastructural apparatus is the growing number of sanitary installations: «in the first decade of the company's operations, five health facilities were created: three hospitals, a dispensary and a health post. This number would rise to 31 in 1935, reaching 94 in 1962 and 133 in the 1970s along with eleven hospitals, eight maternities, four nursing wards, two dispensaries, 14 health posts and 94 emergency posts», Jorge Varanda, "A saúde e a Companhia de Diamantes de Angola," *História, Ciências e Saúde-Manguinbos* II (2004): 261-268 *maxim* 263.

⁷For a more in-depth study about the uses of the Pignet Index in Diamang: Jorge Varanda and Todd Cleveland, "(Un)healthy Relationships: African Labourers, Profits and

turn to their home villages. Those considered "weak" were retained in the Dundo area, inside the district of Lunda (where the company had been established) and then submitted to prophylactic treatments before a new round of evaluation.⁸ This biomedical classifications were incited by Serviços de Saúde da Diamang (Diamang Health Services Division), which, in the words of Jorge Varanda and Todd Cleveland, "played a mediative role between the company's profits-driven directors and the enormous African work force."⁹ Weight, for instance, was also measured on a yearly basis, but the measurements revealed that the company had an interest in observing the physical propensity and capacity to work, but also the effects of the labour contract on the physical body of African workers. In 1950, by the time they fulfilled their contracts, 75.57% of a sample of 3552 contracted workers had gained or at least maintained their weights "in manifest conditions of robustness and physical capacity."¹⁰ In 1963, 13.1% maintained the initial weight and 69.8% had gained (from a total of 7517 workers).¹¹

At COTONANG, malnutrition and the absence of healthcare provision to the African population were attributed to the company's incompetence. For instance, the distribution of medicine was sporadic and seen only as a matter of propaganda.¹² Along with the lack of technical support and excessive workload, a system of incentives to administrative authorities was cre-

⁹According to the authors that "mediative role" was a consequence of the strain that SSD experienced since "medical staff were pressured to clear physically questionable recruits, and mine managers to deny medical absences even to ailing or injured labourers, as part of the company's relentless drive for profits" (Varanda and Cleveland, "(Un)healthy Relationships," 88); Cf. Jorge Varanda, "Crossing Colonies and Empires: The Health Services of the Diamond Company of Angola," in Anne Digby, Walter Ernst and Projut Muhkarji, eds., *Crossing Colonial Historiographies: Histories of Colonial and Indigenous Medicines in Transnational Perspective* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010), 165-184.

¹⁰ANTT/AOS/D-N/2/5/I; Arquivo Salazar, UL-8A3, cx.715, ptI–Companhia de Diamantes de Angola, "Relatório do Conselho de Administração e Parecer do Conselho Fiscal relativo ao exercício de 1950," 52.

^{II}ANTT/AOS/D-N/2/5/I; Arquivo Salazar, UL-8A3, cx.715, ptI, Companhia de Diamantes de Angola, "Resumo dos Trabalhos," 64.

¹²AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 40.

Health Services in Angola's Colonial-Era Diamond Mines, 1917–75,"*Medical History* 58 (I) (January 2014): 87-105.

⁸ANTT/AOS/D-N/2/5/1; Arquivo Salazar, UL-8A3, cx.715, ptI, Companhia de Diamantes de Angola, "Resumo dos Trabalhos realizados e Estudos obtidos em 1963," 62.

ated in order to achieve higher cotton production levels.¹³ According to the contract established with the Portuguese state, the corporation was authorized to compensate rural foremen (capatazes) who stimulated and oriented the development of the cotton sector. In reality, however, a perverse change occurred within this scheme, which worked to reward financially the authorities who received a share of the extracted cotton, linking them directly to the amount of cotton produced by the Africans. Consequently, they became more interested in increasing African production than in enforcing the contractual provisions. This reality was not ignored by other players within the Angolan cotton sector, like the Cotton Export Board (Junta de Exportações de Algodão-JEA). Notwithstanding, JEA focused on the behavior and methods of the official authorities rather than on the illegal financial counterpart COTONANG was providing them. The board admitted that one of the leading causes of worker discontent was precisely the way state officials were acting, but considered that it was not an exclusive phenomenon of the Baixa de Cassange reserve:14

One must instead bear in mind that in many aspects of the relations between white and black people, and, more precisely, in the relations between administrative authorities and the indigenous, some processes were unleashed that cannot actually remain, once analyzed according to a scale of human values of certain elevation. It is a whole acting mentality of the Portuguese white in Africa that must be reshaped and it is always within this criterion that the cotton system's flaws must be framed."¹⁵

It was in a situation of total abandonment that Pereira Neto found those peoples "left to themselves" trying to "rest in their free time, without caring

¹³Concerning the lack of technical support given by the Companhia Geral dos Algodões de Angola, it is curious to read the way Dias dos Santos, Chief of the Angolan Delegation of the Cotton Export Board, defended himself in a letter sent to the President of the same agency: "If there are faults of our responsibility, because one does not oversee nor properly guides the choice of lands, because the insecticides were not introduced in every zone, because the soil is not fertilized or the mechanization not yet generalized, such flaws are present all over the African continent and in every crop culture, since technical backwardness is a characteristic element of African agriculture," PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN / I464/05765, J. M. Dias dos Santos, "Política Indígena," sd, 3.

¹⁴PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J. M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961– Causas Determinantes do mau-estar dos agricultores da Baixa do Cassange," 17 April 1961, 4.

¹⁵PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J. M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961," 3.

about the consequences that derive from that repose."¹⁶ The inspector's suspicion was confirmed by a medical account. The health post of Quela had collected blood samples from the COTONANG workers, revealing very low levels of riboflavin. Curiously, the concern expressed by the overseas official was shared by DIAMANG, even though in the latter the rationale was clearly racist. In an early report of 1939, where the reasons to incentive the Africans to work their own cultures were advanced, it was felt that the indigenous people "eat enough not to die. If they do not eat more, it is because they do not have enough, and if they do not have it, it is because laziness cancels out all their other initiatives."¹⁷ It was thus important to lead the African in a fight against innate indolence. All of this was perceived, by DIAMANG's corporate agents, as a matter of slow and enduring propaganda work, especially targeted to African women.

The action must be continuous, persistent, shaping them to the complex psychology of the native, or better, of the indigenous woman, since we count on her to carry out the work of SPAMOI, which began in 1937. Rather than compelling, we must convince. The will, the persistence, the patience are needed to lead a variety of races who live side by side in the same environment, with all their beliefs and superstitions, habits, the most of them prejudicial. It is a work of consciousness, permanent, which extends to the handling of varied complaints so often unclear.¹⁸

At DIAMANG, the women were in fact expected to take care of domestic agricultural crops. The rationality behind the division of labour was of two sorts: not only to guarantee a greater availability of male workers to the mines, but also as a means to foster the settlement of populations in the villages within the mining reserve. Obviously this was also a compulsory work that met 'biological standards'. The workers' wives mainly carried out three tasks within the mining plot: agricultural work, kitchen service and village

¹⁶PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J.M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961," 23-24.

¹⁷AUC/DIAMANG Digital, A.C.Figueira Júnior, "Serviços de Propaganda e Assistência à Mão-de-Obra Indígena, Relatório Anual 1939," 8 February 1940, 8.

¹⁸AUC/DIAMANG Digital, J. Rebelo, "Secção de Propaganda e Assistência à Mão-de-Obra Indígena, Relatório Anual de 1945," 29 January 1946, 1.

cleaning.¹⁹ For the former two, chosen women would be those who presented "better physical capacity," a reason that concurred for the variation of agricultural plantations on a yearly basis.²⁰ But the surveillance over women was far from unchallenged. For example, as early as 1939, the employees of SPAMOI estimated that only 10% of the women assigned to these tasks managed to pass the company's monitoring process. Domestic farming should allow women to contribute to the family subsistence and to obtain some income by selling the surplus to the company. By doing this,

the families will have to buy certain products by which they exchange today their food portions, they will buy commodities at the warehouses and then advertise them in their lands, they will acquire certain civilized habits that they will not be able to retain at the home village, they will become interested in the land where they have their biggest crop cultures and, finally, many of them will prefer to settle here.²¹

This policy of incentives to population resettlement was just a small part of a vast array of propaganda dispositives deployed by DIAMANG. The Lunda district suffered from a chronic low population density. Within the state concessionary zone, the company could hire any individual and force him to work in the mines. These were called "voluntary workers." Nonetheless, labour resources were not sufficient to satisfy the mining demand. Soon, the state also became a partner in routinizing forced labour outside the zone of exclusive recruitment, where DIAMANG ruled and had exclusive rights for the contracting of workers. The administrative agents, along with "cipaios" (guards) and traditional authorities, reunited the workers from all over Lunda and neighbour districts of Malange and Moxico, transporting them to

¹⁹For a more detailed study about the participation of women in DIAMANG's labour process see Todd Cleveland, "Rock Solid: African Labourers on the Diamond Mines of the Companhia de Diamantes de Angola (DIAMANG), 1917-1975," PhD Dissertation (Faculty of Graduate School of the University of Minnesota, Minnesota 2008), 123-130.

²⁰In a SPAMOI Report of 1950 one can read: "Similar to previous years, these women had mainly tasks until 10am–village cleaning, where they live with their husbands, and agricultural crop growing for their subsistence. In the latter, the best physically endowed women were used" (AUC/DIAMANG Digital, Canhão Veloso, "Secção de Propaganda e Assistência à Mão-de-Obra Indígena, Relatório Anual de 1950," 22 January 1951, 5-6).

^{2I}AUC/DIAMANG Digital, A. C. Figueira Júnior, "Serviços de Propaganda e Assistência à Mão-de-Obra Indígena, Relatório Anual 1937," 9 January 1938, 10-11.

the company's mining posts.²² Corporate bureaucracy called them "contract workers" and they were the principal targets of propaganda. Women were seen as a vital part of the workforce stabilization process. From the viewpoint of the corporate bureaucracy those workers who were accompanied by their women and children were more likely to stay in the company after fulfilling their contracts.²³ Many incentives were used to convince them to stay in the DIAMANG concession. One of the strategies, among many others, was the creation of a network of "indigenous collectors": ex-contract workers who had opted to remain at the service of the mining company and persuaded other African workers of the advantages of continuing their occupation as voluntary labour.²⁴ In exchange these middlemen received some gratifications. The goal was to create a network of agents who, "guided by interest and using their own example, would constitute an effective propaganda instrument."²⁵

Nothing of the sort happened with COTONANG.²⁶ The company enjoyed a different kind of demographic framework where the majority of the

²³Varanda and Cleveland, "(Un)healthy Relationships,"94; Curto, Cruz and Furtado, *Políticas coloniais*, 224-225.

²²Concerning the recruitment process and the intervention of official authorities therein, cf. Cleveland, "Rock Solid," 42-50; Todd Cleveland, *Diamonds in the Rough: Corporate Paternalism and African Professionalism on the Mines of Colonial Angola, 1917-1975* (Ohio: Ohio University Press, 2015); Alexander Keese, "Searching for the Reluctant Hands: Obsession, Ambivalence and the Practice of Organising Involuntary Labour in Colonial Cuanza-Sul and Malange Districts, Angola, 1926-1945," *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 41 (2) (2013): 238-258. Charles Perrings, "Good Lawyers but Poor Workers': Recruited Angolan Labour in the Copper Mines of Katanga, 1917-1921," *The Journal of African History* 18 (2) (1977): 237-259.

²⁴With the abolition of the Estatuto do Indigenato (Indigenous/Native Special Law) in 1961, the categories of DIAMANG workers suffered a substantial change. Similar to what had happened with the official documents of public administration, the nomenclature "indigenous" was eliminated. The corporate bureaucracy begins to name the African by "native" and the "assimilated" by "advanced" ("evoluído"). The remaining workers, the majority of them working in the mines or in agricultural fields, comprise the category of the "ordinary workforce". Within the latter, the two previous subcategories remain essentially unchanged, although renamed: voluntary workers are now "regional workers" and contracted workers by state intervention become just "contracted." ANTT/AOS/D-N/2/5/I, Arquivo Salazar, UL-8A3, cx.715, pt.I; Companhia de Diamantes de Angola, "Resumo dos Trabalhos," 42-43.

²⁵AUC/DIAMANG Digital, A.C.Figueira Júnior, "Serviços de Propaganda," 9 February 1938, 4.

district of Malange's population traditionally lived off cotton growing. This allowed for a great initial internal forced displacement of Africans from villages to the vast plain of the Baixa do Cassange. In 1960 it was estimated that 120 thousand Africans lived there.

All the Baixa is considered a labour pool reserve, so nobody can contract natives there and they are not allowed to leave the region, the administrative stations standing near the places where it is easier to access the impressive cliff of six hundred meters high. Moreover, African policemen (cipaios) were posted to the principal centers, so that they can catch any native who flees to become somebody else's employee.²⁷

The recruitment of natives inside the concessionary zone was exclusive to the company. No other enterprise had the legal right to hire there, and no African was authorized to work outside the cotton system.²⁸ Violence in COTONANG was transversal, that is, it became a question embedded in the native's daily lives. Worker categorization obeyed a different criteria: "farmers" were all valid male "rural workers between 18 and 55 years-old" to whom arable lands ranging from 10 thousand and 12 thousand square meters were assigned; "cultivators" comprised those elder male workers (56 to 60 years-old), widows, divorced and single women responsible for working a maximum area of 5 thousand square meters. This information is presented in a report of the Angolan Delegation of the Cotton Sector Board

²⁶In the mining compounds of Southern Rhodesia the coercive apparatus to control and "stabilize" the labour force was, at least, profoundly ruthless. A credit system was created in order to extend the African contract period. In furtherance of having accesses to products like meat, fish, beer or even drugs, the African worker had to incur in debt with the mine stores, which were under the control of the mining corporations. To pay them back workers were forced to stay longer periods in the mines. For an exhaustive historical study about the recruitment and living conditions inside mining system in southern Rhodesia, but also concerning the patterns of resistance among African miners, see Charles von Onselen, *Chibaro. African Mine Labour in Southern Rhodesia, 1900-1933* (Johannesburg: Ravan Press, 1976).

²⁷AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 2-3.

²⁸Concerning the forced cotton system in Mozambique, mainly the way traditional authorities were co-opt into the scheme of compulsory crop and labour recruitment, see: Allen Isaacman, "Chiefs, Rural Differentiation and Peasant Protest: The Mozambican Forced Cotton Regime 1938-1961," *African Economic History* no. 14 (1985), 15-56. See also Allen Isaacman, *Cotton is the Mother of Poverty: Peasants, Work, and Rural Struggle in Colonial Mozambique, 1938-1961*, Social History of Africa series (Portsmouth: NH: Heinemann, 1996).

160

and corresponded to legal directives.²⁹ Pereira Neto noted a "situation of impressive inequality" the population was facing, mainly when compared to "other Angolan natives who had the fortune of not had been born in that area". One can say that the misery of the Baixa's African population represented a clear comparative advantage to the company in contrast to the remaining colonial corporate sector.

If to the indigenous farmers it brings only disadvantages, it is on the contrary extremely advantageous to the concessionary company. The latter is in fact in a situation that is tremendously advantageous in relation to other corporate entities in Angola as, on top of benefitting from other advantages, it assures a workforce that can be around 20 times cheaper than that which the others can obtain.³⁰

Besides, the company itself admitted that in certain zones cotton productivity was extremely low. Even though there were no incentives for the maintenance of the business in those areas, they were seen as "buffer zones" separating free cultivated areas from the concessionary reserve. Thus, Africans were forced to work them regardless of their low productivity and consequently earned even lower wages.³¹

It is necessary to stress that these observations circulated only within the closed network of the state's administrative elite. The uprisings that occurred there created an incentive to undertake more thorough studies of the region. COTONANG's lack of investments in the mechanization of the cotton sector was one of the main critiques that were advanced. It was considered that an increase in the mechanical and technical capacities of the company, namely in the preparation of the terrains, would allow cotton extraction to be executed only by women. Therefore, "a majority of that enormous mass of more than 30 thousand African peasants" could be contracted by other companies, bringing a double benefit from the state's viewpoint: not only would it increase family income in Baixa, it would also help solving the problem of workforce scarcity in other places of the colony,

²⁹AHD/GNP/RNP/0074/01119, Junta de Exportação do Algodão Delegação de Angola, "Elementos de informação sobre as actividades da Junta de Exportação do Algodão atinentes à valorização económica das zonas algodoeiras e da sua contribuição social e sanitária para o bem-estar das populações rurais indígenas," 24 April 1953, 17.

³⁰AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 27-28.

³¹PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J.M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961," 4-5.

namely in the "neighbouring councils of [the Angolan] Congo."³² With respect to this socioeconomic suggestion, COTONANG responded with a familiar humanist and communitarian discourse. Along with the delegation of the Cotton Export Board, it considered that the extension of labour recruitment rights to other corporations in the Baixa would lead to "the disaggregation of familiar and tribal bonds (...) in that zone."

In an official statement sent to the Governor-General of Angola it emphasized that the latter would represent a loss to the concessionary interests: "and because the interests of that company seem to us, in the case under scrutiny, coincident with the general interests," even if it could also stand "at odds with certain sectors of the public opinion."33 Nonetheless, the Board did not deny "the often inhuman conditions" under which, in a recent past, certain natives were compelled to work in the cotton industry.³⁴ However, the Board defended COTONANG concerning any responsibility in the problems of Baixa de Cassange, by pointing out the structural constraints of the region. It maintained that one of the leading causes of indigenous unease was to be found in the civic combat the company had been waging against certain ancestral sexist habits. The corporation had imposed "a new condition on men-that of a farmer-and such a change encountered strong opposition from the native side," since they used to delegate the agricultural tasks to their women and perform "more noble missions" such as "waging war and hunting."35 This kind of narrative was not new nor was it exclusive to the company. It belonged to the older strategy of linking men with innate indolence. The humanist and paternalist discourse of defending familiar aboriginal nuclei was common both to the entrepreneurial elite and the colonial state engaged with programs for concentrating African populations -a feature found in the revisions of the colonial penal system as well as in the program for the rural reordering and the creation of *regedorias*.³⁶ Thus it

- ³⁴PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J.M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961," 3.
- ³⁵PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RRN/1464/05765, J.M. Dias dos Santos, "Informação nº38/961," 2.

³²AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 31.

³³AHU/MU/GM/GNP/160/Pt.2S, João Pereira Neto, "Apontamento Secreto," 43.

³⁶Diogo Ramada Curto e Bernardo Pinto da Cruz, "Destribalização, regedorias e desenvolvimento comunitário: notas acerca do pensamento colonial português (1910-1965)," *Práticas da História, Journal on Theory, Historiography and Uses of the Past* I (I) (2015), 113-172. Curto, Cruz and Furtado, *Políticas coloniais*, 199-220.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

The (Re)ordering of the Empire: On the Development of Control

50

On the "Efficiency" of Civilization: Politics, Religion and the Native Settlement in Portuguese Africa in the 1940s¹

Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra

Hugo Gonçalves Dores Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra

N 1949, THE INSPECTOR of colonial education of Mozambique, Manuel Ferreira Rosa, prepared a legal proposal that addressed the possibility of enlarging the economic activities of the overseas religious missions, with a view to enhance their civilizing project. The proposal aimed to clarify categorically that the terms of the so-called Statute of João Belo (1926), regarding the commercial activities that were permitted to the missions, were outlawed by the dispositions of the Missionary Agreement (1940) and of the Missionary Statute (1941). According to Ferreira Rosa, in the case of the missions belonging to religious congregations (subjected to a vow of poverty), the incomes from their activities (agriculture, commerce, industry, and crafts) could contribute to the enactment of the proclaimed nationalizing and *civilizing* purposes of missionary work. The creation of schools, boarding schools, and sanitary posts, among others realizations, were the means to achieve those goals. The proposal prompted the Minister of the Colonies, Teófilo Duarte, to request the opinion of the Provincial Superiors of the religious institutes working overseas (and recognized by the Portuguese State) about the question of native settlements ("aldeamentos indígenas").²

© 2017 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved



^IThis text is a result of the research project "Change to Remain? Welfare Colonialism in European Colonial Empires in Africa (1920-1975)," funded by the Portuguese Foundation for Science and Technology (Ref: IF/0I628/2012), under the Strategic Plan UID/SOC/50012/2013.

²Proposal No. I, by Manuel Ferreira Rosa, 20 October 1948; AHU/I438/IB/MU/DGEdu / 1946-62 – Folder DGEnsino/ Process No. 511/ Section C: "Aldeamentos Indígenas. Verbas do Ensino e Exercício do Comércio." For the *Statute of Missions*, issued by the Minister of the Colonies, João Belo, see Hugo Gonçalves Dores, *A Missão da República. Política, religião e o*

Teófilo Duarte's plan was to reinforce the debate about the settlement of native populations in the African colonial territories (and also in East-Timor), which was seen as an important part of the colonial development strategy. As others colonial experts and officials (Duarte had been colonial governor in Cape-Verde and Timor in the 1920s), the minister had his own ideas about these settlements and about the related concentrationary logic. He had publicly presented his impressions back in 1941 and 1942. First, in his views about a proposed law (bill) on native villages, formulated by the Minister Vieira Machado. Afterwards, in an article on the concentrationary initiatives by Jesuit missionaries in Brazil and Paraguay during the early modern period, entitled "A concentração populacional indígena e os jesuítas" ("The concentration of indigenous population and the Jesuits"), published in four issues of the journal O Mundo Português, a joint edition publication by the Secretariado da Propaganda Nacional (National Propaganda Secretariat) and the Agência Geral das Colónias (General Agency of the Colonies). In itself a revealing fact, this article would be forwarded to the missionaries, since it should be used as the starting point of the debate about the policy to be devised. The minister's perspective on the history and alternatives solutions of native villagization, namely those based on a positive assessment of the Jesuits experiments, should guide the process.³

It was clear that he intended to give a pivotal role to Catholic missionaries in the colonial project, in spite of what some of his peers advocated. In that article, Teófilo Duarte addressed the historical process of population settlements implemented by the Society of Jesus in Brazil and Paraguay: the *aldeamentos* (villages) and the *reduciones* (reductions), respectively. Considering that the Jesuits had achieved "exceptional results" in their two models of strategic native settlements, their example could and should be analyzed in

império colonial português em África (1910-1926) (Lisbon: Edições 70, 2015). For the 1940 Concordat see Rita Almeida de Carvalho, *A Concordata de Salazar* (Lisbon: Temas e Debates, 2013).

³Teófilo Duarte, "A concentração populacional indígena e os jesuítas," *O Mundo Português* IX (102) (1942): 249-259, IX (103) (1942): 305-314; IX (104-105) (1942): 343-357; IX (106) (1942): 407-415. For more on Teófilo Duarte's colonial views see his *Estudos coloniais* (Lisbon: Agência Geral das Colónias, 1942). For the Jesuit missions – in an endless bibliography – see a new synthesis by Thomas M. Cohen and Emanuele Colombo, "Jesuit Missions," in Hamish Scott, ed., *The Oxford Handbook of Early Modern European History, 1350-1750* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), II (*Cultures and Power*): 254-279, esp. 259-260 and 263-266.

detail and replicated in contemporary contexts with the necessary adjustments. The scrutiny of the inner-workings and (positive) consequences of these two models should, therefore, be a priority. The "repetition of [past] mistakes" should be avoided, especially those related to material and economic aspects, as Duarte emphasized. The villages and the reductions were nonetheless seen as exemplary models to follow, as they would facilitate "catechesis"—"in a permanent and not intermittent way"—and, as importantly, they would contribute to "the material and social progress of populations." There, these populations would acquire "processes of labor" from the Europeans and would finally reach a "life of [social] relations." Both were the *sine qua non* for "civilization". Duarte praised the Jesuit settlement planning in comparison to "mobile missions" model. Sedentism was mandatory. The "permanent settlement of natives" was an imperative, from a political (i. e. securitarian) and religious point of view.⁴

The dispersion of native populations, at the time as in the past, entailed unquestionable inconveniences. The most noteworthy of them was the fact that dispersion caused a "reduced efficiency" in educational, medical, judicial, and religious activities. The "efficiency" of civilization projects was related to the efficacy of a successful concentrationary policy. So far, dispersion was only mitigated by the "necessities of manpower" that originated significant "inflows" of natives. Duarte expected that the "resistances to overcome" would be numerous, from those sustained by the colonists, the regular clergy, and the natives to those related to the problem of labor. The comparative assessment of both solutions should be carried on again, and one of them should be applied. The *aldeamentos* had the advantage of being "solidary pieces of a political and social organization" for the imperial and colonial states. On the contrary, the reductions were seen as a "state within the state," "autonomous cysts" that formed a "theocratic society." Despite this fact it should not be, in any way, devalued as a possibility.⁵

Since the late nineteenth-century, Jesuit ideas and past projects had been debated within Catholic missionary circles as models for future plans. The establishment of the so-called *Chrétientés* had a long and heterogeneous genealogy (which continues today). The debate about the multi-purpose

⁴Duarte, "A concentração populacional," 250-251.

⁵Duarte, "A concentração populacional," 249, 344.

"civilizing stations" in the 1870s and 1880s echoed some of these concentrationary strategies.⁶ The diverse modalities of Christian villages—certainly equivalents to that of the reductions-, which aimed to "socially engineer Christian communities," also had other expressions.⁷ Cardinal Charles Lavigerie, the archbishop of Algiers and founder of the Society of the Missionaries of Africa (White Fathers) envisaged such endeavours for Algeria and for East Africa.⁸ In north-eastern Tanganyika, by 1896, there were fifty-two Christian villages connected to mission stations, essentially based on freed slaves (ransomed by the missionaries or entrusted by the British consul in Zanzibar).9 Missionaries' "paternalism" and "rigidity" led to many complaints and revolts. The villagers wanted more autonomy and "payment for their work." In the report that assessed the state of affairs in early 1880s, the reporter A. Le Roy wrote that the "system was too Utopian, too much like the 'phalanstery' of the early French socialists which had failed elsewhere in the world." The recommendations of the report, strongly influenced by Le Play, reinforced the interrelation between two cornerstones, as Le Roy explained in his Address at the 1896 Congrès d'Economie Sociale: the "Ten Commandments and Paternal Authority."10 Other similar experiments to develop Christian towns were carried out by Daniele Comboni and by his missionary project in Sudan, in El Obeid (North Kurdufan), in a context of outright religious competition.^{II} In Spanish Equatorial Guinea, since the late nineteenth-century, the Spanish Claretian missionaries had organized

⁶See Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, "Religion, Empire, and the Diplomacy of Colonialism: Portugal, Europe, and the Congo Question, ca. 1820–1890," PhD Thesis (King's College, University of London, 2008), 114-115, 117-119.

⁷See David Maxwell, "Freed Slaves, Missionaries, and Respectability: The Expansion of the Christian Frontier from Angola to Belgian Congo," *The Journal of African History* 54 (I) (2013): 79-102 [79].

⁸Jean-Claude Ceillier, *Histoire des Missionaires d'Afrique (Pères Blancs)*. De la foundation par Mgr Lavigerie à la mort du fondateur (1862–1892) (Paris: Karthala, 2008), 50-53.

⁹Aylward Shorter, Cross & Flag in Africa. The "White Fathers" during the Colonial Scramble (1892-1914) (Maryknoll: Orbis, 2006), 72-75 and 170-172; Ralph Austen, Northwest Tanzania under German and British Rule: Colonial Policy and Tribal Politics, 1889-1939 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968), 80-81.

¹⁰J. A. Kieran, "Christian Villages in North-eastern Tanzania," *Transafrican Journal of History* I (I) (1971): 24-38 [24 and 26].

^{II}Gianpaolo Romanato, *L'Africa nera fra Cristianesimo e Islam. L'esperienza di Daniele Comboni (1831-1881)* (Milan: Corbaccio, 2003).

the autochthonous Bubi people of Fernando Po "into little mission theocracies reminiscent of the famous Jesuit Reductions of Paraguay." Among other relevant aspects, these mission theocracies preserved the Bubi from the pressure of labour requirements from the planters.¹²

The Kasai Mission in the Congo, ran by the Scheut Missionaries, was another exemplary case. Product of the missionary projects of Emile Van Hencxthoven, superior of the Jesuit mission of Kwango in the Congo Free State, the chapel farms (fermes-chapelles) model was, in a sense, a renewed reinterpretation of old sedentism models, applied to rural environments. Conversion based on *school colonies* was seen as a failed model that needed to be replaced. The chapel farms prevailed as a new missionary strategy, articulating evangelisation and labour-the tenets of civilization-, aiming to become "embryos of a Christian environment." The chapel farms were forms of imagining Christian territories, in a spatial and in a social sense. 134 chapel farms existed by 1900, accommodating circa 3,800 children. In 1902, 250 chapel farms housed 5,000 children.¹³ These "secluded settlements with state cooperation and in connection with military posts" eventually had to face severe criticism, being involved in the entire process that led to the Commission of Enquiry into the administration of the Congo Free State, linked to the internationalisation of the "Congo red rubber question." The nature of the "guardianship" over "abandoned children" was one of the six main criticisms levelled against Leopold II's project. The Commission criticized the "very rigid guardianship." A synthesis of the criticism was provided by this long, but revealing, quotation: "They do not possess, strictly speaking, anything; their produce and the domestic animals they raise belong, in general, to the mission. They rarely receive the permission to marry or to re-

¹²William Clarence Smith, "Spanish Equatorial Guinea 1898-1940," in Arthur D. Roberts, ed., *The Cambridge History of Africa: From 1905 to 1940*, Vol. 7 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 537-544.

¹³For the Congo and the chapel farms, which ended in 1911, see Gerard Ciparisse, "Les origines de la méthode des fermes-chapelles au Bas-Congo (1895-1898)," *Bulletin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome* 43 (1973): 693-840; Bruno de Meulder, "Mavula: An African Heterotopia in Kwango, 1895–1911," *Journal of Architectural Education* 52 (1) (1998): 20–29 [26]; Bram Cleys and Bruno de Meulder, "Imagining a Christian Territory: Changing Spatial Strategies in the Missionary Outposts of Scheut (Kasai, Congo, 1891-1940)," in Fassil Demissie, ed., *Colonial Architecture and Urbanism: Intertwined and Contested Histories* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), 201-238; Bengt Sundkler and Christopher Steed, *A History of the Church in Africa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 247.

turn to their native villages. The majority of the natives who reside here are neither orphans nor workmen engaged by contract. They are demanded of the chiefs, who dare not refuse, and a coercion, more or less disguised, is necessary to restrain them." These words echoed similar charges against schemes of labour recruitment and use. Another set of accusations emerged in 1909, with the so-called *Rapport Leclercq* (from the Judge P. M. Leclercq), which accused the chapel farms of being "a new Paraguay." As a consequence, the experiments were closed in 1911. ¹⁴ The project of creating Christian nuclei failed. After 1912 no more *fermes-chapelles* were formed. The "scholastic" responsibilities were urgently prioritized over "the agricultural aspect" of the catechism.¹⁵ Also the orphanages and freed slaves and liberty villages ran by the White Fathers in Uganda, French Sudan and Lake Victoria aroused some criticism, and the latter almost disappear after the First World War.¹⁶

In the 1930s, other forms of spatialization for social reform, which included political rationales and mobilized ecclesiastical and missionary motivations and concerns, emerged in the Belgian Congo. Designed to deal with the perceived consequences of the combination between urbanization, "detribalization" and social unrest, which also aroused particular interest in other colonial empires and was the focus of a large number of social experts, a strategy of creating numerous *centre indigène extra-coutumier*, as the African township in Élisabethville (in south Congo), was followed. Here, the role of the missionary was crucial. Moreover, one of the main voices in the entire debate was that of the Jesuit Father Pierre Charles, certainly aware of past

¹⁴Arthur Berriedale Keith, *The Belgian Congo and the Berlin Act* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1919), 221-223. For the impact of the situation in the mission see Fernand Mukoso Ng'Ekieb, *Les origines et les débuts de la mission du Kwango (1879-1914)* (Kinshasa: Facultés catholiques de Kinshasa, 1993). For the Congo question see Kevin Grant, *A Civilized Savagery: Britain and the New Slaveries in Africa, 1884–1926* (New York: Routledge, 2005) and Martin Ewans, *European Atrocity, African Catastrophe. Leopold II, the Congo Free State and its Aftermath* (London: Routledge, 2002). See also *The Congo: A Report of the Commission of Enquiry Appointed by the Congo Free State Government* (New York and London: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1906), 6, 128.

¹⁵Richard Gray, "Christianity," in Arthur D. Roberts, ed., *The Cambridge History of Africa: From 1905 to 1940* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975), 140-190, esp. 166.

¹⁶Shorter, Cross & Flag in Africa, 74-75.

disputes and previous models.¹⁷ On a different level, the *paysannats indigènes*, large-scale schemes aiming rural development and the spatial fixation of rural populations in rural areas (aspect of crucial importance) that emerged as early as the mid-1930s, also entailed political-religious connections and raised significant criticism, as happened with the *centres extra-coutumiers*.¹⁸

As these examples elucidate, among other important aspects, the persisting trans-historical evocation, circulation, appropriation, and adaptation of imperial models and solutions to population control administration *within* and *among* imperial formations are fundamental aspects that need to be highlighted in order to understand this case. Furthermore, perceiving the processes and dynamics of inter- and trans-imperial comparison, differentiation, replication and appropriation of political and religious repertoires of power and rule is also important. To Teófilo Duarte, a disciplined *cura animarum* should guide the secular efforts of imperial development. The dialogue and the articulation between political and religious modalities of colonial social intervention and transformation should be promoted, and enhanced, in a process marked by historical interrogations and comparisons about past and coeval models. As happened in other colonial geographies, in the 1940s and 1950s Catholic missionary activity in the Portuguese colonial

¹⁷For the centres extra-coutomiers see Pierre Charles, "Le problème des centres extra-coutumiers et quelques-uns de ses aspects," in Institut Colonial International, ed., Compte Rendu de la XXIIIme Session tenue à Londres, les 5, 6, 7 et 8 Octobre 1936 (Bruxelles: Etablissements Généraux d'Imprimerie, 1937), 27-180. For the shared concern by European colonial empires see Institut Colonial International, ed., Compte Rendu de la XXIIIme Session teune à Londres, les 5, 6, 7 et 8 Octobre 1936 (Bruxelles: Établissements généraux d'imprimerie, 1937), 29-89. For one classic analysis see Bogumil Jewsiewicki, Modernisation ou destruction du village africain. L'économie politique de la "modernisation agricole" au Congo belge (Bruxelles: CEDAF, 1983). See also the analysis by Frederick Cooper, Decolonization and African Society. The Labor Question in French and British Africa (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), and by Amandine Lauro, "Suspect Cities and the (Re)Making of Colonial Order: Urbanization, Security Anxieties and Police Reforms in Postwar Congo (1945-1960)," in Jonas Campion and Xavier Rousseaux, eds., Policing New Risks in Modern European History (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2015), 57-85. For the political and religious connections see, among others, Marvin D. Markowitz, Cross and sword: The Political Role of Christian missions in the Belgian Congo, 1908-1960 (Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution, 1973).

¹⁸See, among others, Bogumil Jewsiewicki, "Rural Society and the Belgian Colonial Economy," in David Birmingham and Phyllis Martin, eds., *History of Central Africa* (London: Longman, 1983), II: 95-125; Jewsiewicki, *Modernisation ou destruction du village africain*; and Jeannôt Mokili Danga Kassa, *Politiques agricoles et promotion rurale au Congo-Zaire (1885-1997)* (Paris: L'Harmattan, 1998), *maxime* 135-182.

empire was marked by a more or less clear support—of a pragmatic and instrumental nature, nonetheless—to the policies pursued by the imperial and the colonial states. The latter expected that missionary activities could contribute to the promotion and expansion of their secular interests, via education, social control or even spatial control. Teófilo Duarte's position was not a surprise. The improvement of the missionaries' evangelizing—and therefore *nationalizing* and *civilizing*—action and their contribution to the settlement of native communities and related economic benefits were obviously seen as important aspects. The combined impact on the actual living conditions of the African communities was not undervalued as well. The political utility of their action at colonial, metropolitan and international levels was seen as unquestionable.¹⁹

From the considerations issued by Teófilo Duarte, before and while he was minister of the Colonies, this text explores native population concentration as pivotal to the projects of development of the Portuguese empire-state. These assertions had promoted an intensification of debates, with distinct political and religious genealogies, about its potential advantages and inconveniences or its utility as an instrument of political and socio-economic control and transformation. By scrutinizing the stance of several political and religious actors about the possibilities of concentrationary solutions (avoiding the simplistic arguments of an obedient or passive collaboration of missionaries, or those that obliterate their instrumental and pragmatic cooperation), we seek to relate these stands with the diverse way in which civilizing and evangelizing projects were articulated since the 1930s.

The analysis of a series of exchanges and arguments that were ignited by Teófilo Duarte's considerations and by the door he opened to the active participation of Catholic missionaries in the political debate about native settlement, and respective concentrationary logic, enables a combined approach to the political and ecclesiastical arguments and projects about the colonial

¹⁹For the evangelical activities see, for instance, Nuno da Silva Gonçalves, "A dimensão missionária do catolicismo português," in Carlos Moreira de Azevedo, ed., *História religiosa de Portugal* (Rio de Mouro: Círculo de Leitores, 2002), 3 (*Religião e Secularização*): 353-396; Eric Morier-Genoud, "The Catholic Church, Religious Orders and the Making of Politics in Colonial Mozambique," PhD Thesis (State University of New York, 2005); Lawrence Henderson, *The Church in Angola: A River of Many Currents* (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1992); Didier Péclard, "Religion and Politics in Angola: The Church, the Colonial State, and the Emergence of Angolan Nationalism (1940-1961)," *Journal of Religion in Africa* 27 (2) (1998): 160-186; Didier Péclard, *Les incertitudes de la nation en Angola* (Paris: Karthala, 2015).

situation. It also allows us to ponder the ways in which their centrality to the socio-cultural, political and economic transformation of the Portuguese colonial empire was weighed. Finally, the analysis of the positions taken by the overseas regular and secular clergy, by the main overseas prelates, and by colonial governors and metropolitan authorities, also facilitates the understanding of the agreements and divergences between the state and the church—in its overseas ecclesiastical and missionary dimensions—on topics such as those related to the *politics of difference* (and their corresponding idioms and repertoires of rule)²⁰, to the contending socio-spatial models of population control and administration²¹ and to the projects of evangelization, *civilization* and development of colonial societies and communities.²²

For a "reform of the spirits"

In June 1939, the Minister of the Colonies (1936-1944), Francisco Vieira Machado sent his draft bill, entitled "Projecto de Organização Social e Económica das Populações Indígenas"²³, to the Conselho do Império Colonial (Council of the Colonial Empire), the advisory body of the Ministry of the

²³"Projecto de Organização Social e Económica das Populações Indígenas," *Boletim Geral das Colónias* [hereafter BGCl.] 16 (178) (April 1940).

²⁰Frederick Cooper and Jane Burbank, *Empires and the Politics of Difference in World History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010).

²¹The topic of native settlements in the Portuguese colonial empire is still understudied. For some references see Gerald Bender, *Angola under the Portuguese* (London: Heinemann, 1978) and Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, "A Modernizing Empire? Politics, Culture, and Economy in Portuguese Late Colonialism," in Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, eds., *The Ends of European Colonial Empires: Cases and comparisons* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 61-80. For the overall question of settlement see Cláudia Castelo, *Passagens para África. O povoamento de Angola e Moçambique com naturais da metrópole (1920-1974)* (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 2007). See also her latest "Reproducing Portuguese Villages in Africa: Agricultural Science, Ideology and Empire," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 42 (2) (2016): 267-281. See also Bernardo Pinto da Cruz and Diogo Ramada Curto's article in this volume.

²²About colonial development see Cláudia Castelo, "Developing 'Portuguese Africa' in Late Colonialism: Confronting Discourses," in Joseph M. Hodge, Gerald Hödl and Martina Kopf, eds., *Developing Africa. Concepts and Practices in Twentieth-Century Colonialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014), 63-86; Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto, "A Modernizing Empire?"; and Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, "A Battle in the Field of Human Relations': The Official Minds of Repressive Development in Portuguese Angola," in Martin Thomas and Gareth Curless, eds., *Decolonization and Conflict: Colonial Comparisons and Legacies* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2017).

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

The Good and the Bad Concentration: *Regedorias* in Angola

Bernardo Pinto da Cruz IPRI/FCSH-UNL

Diogo Ramada Curto IPRI / FCSH-UNL

IN 1963, A YOUNG PORTUGUESE ARCHITECT, Mário Santos Costa, submitted a resettlement project to the colonial Settlement Board. Prepared during an internship at the Department of Social Action-which, according to military sources was but a euphemism for psycho-social warfare-, the scheme consisted in the displacement and concentration of Africans at the outskirts of Luanda, close to the white settler village of Viana, in Angola.¹ This was one of the first carefully studied proposals of Regedorias-artificial villages designed to concentrate scattered African peasants-made by the civil branch of the colonial state. Even though the project was officially named "Regedoria Viana", terms "regedoria" and "aldeamento" were used in an indiscriminate fashion throughout the plan. The architect had travelled across the reserve of Quicuche, the northern basin of Cuanza river, in order to collect statistical data related to the African populations. By direct observation, he found a total of 79 families accommodating 405 individuals, 194 men and 211 women. The majority of the families were monogamous, although 12 remained that were still inclined towards polygamy. Due to the proximity of the African dwellings to the city of Luanda, the architect expected some suburban behavior, but soon realized that land, rather than wages, was the main source of family income and "affection". This materialistic concern drove the whole project: "if it can be classified as suburban, the future conglomerate will present, nonetheless, strikingly rural features."² However, the

PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) 25 (1) 2017

BIBLID 25 (1) (2017) 205-231 (rel. 2017) ISSN 1057-1515 print – \$ see back matter ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage

JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr

and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr



^IPT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RPAD/I415/01931, Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordanemento Rural: Regedoria de Viana*, Luanda, 1963.

²PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RPAD/1415/01931, Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordanemento Rural*, I, 6.

^{© 2017} Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

main goals were to contain African dispersion and "to fix populations to land," as if those populations had not already been attached to it. In order to do so, each family would be granted a housing allotment plus some area of a farmable terrain to be built outside the *regedoria* but tangential to it. Houses, as well as other civic buildings, were to be built by the Africans and this was perceived as a necessary condition to attain economic viability.³

Regardless of some references to peasant collective attachment to land and crops, direct observation confirmed that those were individualistic populations, living in isolated houses across the Quicuche reserve with "almost no collective life". Said individualism was thus to be replicated by attributing individual lots. But the regedoria, as a civic compact conglomerate, was thought to instill a new "communitarian spirit". The houses should constitute small nuclei or "morancas" (compounds), which in turn would be disposed in a radial fashion in relation to the civic centre, "the gravity centre of the conglomerate," comprising three zones: an administrative one, with services related to the government of the Regedoria (its headquarters composed of the regedor's house, the local council hall, the police station and the house of the police officer), its economic life (with a commercial cooperative, that could evolve to a local type of "casa do povo" in the corporatist tradition of the Portuguese regime, and agricultural support services) as well as historical-memorialistic, with a "jango" or traditional council functioning as a symbolic "link to the past" (which should replace the modern council hall); an educational zone, where one would find the school, the kindergarten and the chapel; and, at last, a sanitary or "water zone", with an health centre, a public fountain, a washhouse and a collective bathhouse. Despite the impression given by the design of the regedoria, the project was conceived on the basis of a very low population density, which, more than a consequence of the previous demographic characteristics of the Quicuche area, was rather a matter of political choice. In order to justify his preference for all that was small and balanced, the architect quoted the sociologist Amadeu Castilho Soares and his thoughts about the relation between urbanism and African assimilation to the Portuguese culture:

The large concentration of houses and people in a true indigenous city is not a happy solution. On the contrary, it is rather preferable the small concentration

³PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RPAD/1415/01931, Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordanemento Rural*, 11.
in smaller areas, which not only brings sound advantages in the sanitary, administrative and police fields, but also makes the development of an authentic group spirit easier, allowing in turn a more efficient educational action and a smoother permeability to cultural contacts and acquisitions.⁴

In the same vein, the plan explicitly criticizes major attempts to impose artificial, rectangular layouts to autochthonous peoples, with "rigidly aligned buildings at the sides of rectilinear streets." This was considered a "ruthless, inhuman and outdated" standard applied to "the victims of an incomplete process of acculturation." There was the need to expurgate perfect geometry from concentration plans. Instead, more natural forms of the spatial diagram were devised, allegedly inspired in traditional habitats and opposed to "human standardization".⁵ If the lusotropical principles of controlled assimilation and aversion to modern macro-social engineering were deeply embedded in such aesthetical considerations, they also determined the government and discipline of territorial distances, especially those between villages and urban white settlements. In general, they could cause the impression of crude racial segregation, when what was at stake was merely a matter of hygiene, sanitary conditions and cultural backwardness. Thus, the new complex should distance a maximum of 2.5 km from the centre of Viana. It was believed that this avoided both racism and a "blind humanitarianism" that could jeopardize the coexistence of assimilated Africans and Europeans. Located somewhat in a middle ground, this regedoria was the material refraction of a slow-paced assimilation, since the project predicted its territorial expansion along with the development of the European services and dwellings. When they finally met, a lusotropical micro-society would have been achieved.⁶

Reordering and regrouping: a distinction

The aforementioned project represents the case of a technician highly inspired by a lusotropical discourse which social scientists advocated to con-

207

⁴Amadeu Castilho Soares, *Política de Bem-estar rural em Angola* (Lisboa: Junta de Investigações do Ultramar, "Estudos de Ciências Políticas e Sociais," n.º 49, 1961), quoted in Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordenamento Rural*, 4.

⁵PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RPAD/I415/01931, Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordenamento Rural*, 6-9.

⁶PT/IPAD/MU/DGE/RPAD/I415/01931, Junta Provincial de Povomento, *Reordenamento Rural*, 5.

trol, while paying his due tribute to one of the leading strands of social science research at the time: the social engineering of detribalization containment. The idea of concentration was popularized among the new social science academic and administrative elite through the appropriation of two international discourses: one, dating back to 1958, when students at the colonial elite school (Instituto Superior de Estudos Ultramarinos) were lectured about the 1954 Inter-African Conference of Human Sciences. Some recommendations, such as a strong investment in the domains of sociology and psychology in order to study the most convenient methods of social control, were internally translated into a basic principle of policy: the concentration of indigenous populations coupled with applied social science in schemes of controlled and gradual development. The other relates to the Belgian doctrine of "centres extra-coutumiers" produced in the 1930s. Both were disseminated with the intent to fight or contain the production of thousands of detribalized Africans, especially drawn into vagrancy, crime and revolutionary ideals.7 One important feature of the architect's project was underestimating sources of coercion inside the regedoria. There are only two explicit references to security and order. The first one, the building of a police station and the existence of a singular police officer is even discarded later on in the plan, apparently due to the proximity of the police headquarters in the village of Viana. The second one is extracted from Castilho Soares' quote, which equated small concentration with greater surveillance capacity. As important as this may seem, the entire project was sustained on economic and cultural grounds only. This is remarkable given the guerrilla context in which large scale villagization was to be implemented in Angola.

In the meantime, Luanda itself suffered the assaults on its prisons earlier in February 1961. Its periphery, mainly the muceques and previous indigenous neighborhoods were being subjected to intensified surveillance by police officers and civil authorities.⁸ How is it possible that this proto-typical

⁷About those two models and their international circulation see D. R. Curto, B. P. da Cruz, and Teresa Furtado, *Políticas coloniais em tempo de revoltas–Angola circa 1961* (Porto: Afrontamento, 2016), 25-33, 90-92.

⁸It is exactly in this context that Amadeu Castilho Soares prepares the reform of Indigenous Neighborhoods on a sociological basis: Amadeu Castilho Soares, "Sociedades políticas integrais," in *Colóquios de política ultramarina internacionalmente relevante*, pref. de Adriano Moreira (Lisbon: Junta de Investigações do Ultramar, "Estudos de Ciências Políticas e Sociais," n.º 7, 1958), 211-271; but see also Amadeu Castilho Soares, "Enquadramento social

model of the regedoria did not contemplate the military or police element? To be fair, the majority of rural reordering programs and assessments produced between 1962 and 1974 share the same voluntary oversight in relation to the security dimension of the new population arrangements. For instance, in his study about rural reordering in Angola, Jerónimo da Silva Rolo only in the appendix refers that "the dispersion of populations across vast areas makes collective security manifestly precarious" while jeopardizing medical, technical and educational assistance and, at last, the viability of communitarian organization.⁹ Rolo also added to the security and assistance goals the proximity between new villages and big agricultural and livestock enterprises as a more efficient way to balance labour demand with supply.¹⁰ Security issues are thus almost elided or appear at the margins of rural reordering doctrines. In relation to the latter, the project of the Regedoria Viana was the first concrete enterprise where civil administrators projected their concerns about high-modernist, military-led concentration programs. A "form of action useful to the conquest of populations" was at stake here, keeping in mind that one of psychological warfare's components lay in "the policy of population resettlement within villages in such a way as to difficult the contact with guerrilla fighters and to facilitate its control, providing better living conditions in exchange."^{II}

And because of that it was received with great enthusiasm by higher civil officials. Its strengths rested not so much on the concentration side of the urban design but rather in the prospects of bringing economic and social advancements to the uncivilized African peasantry:

Neither regedorias are born out of the mere action of urban planners; nor the urban arrangement is of crucial importance to the lives of rural communities whose distinctive trait is a marked cultural backwardness and an inability to take advantage of the wealth and potentialities of the environment surrounding them.¹²

dos destribalizados," Revista Ultramar, 4 (1961): 19-36

⁹Jerónimo da Silva Rôlo, *Reordenamento rural em Angola (Contribuição para o seu estudo)* (Lisbon: Instituto Superior de Ciências Sociais e Política Ultramarina, 1967), 135.

¹⁰Silva Rôlo, Reordenamento rural, 135.

^{II}O exército na guerra subversiva, vol. 3, cit. by Paulo F. Silva and Orlando Castro, Guerra colonial – a história na primeira pessoa (Vila do Conde: QuidNovi, 2011), XII (Acção psico-lógica / A terceira via de Marcelo), 26.

One should note that the architect was submitting the project to Alfredo de Passos Guerra, a former graduate of the colonial elite school who would participate in the General Council on Counter-Subversion's Symposium on Counter-Subversion later in that decade, in 1969. There Passos Guerra, among others, presented confidential reports explaining rural reordering techniques and why those were to be perceived as a different kind of strategy vis-a-vis military strategic resettlements.¹³ But such position was the outcome of a decade-long process of distinction between one and other types of state control. From the standpoint of the juridical norms framing rural reordering and resettlement, the year of 1961 (6 September) was crucial with the publication of three legal diplomas that regulated the occupation and concession of terrains, created the Juntas Provinciais de Povoamento (Provincial Settlement Boards) and organized the "regedorias", a new administrative division, by placing higher traditional elites, regedores, under direct control of the *chefes de posto*, the lowest strata of Portuguese administration at the local level, as well as by reinforcing the role of African traditional councils.¹⁴ The Viana study was deemed a worthy concretization of those laws, for it openly drew on the organizational aspects they provided and it also accommodated "community development's concepts" taking rural promotion seriously.¹⁵ Such inclusion was seen as a good deviation from an earlier emphasis on the benefits of concentration solely and became institutionalized in the course of the decade as the official stance of the Technical Commission for Rural Reordering.¹⁶

¹²PT/IPADMU/DGE/RPAD/1415/01931, Alfredo de Passos Guerra, "Informação," May 29th 1963, 4.

¹³Gerald Bender, *Angola under the Portuguese. The Myth and the Reality* (Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1978), 160, n. 8.

¹⁴Ministério do Ultramar, *Organização das Regedorias nas Províncias Ultramarinas. Decreto* $n^{.0}$ 43896, de 6 de Setembro de 1961 (Lisboa: Agência Geral do Ultramar, 1961).

¹⁵PT/IPADMU/DGE/RPAD/1415/01931, Regedoria de Viana, 8.

¹⁶Created between 1962 and 1964, the Commission was expected to accelerate the execution of socio-economic goals in the areas of education, African corporatism, the increase of production and marketing, improvement of housing conditions, the extension of private propriety and the definition of regedorias. See, among others, Rosa Maria Serrão Ravara, *Contribuição para uma política de reordenamento rural no Ultramar*, pref. by José Fernando Nunes Barata (Lisboa: Junta de Investigações do Ultramar, "Estudos de Ciências Políticas e Sociais" n.º 84 (1970)), 85.

How did the Commission assess the question of concentration within the new rural reordering policy? First of all, there was the idea that the priority given to "construction" and "block buildings" was wrong. The aforesaid priority was simply a matter of the amount of money allocated to construction plans, which drained financial resources from more important aspects of social promotion like credit and assistance inputs to African agriculture. Early on the Commission also expressed its "uneasiness related to the consequences of a strong tendency to concentrate the rural populations in big villages," asserting that "reordering" was not necessarily the same as "regrouping".¹⁷ The effects of systematic regroupings could be nefarious because "the distribution of a population across a certain geographic space is intimately connected (...) to its technical knowledge and to the way it keeps its economic life and explores the surrounding environment."¹⁸ Furthermore, concentration depended on constant programs of land cleaning-in order to open up productive lands - and soil recovery-due to higher local population densities coupled with African mismanagement of agricultural techniques—leading to unbearable levels of public spending.¹⁹ These statements must be read as early evidence of the economic and social disruption caused by military resettlements elsewhere in Angola and is a good indicator of a growing schism between the civil and military branches of the state. The project of Regedoria Viana thus marked a discontinuity with other types of displacement and concentration and paved the way to the emergence of discourses focused on more humane and economic driven forms of population resettlement. In this sense, the provision of an agricultural cooperative was lauded as a distinctive feature of rural reordering as opposed to mass nonvoluntary programs. But the origins of cooperativism in the Portuguese colonial administration were, as the project explicitly recognizes, a matter of detribalization containment, based upon racial doctrines that predicted the creation of state-induced structures of "supertribalization": the transplantation of corporatist institutions to the colonies as a means to contain the spread of African self-managed forms of mutual associations and secret or-

¹⁷Alfredo de Passos Guerra, *IV Colóquio Nacional do Trabalho da Organização Corporativa e da Segurança Social: reordenamento rural, promoção económico-social das populações rurais de Angola* (Luanda: Junta Provincial de Povoamento de Angola, 1966), 23.

¹⁸Passos Guerra, IV Colóquio, 23-24

¹⁹Passos Guerra, IV Colóquio, 24.

ganizations. These were understood as an outgrowth of migratory movements to the cities and wage labor, dispossessing the African of his traditional sources of coercion and authority. Those origins are confirmed both by the case of Viana as well as by the Commission for Rural Reordering's reports. In the former, the planned cooperative was expected to work as its metropolitan counterpart for rural workers, the "casa do povo". In the latter, one finds the injunction to multiply co-ops as state imposed forms of control and knowledge over African society in order to prevent and destroy African secret associations.²⁰

A House of Lies? Community development and social sciences

In 1968, Angola was chosen to host the II International Meeting of Technicians for Community Development. A metropolitan observer, former representative of the Overseas Ministry, was in charge of reporting the conference proceedings, its political atmosphere and, above all, of avoiding any leak of information deemed dangerous.²¹ The reunion was, in fact, a guided tour across the Angolan territory designed to impress two especially sensitive guests: a delegation from the non-officially recognized Rhodesian government of Ian Smith and another from the Department of Native or (by then) Bantu Affairs of South Africa. Brazil was represented, but soon its role was reduced to that of a mere observer. A famous independent and anti-apartheid journalist from South Africa was invited, even though his uncomfortable interventions were swiftly neutralized. Mozambican technicians completed the entourage. The goal was to share Rhodesian and South African experiences of rural reordering and so-called community development and to show, in exchange, Portuguese best practices in the field. Major central and southern cities were visited; factories, plantations and "regedorias" were exhibited. Overall, and despite some good observations, the delegations were not very impressed by the Portuguese effort. For instance, once in the district of Huambo, foreign visitors were clearly 'underwhelmed' by one of the regedorias recently built. Mr. Howman, undersecretary of state and

²⁰Passos Guerra, *IV Colóquio*, 18. The author of the report remits the reader to Joaquim da Silva Cunha's *Aspectos dos movimentos associativos na África Negra* (Lisboa: Junta da Investição do Ultramar, "Estudos de Ciências Políticas e Sociais," n.8, 1956).

²¹PT/AHD/MU/GM/GNP/RNP/0212/01115, "Relatório sobre a II Reunião Internacional de Técnicos de Cooperativas e Desenvolvimento Comunitário."

brother of the Rhodesian Minister of the Internal Affairs, while showing some images of rural reordering and resettlement and co-operative work among native populations of Rhodesia, touched upon issues deemed extremely inconvenient to the author of the report, since they were considered altogether contrary to the Portuguese principles of non-racial discrimination. An embarrassing situation was thus created. The Lisbon official rushed to censor the translators in place and the presentation continued. This was not the only instance where Portuguese technical and political elites felt uneasy. Van Reensburgh, who was at the time registrar of South African cooperatives, mocked Angolan co-ops with a certain degree of irony and understanding. In his view, the examples presented were extremely weak and, what is more, they were not real co-operatives, since they were actually state-led or secretly run by private colonial settlers. Other references to the Portuguese state's incapacity and infra-structural weakness were also advanced by Angolan technicians. Needless to say, such untimely interventions were expurgated from the official translations.

The meeting was considered a fiasco, since it made public that the Portuguese had been doing a terrible job. The technical preparation of civil servants was appalling. With the exception of the most respected Professor Jorge Dias, there was no anthropologist or sociologist working closely with administrative authorities at the grass roots level.²² In turn, this absence gave the impression that the knowledge of native populations and local development plans were in the hands of technicians, economists, veterinaries, physicians and social workers. In his view, a thorough knowledge, or better, a comprehension of the traditional lifestyles, human relations and behaviour was necessary to predict focus of local resistance to resettlements and cooperative work. The sources of conflict ought to be studied. Besides, the tour was ill designed. Chosen locations displayed only rudimentary forms of rural resettlement and development. In the author's words, "it is not enough to show some projects and to say that things are being done... it's imperative to present proof of their materialization."²³ The itinerary should have taken visitors to the north of the colony, namely, to the District of

²²PT/AHD/MU/GM/GNP/RNP/0212/01115, "Relatório sobre a II Reunião Internacional de Técnicos de Cooperativas e Desenvolvimento Comunitário," 19-21.

²³PT/AHD/MU/GM/GNP/RNP/0212/01115, "Relatório sobre a II Reunião Internacional de Técnicos de Cooperativas e Desenvolvimento Comunitário," 18.

Uíge, for it was the only area where something concrete had already been achieved.

How should one read such a document? There are, of course, implicit references to the secret alliance between Angola, Mozambique, Rhodesia and South Africa, which would later be known as the Alcora Project for regional defense.²⁴ Since we are concerned about the history of the idea of *regedoria* and its materialization on the ground, we will not explore this any further, although some important connections deserve a deeper analysis, such as the role of technical international meetings in the transference of Angolan and Mozambican models of villagization to Rhodesian authorities; or, for that matter, the importance of South African expertise in the Portuguese impulses to modernize colonial prison systems earlier in that decade.²⁵ However, let us focus our attention to the last two criticisms made by the Lisbon official: his stance against technical elites; and his suggestion to look at *regedorias* in the northern districts of Angola. They make this document unique in proving that community development and military resettlement plans were, at some point, inextricable from each other.

The position of denying the instruments of knowledge over the African society to technicians, economists, engineers and architects confirms to a common tendency among high level civil servants to monopolize African affairs, especially those related to land and wage policies. This tendency was not new, as we have argued above. It began in the mid-1950s, due to a marked growth in the number of social scientists graduating from the former colonial school (Escola Superior Colonial), the High Institute of Overseas Studies (ISEU), later known as High Institute of Social Sciences and Overseas Policy (ISCSPU). They entered in a direct competition with new graduates from Economy and Engineering, whose professional status was being boosted at precisely the same period. By 1961 the recruitment process and selection of colonial officials was the principal arena where this tension became notorious. When social scientists began to substitute law-oriented decision-makers at the Overseas Ministry, positions at the colonial

²⁴Carlos de Matos Gomes and Aniceto Afonso, *Alcora. O acordo secreto do colonialismo. Portugal, África do Sul e Rodésia na última fase do colonialismo* (Lisboa: Divina Comédia, 2013); Filipe Ribeiro de Menezes and Robert McNamara, "The Origins of the Exercise Alcora, 1960-71," *The International History Review* 35 (5) (2013): 1113-1134.

²⁵Curto, Cruz, and Furtado, Políticas Coloniais, 207-208.

level were systematically biased in favour of the military, jurists and technicians of all kinds. This was perceived as unfair and soon multiple plans and reforms were proposed to alter the status quo. The outbreak of the war in Angola opened up an opportunity to impose a sociological control over African policy, as much as it accelerated the execution of older concentration programs. After the first revolts in the coercive cotton-growing areas of Angola and later in the coffee export cluster of Uíge-the so-called UPA massacres-two kinds of suggestions were advanced: first, to constitute commissions presided by sociologists who would study the domestic sources of insurgency; second, the overture of concentration camps derived from the French and British models of psychological warfare, mitigated by the deployment of social science approaches and instruments. However, by 1968 a clear skepticism about the use of social science grew stronger, not because it was felt it was not useful, but due to the lack or misuse of social scientists in the terrain. The issues raised by the confidential report were exactly the same as those addressed by a number of technical publications about cooperativism.

For instance, in 1969, the goal of a social science-based intervention was still "the passage of underdeveloped populations to a modern stage without torments and warlike convulsions," confirming the older equation between detribalization impediment and social science.²⁶ Therefore, the planning of urbanism, besides architects, engineers and economists, would have to integrate social and human scientists, namely sociologists, demographers, anthropologists and psychologists. Conversely, there were obstacles and limits to those planning activities, especially when the misuse of social sciences was noticeable. Three scenarios were examined. During a first experience, the motivational techniques used in the process of "raising the awareness" of populations, in order to introduce new agricultural skills, had provoked a great adhesion, exceeding expectations. In turn, the aforesaid adhesion lead to a steady increase in production which eventually rotted by lack of storing and commercialization. In sum, "the materially aggrieved population was simultaneously demoralized, revolted, incredulous and closed." Soon Africans began to show hostility or indifference towards social workers and "returned to their traditional and primitive canons."²⁷ In another zone, the ad-

²⁶Luísa Maria Simões-Raposo Ribeiro, "Das ciências humanas no urbanismo," *Reordenamento–Revista da Junta Provincial de Povoamento de Angola* n.º 12 (Abril-Junho 1969), 26, 27.

²⁷Ribeiro, "Das ciências humanas," 31.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

The Administration of the Empire: Plans and Repertoires ... and Improvisation

50

The Colonial State and Its Non-Citizens: "Native Courts" and Judicial Duality in Angola

Maria da Conceição Neto Universidade Agostinbo Neto, Luanda

The colonial experience of "law and order"

Over the last thirty years a number of publications have shed new light on how "law and order" were defined and put into action across colonial Africa. Those studies shattered illusions of "the rule of law" and "juridical modernity" being at the core of the colonial state and of the way European colonizers imposed law and order on their colonized subjects. Martin Chanock, Florence Bernault, David Anderson, Andrew Burton and many others have proved that the rule of law was not a pillar of the colonial administration. What was put in place was neither an overseas transfer of a modern judicial system existing in the metropoles nor a respectful adaptation of local custom.¹ As Chanock argued, even characterizing the situation as "legal pluralism" can be misleading since this is usually understood as the coexistence of imported law and the customary law, while in fact "both foreign and indigenous laws are products of the colonial situation, continually being formed in response to new historical circumstances."² It could be added that in such



^IMartin L. Chanock, *Law, Custom, and Social Order: The Colonial Experience in Malawi and Zambia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985); Florence Bernault, ed., *Enfermement, prison et châtiments en Afrique du* 19^e siècle à nos jours (Paris: Khartala, 1999); David M. Anderson and David Killingray, eds., *Policing the Empire: Government, Authority, and Control, 1830-1940* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1991); Andrew Burton, *African Underclass: Urbanisation, Crime and Colonial Order in Dar es Salaam* (Oxford: James Currey, 2005); David M. Anderson, "Punishment, Race and 'The Raw Native': Settler Society and Kenya's Flogging Scandals, 1895-1930," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 37 (3) (2011): 479-497. Stacey Hynd, "Law, Violence and Penal Reform: State Responses to Crime and Disorder in Colonial Malawi, c.1900-1959," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 37 (3) (2011): 431-447.

²Martin Chanock, "The Law Market: The Legal Encounter in British East and Central Africa," in W. J. Mommsen and J. A. De Moor, eds., *European Expansion and Law. The Encounter of European and Indigenous Law in 19th- and 20th-Century Africa and Asia* (Oxford/New York: Berg Publishers, 1992), 280.

colonial situations a hierarchy of power had been established by force and usually following a colour/race divide. It was not the result of a simple cultural exchange of different social norms.³ As for the consequences of that "legal encounter", Chanock summarized them as "individualization rights and bureaucratization without the rule of law."⁴

The advance of colonial administration in Africa in the twentieth century fuelled discussions on the relationship between indigenous and foreign juridical institutions and practices, both for theoretical and practical reasons. Politicians and scholars agreed that colonial control implied some degree of acceptance of native institutions and a broad consensus existed on juridical and penal differentiation between colonizers and colonized, meaning that codification of "native laws" was needed to institutionalize "native courts."⁵ It was generally accepted that "customary law" should be restricted by "humanitarian principles" or the superior interest of the colonial power. But while some conceived "native courts" headed by "native chiefs" as part of the "indirect rule" experiment, others wanted European administrations handling the judicial and repressive apparatus.⁶

In the Portuguese colonies, "indirect rule" was out of question, even if it appealed to some colonial administrators. Any form of indirect rule needed either genuine or reshaped African chieftaincies but the violence of Portuguese conquest in most of the territory, followed by heavy-handed war tributes, taxation and forced labour, resulted in killing, sending to prison or drastically undermining the power of once important chiefs. Nonetheless, the Portuguese "direct rule" administration still needed and used subordin-

³For the "colonial situation" see Georges Balandier's famous article (1951) translated as "The Colonial Situation: A Theoretical Approach," in Immanuel Wallerstein, ed., *Social Change: The Colonial Situation* (New York: Wiley 1966), 34-61; see also Georges Balandier, *Ambiguous Africa: Cultures in Collision* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1966), 169-195; Frederick Cooper, *Colonialism in Question: Theory, Knowledge, History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 34-35.

⁴Chanock, "The Law Market," 305.

⁵As recommended by the 1906 International Congress of Colonial Sociology. See Silva Cunha, *O sistema português de política indígena* (Lisbon: Agência Geral das Colónias, 1952), 41 ff.

⁶For a contemporary and comparative approach, see Lucy P. Mair, *Native Policies in Africa* (London: Routledge & Sons, 1936).

ated local authorities or village headmen to impose taxation, labour recruitment and military conscription.⁷ In the 1920s, influential Portuguese colonial analysts called for stopping "the social disintegration brought to the native society [*sociedade gentílica*] by a policy today without opportunity or justification, in Angola as in almost all African colonies." Progress implied to try "as far as possible to rebuild or organize, based on traditional custom, the authority of native chiefs who will be the intermediaries ... between the tutelary administration and the populations."⁸ Already in 1915 Ferreira Diniz, the man in charge of "Native Affairs" in Angola, deplored the lack of information about African chiefs and the existing contempt for them, quoting the governor of French Equatorial Africa, Merlin, on the impossibility of "direct administration" without any "native intermediary", the need of keeping chiefs as "subordinate collaborators and not potentates under trusteeship" and the ways of creating such authorities where needed.⁹ However, prestige was easier destroyed than rebuilt.

In 1933 the Overseas Administrative Reform confirmed African chiefs and headmen (*autoridades gentílicas*) as "auxiliaries of the civil administration" with the obligation of "obeying and promoting obedience," controlling population movements, helping with tax collection, keeping public order at large, and informing about offences of all kinds. But they could not, "at the risk of prison or public work," collect their own taxes, levy fines, be lenient on repression of the alcohol business, get any rewards for recruiting labour, or leave the area without the consent of the Portuguese authorities.¹⁰

The colonial state in Africa could also count on other ways of controlling the masses in towns as in rural areas: as Chanock noted for Northern Rhodesia, "regulatory orders" included "the rules of the churches and of economic organisations like mines and agricultural estates, and the regulatory

⁷See for instance Philip Havik, ""Direct" or "Indirect" Rule? Reconsidering the Role of Appointed Chiefs and Native Employees in Portuguese West Africa," *Africana Studia* (15) (2011): 29-56.

⁸Augusto Casimiro, "Política administrativa de Angola," *Boletim da Agência Geral das Colónias* (47) (1929): 40.

⁹José O. Ferreira Diniz, *Negócios Indígenas: Relatório do ano de 1915* (Lisbon: Sociedade de Geographia de Lisboa, 1918), 8-10.

¹⁰Ministério das Colónias, *Reforma Administrativa Aprovada pelo Decreto-Lei nº 23.229*, 15th November 1933 (Lisbon: Agência Geral das Colónias, 1933).

orders of African societies."^{II} In Angola, Christian churches' rules, for instance, became an important part of the legal environment and helped in keeping discontent under control and in solving conflicts which would otherwise end at the Native Courts or the Administration's prisons. This will not be developed in this article, however, since it is focused on the colonial state judicial system.

Based on previous work with archive sources, this text will discuss some aspects of the Portuguese administration in a colonial situation whose legal landscape was dominated by the "Native Statute" (1926-1961) that divided the population of Angola, Mozambique and Guinea in two legal status: *civilizado* ("civilized") and *indígena* ("native"). Thus, the definition of crime and punishment, courts and judicial proceedings, all need to be analysed keeping that issue in mind.¹²

Portuguese chiefs in "native courts": which law?

The assumption that differences between colonial areas in Africa were due to some "essential" and "permanent" character of British, Portuguese or French colonialism is vanishing from academic books since more studies are proving that colonial rule depended as much on decisions in the metropoles as it depended on the circumstances and the response of different groups in the colonies.¹³ But the idea of a Portuguese "exceptionality" is still around despite historical evidence that colonial doctrines applied or tried by Portugal in the first half of the twentieth century were not unique. Many preambles of Portuguese legislation acknowledged the influence of French colo-

^{II}Martin Chanock, "The Law Market," 298 and 302 n. 53.

¹²This text is based on two sections ("Becoming natives" and "Law and Order") of my Ph.D. Thesis where more references can be found. The research was done mainly in the *Arquivo Nacional de Angola*, in its *Códices* (bound papers) and *Avulsos – Caixas* (loose papers) sections. Just for Huambo, twenty *Códices* from the *Tribunal Privativo dos Indígenas* or related to imprisonment of "natives" provided information relevant to this article. See Maria Neto, "In Town and Out of Town: A Social History of Huambo (Angola) 1902-1961," Ph.D. Thesis, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, 2012, available online: eprints.soas.ac.uk/13822/I/Neto_3375.pdf

¹³For recent and illuminating discussions, see Philip Havik, Alexander Keese and Maciel Santos, *Administration and Taxation in Former Portuguese Africa 1900-1945* (Newcastle upon Tyne, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015); Ângela Barreto Xavier and Cristina Nogueira da Silva, eds., *O governo dos outros: poder e diferença no império português* (Lisbon: Imprensa de Ciências Sociais, 2016).

nial jurisprudence but inspiration could also come from British colonies, especially where white settlers were significant.¹⁴ The Portuguese "exception" became a fact after the Second World War when the Salazar regime reinforced colonial rule instead of accepting decolonization.¹⁵

In the 1920s European politicians were discussing how to improve the colonies' productivity and the living standards of colonized people without putting white supremacy at risk. Neither the legislators nor the administrative staff, with few exceptions, disputed the racist rationale behind the legislation they were producing or trying to apply. Britain was developing "indirect rule," although not everywhere, and France colonial doctrine had moved from *assimilation* to *association*, establishing a distinct legal framework for its colonies and making African subjects' access to French citizenship much more difficult than before.¹⁶ Following a similar path Portugal issued in 1926 its "Political, Civil and Criminal Statute for the Natives of Angola and Mozambique" (in short, "Native Statute") summarizing sparse colonial legislation on the subject, after failed attempts to do it earlier.¹⁷

In fact, Portuguese Republican laws gave sequence to those passed under the Monarchy (until its overthrow in 1910), reinforcing the distinction between "natives" ruled by "codified and expurgated customary law" and

¹⁴For a brief survey of Portuguese colonial law, see Luís Chorão, "Direito Colonial," in António Barreto and Filomena Mónica, eds., *Dicionário da História de Portugal* (Porto: Figueirinhas, 1999), VII (Suplemento A-E): 545-547.

¹⁵For references on Portuguese colonial doctrines and lusotropicalism, see Maria C. Neto, "Ideologias, contradições e mistificações da colonização de Angola no século XX," *Lusotopie. Lusotropicalisme, idéologies coloniales et identités nationales dans les mondes lusophones* I (1997): 327-359. The said issue of the journal with a special section on Lusotropicalism is available online at: https://lusotopie.revues.org/74.

¹⁶It lasted until 1946. See Alice Conklin, *A Mission to Civilize: The Republican Idea of Empire in France and West Africa, 1895-1930* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1997), especially 174-211; Gregory Mann, "What Was the *indigénat*? The "Empire of Law" in French West Africa, *Journal of African History* 50 (2009): 331-353; Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, "Nationalité et citoyenneté en Afrique Occidentale française: originaires et citoyens dans le Sénégal colonial," *Journal of African History* 42 (2001): 285-305; Emmanuelle Saada, *Les enfants de la colonie. Les métis de l'empire français entre sujétion et citoyenneté* (Paris: La Découverte, 2007); also Mair, *Native Policies*, 18 and Chapter 4.

¹⁷Decree 12,533: "Estatuto político, civil e criminal dos indígenas de Angola e Moçambique" in *Diário do Governo* no. 23, 23 October 1926, 903. Extended to Guinea in 1927. Further modifications: Decree 13,698 (30 November 1927); Decree 16,473 (6 February 1929) further regulated by Order 3,126 (28 October 1939); finally, Decree 39,666 (30 May 1954).

citizens ruled by Portuguese civil law. They had in view a special "civil, political and criminal statute" for "natives" and the codification of African customs to be used in dedicated "native courts."¹⁸ In Angola, governor Norton de Matos and Ferreira Diniz, appointed in 1913 as director of the brand new Native Affairs Bureau (*Secretaria dos Negócios Indígenas*), made a number of propositions to Lisbon without success.¹⁹ The 1926 "Native Statute", conceived by Republican politicians, would be developed by Salazar's New State (*Estado Novo*).

By this Statute almost all the colonized subjects of Portugal became legally "natives" (*indígenas*) distinct from those classified as "civilized" and entitled to Portuguese citizenship. So a "race" divide was legalized in those colonies, since cultural and economic preconditions allowing for achieving the status of "citizens" applied only to "blacks and their descendants" (article 3).²⁰ Whites could be illiterate, very poor, convicted criminals, politically undesirable, but they were all Portuguese citizens. This *indigenato* regime was similar to the French *indigénat* except that Portugal kept it after the Second World War.²¹

The aims of such juridical duality were economic ("native" taxes and labour) and political (subordination and denial of access to citizens' rights). In Angola, where the number of Portuguese settlers grew steadily during the "Native Statute" period, it was decisive in blocking the upward social mobility of "non-whites" in order to protect white settlers' interests. Even so, the

240

¹⁸Lei Orgânica de Administração das Províncias Ultramarinas, 15 August 1914. For Portuguese republican legislation in context, Cristina Nogueira da Silva, "As 'normas científicas da colonização moderna' e a administração civil das colónias," in José M. Sardica, ed., A Primeira República e as colónias portuguesas (Lisbon: EPAL/CEPCEP, 2010), 87-107. See also Gervase Clarence-Smith, *The Third Portuguese Empire*, *1825-1975: A Study in Economic Imperialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985), 116-45.

¹⁹See Ferreira Diniz, *Populações indígenas de Angola* (Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade, 1918), especially the Appendices.

²⁰For this and other quoted articles of this Statute, see reference in note 17. For complementary legislation see Ministério do Ultramar Dec. 16,474, 6 December 1929 - *Diploma Orgânico das Relações de Direito Privado entre Indígenas e não-Indígenas*.

²¹For a synthetic view of the *indigénat*, Mann, "What Was the *indigénat*?" For the Portuguese *indigenato*, see Maria Neto, "In Town"; Christine Messiant, 1961. L'Angola colonial, *histoire et société. Les prémisses du mouvement nationaliste* (Basel: P. Schlettwein Publishing, 2006); Elizabeth Vera Cruz, O Estatuto do Indigenato: Angola – A legalização da discriminação na colonização portuguesa (Lisbon: Novo Imbondeiro, 2005),

1940 population census revealed that in the "civilized population" category whites were outnumbered by blacks and persons of mixed-race.²² So the Statute, reinforced in 1954, was also a convenient barrier protecting settlers' access to lands and jobs against the black majority, especially the growing group of people trained in Christian missions.

The 1926 "Native Statute" diverged from the once predominant "assimilation" doctrine that envisaged all parcels of the empire and their inhabitants sharing broadly the same rights.²³ It favoured a "gradual transformation" of Africans' customs in order to "integrate them into the life of the colony" (article I) but not into the Portuguese nation (as the 1954 Statute would implicitly suggest). The great majority was then segregated from a minority of "citizens" that included all the "whites" and a tiny number of "blacks" and mixed-race people whose "characterization" as "civilized" was left to each colonial government to decide (article 3).

People classified as "natives" had no "political rights related to Europeantype institutions" (article 9) and the administration of justice would use distinct organization and courts (*Tribunal Privativo dos Indígenas*) (article 12). Customary law was meant to regulate "family, property and inheritance rights" (article 4). The "habits and custom of native social life" would be accepted unless offending Portuguese "sovereignty rights" or "humanitarian principles" (article 2). But in the absence of the codification and approval of customary law, "declarations of the local native chief and two other respected natives chosen by the court president [administrative authority]" would do (article 4).

The creation of "Native Special Courts" (*Tribunais Privativos dos Indígenas*) and the acceptance of "native custom" in certain judicial decisions confirmed the duality in the judicial and penal system demanded by the citizen/native divide but with no judicial powers for African chiefs and head-men.²⁴ "Native Courts" were presided over by the Portuguese administrative

²²The so-called "civilized population" (91,611) included 44,083 "Whites," 24,221 "Blacks" and 23,244 "Mixed-race. "*Censo Geral da população de Angola – 1940* (Luanda: Imprensa Nacional, 1941), vol. I.

²³For the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, see Cristina Nogueira da Silva, *Constitucionalismo e império: a cidadania no ultramar português* (Lisbon: Almedina, 2009).

²⁴See the dossier "O estado colonial: género ou sub-espécie?" *Africana Studia* 21 (2013), especially Manuela Assis "Sistemas jurídicos e judiciais: os tribunais coloniais e a aplicação da justiça aos indígenas," 75-94; Fernanda do Nascimento Thomaz "Da metrópole à

chief, helped by two "natives" chosen by him. "Native" chiefs, if invited, could have only "information functions." This could give some leverage to local people able to manipulate "custom" to their own benefit but everything depended on the discretion of local Portuguese authorities since only chiefs "recognized as such by the administrative authorities" counted (article 8). "Native Courts" dealt with all civil, commercial and criminal cases involving "natives" except when serious criminal offences involved a "civilized" defendant or plaintiff, in which case they went to normal courts. A Supreme Court for Natives presided over by the Governor-General as their "natural protector" was the "appellate court" while major penalties had to be confirmed by the Military Court. As Portugal had no death penalty since 1867, "rebels" and "undesirables" were banished to São Tomé or to harsh regions in southern Angola.²⁵ Although trials proceeded in oral fashion, there were written registries. Judging from archive evidence, these formal procedures were abandoned later on.

In Angola, where Portuguese experiments with colonial law dated from the late sixteenth century, although in a much smaller area, comparisons are inevitable. In fact, the "Native Courts" created after the 1926 introduction of the "Native Statute" were far from being a version of the "*tribunal de mucanos*" documented, from the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries, as an African institution incorporated into the Portuguese legal system.²⁶ But they also intended to go further than more recent legislation and practices used in "native cases" ("*questões gentílicas*"). For instance, in 1907 a by-law established that cases of major gravity to be brought before the Portuguese administration, such as murder, should be judged by the administrator with advice from two "native" helpers with expertise in local African custom.²⁷

colónia: administração da justiça no norte de Moçambique (1894-1930), 95-105.

²⁵Arquivo Nacional de Angola [ANA], *Códice* 4,382. In Angola, the location of banishment was supposed to be decreed by the Governor-General, but apparently it was often decided by district administrators: ANA, *Códice* 10,445.

²⁶See Roquinaldo Ferreira, *Cross-Cultural Exchange in the Atlantic World: Angola and Brazil during the Era of the Slave Trade* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), chapter 3; Catarina Madeira Santos, "Entre deux droits: les Lumières en Angola (1750-v. 1800)," *Annales HSS* 4 (2005): 817-848; Catarina Madeira Santos, "Um governo 'polido' para Angola. Reconfigurar dispositivos de domínio (1750-c.1800)," Ph.D. Thesis, Universidade Nova de Lisboa, 2005.

²⁷For the 1907 *portaria provincial*, see Simão de Laboreiro, *Circunscrição Civil da Ganda: Relatório 1914-1915* (Benguela: Author's Edition, 1916): 17.

The "Native Statute", the expansion of Christian churches and the colonial overall lack of respect towards African cultures, all reduced the weight of customary law in the following decades. Juridical dualism, however imperfect, depended on codification of customs for its full implementation and in the absence of a proper Code, improvisation and arbitrariness prevailed. Being aware of that, some administrators considered absurd their carrying out of judicial functions with the aid of native advisors.²⁸

In the colonial hierarchy established by the 1933 Overseas Administrative Reform (Reforma Administrativa Ultramarina), "native authorities" (autoridades gentílicas), were remunerated as "auxiliaries of the civil administration in the colonies" (article 76), namely for military conscription and "public works." In non-urban areas all "natives" were to be reunited in regedorias (under a regedor) subdivided in grupo de povoações ("native settlement group") with usually no less than 25 settlements with a chief chosen by local succession rules or by the regedor and the Portuguese Administrator (articles 109 to III) and ruling over the "native settlement's chiefs" (chefes de povoação indígena) (articles II2 to II9).²⁹ About the judicial organization, the above mentioned Reform retained the judicial functions of Portuguese administrators of Circunscrição or Concelho.³⁰ Although it established that those judicial functions were limited to a certain type of crimes (article 49) and that other offenders or criminals should come before a proper judge (*juiz de direito*), these restrictions did not apply to those to whom the "Native Statute" applied, since all civil, commercial and criminal cases only involving "natives" supposedly fell under the jurisdiction of "Native Courts."

In 1939 "Native Courts" were finally regulated in Angola, when already in many areas their formal procedures were reduced to a minimum and experts agreed that judges, administrators and other officials had serious difficulties due to the absence of the codification of African custom.³¹ In the 1950s, with few exceptions, defendants were simply sent to the colonial ad-

²⁸Laboreiro, *Circunscrição*, 18. In the 1940s, experts accused the lack of codification of causing serious problems in "native" justice: José Caramona Ribeiro, *Regulamento do Foro Privativo dos Indígenas de Angola: Crítica e Formulário* (Luanda: Imprensa Nacional, 1944), 6.

²⁹Ministério das Colónias, *Reforma Administrativa de 1933*, Articles 91 to 119 "Das autoridades gentílicas." For a contemporary sketch of the Portuguese colonial administration, see Mair, *Native Policies*, 250-260.

³⁰Adriano Moreira, "Administração de justiça aos indígenas," Separata da *Revista do Gabinete de Estudos Ultramarinos*, 5-6 (1952): 56-70.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

The Colonial Budgets, a Sophisticated Portuguese Late Imperialism Propaganda Device

Luís Filipe Madeira Universidade da Beira Interior

Introduction

The Portuguese political regime, known as *Estado Novo*, is inseparable both from the ideas and the political practices of Oliveira Salazar. Finance Minister between 1928 and 1932, President of the Ministers' Council between 1932 and 1968, Oliveira Salazar owes much of his political success, as well as his domestic and international prestige, to his balanced budget policy.^I This policy, which consisted of the production of budgetary surpluses in every fiscal year without exception, acquired the status of the regime's political dogma. Therefore, the balanced budget policy was designed to be applied to the governance of all territories under Portuguese rule. Salazar's influence on the public accounting system and financial administration was to survive his own stay in office and last until the end of the regime. Between 1928 and 1973, metropolitan Portugal's and its seven colonies' annual accounts never registered a single budget deficit.

The production of positive balances for 45 consecutive years, in 8 budgetary units, scattered across three continents and possessing very unequal levels of economic and social development, constitutes a phenomenon that is as extraordinary as it is unlikely. Indeed, after the Second World War, for instance, Portugal's colonial policy underwent profound changes,² and the public finances of the colonies could not remain immune to them.

Concerning public investment, the financial track of this change is to be found in the implementation reports of the development plans,³ introduced in 1953. As far as the budget is concerned, the overseas' planned develop-

PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) 25 (1) 2017

BIBLID 25 (1) (2017) 255-289 | ISSN 1057-1515 print – \$ see back matter ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr



and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr © 2017 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

^IA. Silva, "Salazar e a política colonial do Estado Novo (1930-1951)," Fernando Rosas and José Brito (dir.), *Salazar e o salazarismo* (Lisboa: Publicações Dom Quixote, 1989), 106.

²Fernando Rosas, "O Estado Novo (1926-1974)," in José Mattoso, dir., *História de Portugal* (Lisboa: Círculo de Leitores, 1994), 485-495.

ment policy, which lasted for over two decades, was highly demanding and substantially transformed the Empire regarding agriculture, forestry, cattle breeding, mining, energy production, water treatment, sanitation, urbanisation and, more generally, white settlement as well as modernisation or construction of new harbour, road, rail and airport infrastructures.

Moreover, to the remarkable financial effort imposed by the new overseas' enhancement policy, in the early 1960s, supplementary charges of gigantic proportions, unwanted by the colonial regime, should be added. The decision to give a military response to the armed struggle for national liberation that broke out in Angola in 1961, in Guinea in 1963, and in Mozambique in 1964, together with the determination to strengthen the presence of the armed forces throughout the Empire had unparalleled budgetary implications in the whole of the overseas public finances.⁴

Given only these two aspects of the Portuguese colonial life, it is unlikely that the financial impacts of the economic and social development policy and the repression of the liberation movements' independence aspirations had not carried significant weight regarding the revenues and expenditure recorded in the colonies' annual accounts. Remarkably, the analysis of these accounts does not reveal any evidence of economic, political, military or other turbulence.

However, the hypothesis that the Portuguese colonies' official accounts fail to record all the necessary flows for their governance has never been raised in the scientific field and only seldom has it been in the political one.⁵ Hence, the accounting consistency of the public accounts of those colonies, which simultaneously held a liberation war and a planned development policy, should be tested. This article proposes to unveil and reflect on the concealed structure of the public finances of Angola, Mozambique, and Guinea during the 1954-1973 period.

³República Portuguesa, Presidência do Conselho, Inspecção Superior do Plano de Fomento, *Relatório final da execução do I Plano de fomento (1953-1958)* (Lisboa: Imprensa Nacional, 1959).

⁴José Simões, "O custo da guerra," in Aniceto Afonso and Carlos Gomes, dirs., *Guerra colonial* (Lisboa: Editorial Notícias, 2000), 523.

⁵In exile, with access only to official sources, Eduardo de Sousa Ferreira, for example, was able to ascertain the enigmatic character of the colonial public expenditure. Eduardo Ferreira, *Aspectos do colonialismo português. Análise económica e política sobre as colónias portuguesas, África do Sul e Namíbia* (Lisboa: Seara Nova, 1974), 211.

The unveiling of the concealed structure of those three colonies' public finances is yet not possible through the mere analysis of the respective official accounts. Thus, in order to detect documentary sources liable to reveal the presence of inadequate (or non-existing) accounting entries, this research was carried out in the libraries and archives of the Parliament, Overseas National Bank (BNU), Bank of Portugal, National Institute of Statistics, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Navy, Ministry of Public Works, Court of Auditors and also in the Military Historical Archive, Overseas Historical Archive and Torre do Tombo.

Methodology

To access the concealed structure of the public accounts of Portugal's colonies involves a whole different methodology from that usually adopted in the studies dealing with the colonial financial documents. In the abstract, there are three causes that can determine the artificial production of budget balances. The real imbalance can be concealed by means of an accounting model that favours the formal balance of budgetary flows. Such model may reflect the inappropriate use of the accounting standards in force. It may also be symptomatic of the existence of revenues and expenditures that, having allowed the provision of public services during the fiscal year, were not recorded in the official accounts.

To test whether the permanent balance of public accounts results from the plasticity of the financial flows official registration rules adopted by the *Estado Novo*, the so-called ordinary balance model⁶, it is important to reflect upon its nature. According to this accounting model, the financial flows are classified as ordinary or extraordinary. Ordinary revenues, which consist of taxes, fees and income stemming in public property or capital, like the ordinary expenditures, have the characteristic to repeat themselves every year and are composed of financial flows that ensure the functioning of the government and the public administration⁷. The extraordinary revenues, which consist of loans or credit balances of previous years, like the extraordinary expenditures, are occasional flows that, by definition, do not necessarily oc-

⁶Decreto 15:465, *Diário do Governo*, I Série, nº 109, 14 May 1928, 1141-1146.

⁷François Deruel, *Finances publiques. Budget et pouvoir budgétaire* (Paris: Dalloz, 1975), 71.

cur in every fiscal year.⁸ Extraordinary revenues in turn should only pay extraordinary expenditures, although ordinary revenues may finance both ordinary and extraordinary expenditures. In these circumstances, the budgetary balance results from the ability of ordinary revenues to cover ordinary expenditures. Thus, the accounting value of the extraordinary revenues and expenditures is always identical and the existence of extraordinary flows is not taken into account for purposes of determining the balanced budget.

To test the limits of the ordinary balanced model, an alternative model to this should be counterpoised—that of the effective balance.⁹ In so doing, it will be made clear whether the permanent balance of public finances was determined by the official accounting rules or, on the contrary, by an intentional manipulation of those rules. Thus, the flows recorded in the official accounts of three Portugal's African colonies will be rearranged according to the proposed alternative model.

So far, studies of the budgets that enabled the colonies' governance after the Second World War have been founded solely on the analysis of the data recorded in the colonies' financial accounts. Considering the limits of such an approach, it seemed appropriate to formulate a work hypothesis. Very likely, the official colonial accounting documents would not fully register the public revenue and expenditure that annually made the colonial government possible. Audacious as it is—given that the official accounts have been the sole and exclusive source of all studies dedicated to the budgetary flows of Portugal's colonies—this hypothesis, nonetheless, subsequently became the driving force of the research work that underpins this article.

The source, the allocation and volume of the financial flows recorded in the budgets and accounts, as well as all revenues and expenditures whose registration has possibly been omitted, are likely to be the subject of reading and interpretation as any other political text. The colonies' financial documents are, in fact, an official text that should be dealt with the precautions that are imperative when examining a public document of a political nature. Indeed, underlying the tasks of deconstruction and reconstruction of the colonial accounts is the intention to eliminate or correct any elements

⁸João Leite, *Na base – finanças sãs* (Lisboa: Edições Panorama, 1966), 19.

⁹António Franco, Finanças públicas e direito financeiro (Coimbra: Almedina, 1999), 365.

of the official financial text that might disturb the understanding of the political reality that the accounting documents should mirror.

The Permanent Balance of Public Accounts

The official positive balances of Guinea, Angola and Mozambique recorded in the last twenty years of the Portuguese colonization are presented in Table I.

	Guinea	Angola	Mozambique		Guinea	Angola	Mozambique
1954	28.7	33.0	32.8	1964	2.5	11.1	5.2
1955	28.0	40.0	22.2	1965	5.5	7.2	5.1
1956	18.6	33.8	28.1	1966	2.7	7.0	3.8
1957	4.7	13.2	12.5	1967	4.5	6.5	6.9
1958	5.4	11.8	12.6	1968	9.9	6.9	7.0
1959	1.6	7.6	10.5	1969	8.0	6.0	8.5
1960	0.1	4.4	5.9	1970	5.5	9.5	7.4
1961	1.4	4.3	5.8	1971	7.2	1.9	4.8
1962	1.0	11.9	7.1	1972	5.7	1.7	0.4
1963	1.7	6.1	7.0	1973	1.8	4.9	0.4

Table 1 Financial Year Balances as a Percentage of Total Revenue (values expressed in percentages)

Sources: República Portuguesa, Estado de Angola, Direcção dos Serviços de Finanças, *Contas de gerência e de exercício 1972-1973* (Luanda: Imprensa Nacional, 1973-1974); República Portuguesa, Estado de Moçambique, Direcção dos Serviços de Finanças, *Contas de gerência e de exercício 1972-1973* (Lourenço Marques: Imprensa Nacional de Moçambique, 1973-1974); República Portuguesa, Província de Angola, Direcção dos Serviços de Fazenda e Contabilidade, *Contas de gerência e de exercício 1954-1971* (Luanda: Imprensa Nacional, 1955-1972); República Portuguesa, Província da Guiné, Repartição Central dos Serviços de Fazenda e Contabilidade, *Contas de gerência e de exercício 1954-1973* (Bolama: Imprensa Nacional da Guiné, Apenso ao Boletim Oficial, 1955-1974); República Portuguesa, Província de Moçambique, Direcção dos Serviços de Fazenda e Contabilidade, *Contas de gerência e de exercício 1954-1971* (Lourenço Marques: Imprensa Nacional de Moçambique, 1955-1972).

The reading of Table 1 requires clarification. In the Portuguese colonies there were autonomous public services whose revenues and expenditures were recorded in the budgets and accounts of the colonies. As the number, nature and economic relevance of the autonomous public services were not identical in all colonies, for the purpose of a public finances structure analysis in a comparative perspective, the financial flows of the autonomous services were deducted from the total revenue and expenditure registered in the colonies financial year accounts. The revenue and expenditure of each autonomous service were registered in the budgets and accounts of the colonies with identical values, having, therefore, no influence on the calculation of the budget balance in absolute terms. As far as the analysis of the flows in relative terms is concerned, the registration of the autonomous public services turnover in the colonies' budgets and accounts, by adding the local government total revenue and expenditure, reduces the comparative weight of any other budgetary flow and, hence, unjustifiably obscures the structure of the official accounts.

Therefore, in order to access the concealed structure of the colonies public finances and grant more transparency to any comparison between colonies, the autonomous public services financial flows were deducted from the total revenue and expenditure recorded in the colonies' financial year accounts.

The Ordinary Balance Model

Regarding Table I, in the last twenty years of the *Estado Novo* colonial policy, none of the colonies would have recorded a budget surplus. According to the official accounts, in two decades, the weakest performance of the four colonies would have been registered in Mozambique, which, in 1972 and 1973, would have only achieved a 0.4% positive balance. The financial reality presented in Table I has obviously very little credibility. Paradoxically, however, the abyssal discrepancy between the financial impact of the colonial policies stated in the official accounts, and the perceived financial burden of such policies—as it is apparent to any averagely informed observer—has never generated critical distance vis-à-vis the *Estado Novo* official financial documents.¹⁰

260

¹⁰That is the case, as an example, in Malyn Newitt, *Portugal in Africa. The Last Hundred* Years (London: C. Hurst & Co., 1981), 237; or Basil Davidson, "Portuguese-Speaking Africa,"

Ordinary Revenue	Ordinary Expenditure		
	I Public Debt		
I General Direct Taxes	II Government and National Representation		
II Indirect taxes	III Pensions and Retirement Pensions		
III Industries Provided with a Special Fiscal Regime	IV General Administration and Supervision		
IV Fees and Revenues Stemming from the Services	V Finance Department		
V Private Domain, State Enterprises and Industries	VI Justice Department		
VI Capital Income, Shares and Corporate Bonds	VII Economic Department		
VII Refunds and Reversals	VIII Military Ground Forces		
VIII Revenue Consignment	IX Navy Department		
	X General Operating Charges		
	XI Previous Year's Balances		
Extraordinary Revenue	Extraordinary Expenditure		
Loans			
Subsidies			
Remaining Ordinary Revenue	Development Plan		
Previous Years Balances	Other Extraordinary Expenditures		
Extraordinary Taxes			
Revenue Stemming from Extraordinary Activities			

Table 2 Structure of the Financial Year Accounts

Sources: Orçamentos Gerais do Estado 1928-1973; Contas Gerais do Estado 1928-1973.

In order to deconstruct the process of building positive balances used by the *Estado Novo*, it is relevant to reflect on the accounting model introduced by Oliveira Salazar^{II} in 1928, and which was to subsist until 1973. Table 2 shows the structure of the budgets and financial year accounts of the Portuguese colonies during the mentioned period. A brief analysis of the accounting model used by the colonial regime unveils a quadripartite struc-

in Michael Crowder, dir., *The Cambridge History of Africa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 8: 783.

^{II}Decreto 15:465, *Diário do Governo*, I Série, nº 109, 14 May 1928, 1141-1146.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

Decolonisation, Improvised: A Social History of the Transfer of Power in Cabo Verde, 1974–1976¹

Alexander Keese Département d'Histoire Générale, Université de Genève

Introduction

Cabo Verde is an astonishing case for the interpretation of decolonizationand, certainly, a pioneer case to come to a new, social history of decolonization "on the ground". Such a new perspective means, in my view, that, first of all, the analysis cannot stop at the moment of independence (a trivial thought, perhaps, but yet the huge majority of studies on African, including Lusophone African societies, takes this rupture for granted in terms of periods of analysis). Second, we need to address the experiences of populations on the regional and local level with the end of colonialism.² Third, the creation of the new states meant the transition from a late colonial to a new, independent administration. It is perhaps necessary to insist that the activities of state bureaucracy with their aseptic jargon are not the main issue in that regard-although they are of interest when it comes to studying the modalities of the public sector after the independences. But the establishment of the new, postcolonial regime by the Partido Africano da Independência da Guiné e do Cabo Verde (PAIGC), the rebel movement that had been victorious on Guinean soil, and of which



^IResearch for this article has been supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation through the SNSF Research Professors programme (n° 157443).

²Current trends seem to indicate rather a prominence (or dominance) of cultural historical approaches towards decolonization, see, e. g., Ruth Craggs and Claire Wintle, "Introduction: Reframing Cultures of Decolonization," in Ruth Craggs and Claire Wintle, eds., *Cultures of Decolonisation: Transnational Productions and Practices, 1945–70* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016): I-26. The history of decolonization as social history has not found much progress after Frederick Cooper's conceptual work in 2008, and it was probably much too optimistic, at that moment, to claim "that the recent African past – spanning the last years of colonial rule and the years of independence – is becoming a focus of historical inquiry," see Frederick Cooper, "Possibility and Constraint: African Independence in Historical Perspective," *Journal of African History* 49 (I) (2008): I67.

a number of leaders associated with Aristides Pereira and Pedro Pires took the reins of the new state in the archipelago, also led to the creation of new networks of influence and power.³ The role of the new services of internal administration, led by Carlos W. Veiga, and its delegates in the various islands, is elementary in this respect: the agents of this directorate built a system of control, but, frequently, their work was paralleled by the newly created sections of the ruling party in the archipelago.⁴ Their interactions with locals are part of the social history of decolonization.

The economic perspectives of the new state seemed to point to a smooth development process. Even during the early existence of the postcolonial state (and with its unclear future, as a federation with Guinea-Bissau remained on the agenda as a mere project), Cabo Verde quickly became a darling of aid donors.⁵ This was important given the background of nearly permanent drought in the islands, conditions that had become even more endemic from the late 1960s onwards. The social effects of the aid received were quite impressive in terms of changes in individual consumption patterns: thus, to give just one example, the access of the islanders to new food varieties and a more diversified and balanced diet was a direct product of the availability of imported foodstuffs, especially vegetables.⁶ From the mid-

³The classical (optimistic) account of the transition of Cabo Verde, from an activist's perspective and without much scientific analysis, is Basil Davidson, *The Fortunate Isles: A Study in African Transformation* (Trenton/NJ: Africa World Press, 1982).

⁴These processes still lack much analysis; indeed, for West Africa little has been done since publication of the classical studies by political scientists, see Aristide Zolberg, *Creating Political Order: The Party-states of West Africa* (Chicago: Rand McNally, 1966), and Aristide Zolberg, *One-Party Government in the Ivory Coast* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1964), 149-215. There are some exceptions for other parts of sub-Saharan Africa, but not many – Zambia might be one of the exceptional cases, see Miles Larmer, *Rethinking African Politics: A History of Opposition in Zambia* (Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2011).

⁵The practical effects and experiences of donor aid in the postcolonial African societies have equally not been a subject of historical research. First reflections on the long-term perspective have been made in Bronwen Everill and Josiah Kaplan, "Introduction: Enduring Humanitarianisms in Africa," in Bronwen Everill and Josiah Kaplan, eds., *The History and Practice of Humanitarian Intervention and Aid in Africa* (Basingstoke and New York: PalgraveMacmillan, 2013), I-22.

⁶Arquivo do Ministério do Desenvolvimento Rural, Praia, Cabo Verde (AMDRCV), Dossier "Cooperação Portugal," Miguel António Lima, Director-General of Agriculture at the Ministry of Rural Development, *Alguns termos de referência para o desenvolvimento da horticultura nacional* (without number), 20 July 1979, 1-2.

1970s onwards, massive aid investment also became accessible. To give one example, the district administration of São Vicente—with the important urban centre of Mindelo—counted, already in 1976, on considerable sums of aid of 'the Swedes' for its local infrastructure initiatives.⁷ Scandinavian and Dutch funding, among others, appeared to offer a reliable source of support. Few other independent African societies had such advantageous conditions in the first years after their respective decolonisations. Little has been written about the details of the social and economic transition in Cabo Verde but it has appeared as a kind of success story, mostly devoid of a serious analysis of the complexities of the historical process.⁸ These complexities need to become the object of fresh interpretations.

My study engages with two essential steps of the transition. The first concerns the complications of political mobilization and the potentials of nationalist support in the future capital of the state, Praia, in the first months after the fall of the Portuguese authoritarian regime in the colonial metropole; the other urban centre, Mindelo, is another theatre of such changes.⁹ This interpretation profits from an unexplored source: the reports, and collected testimony, by a Portuguese administrator sent by the Spínola government in Lisbon, which can be analysed as a major source on the transition period in spite of the racist biases of this official.

The second set of questions has to do with the many conflicts existing from the start around the transfer of the institutions. In 1975 and 1976, rural mobilization and the occupation of urban territory; complex discussions and massive conflicts concerning the creation of infrastructure; and the divergent interests of the different new administrative units come to the fore. Access to local, postcolonial archives in Cabo Verde allows for telling a more

⁹This process comes along as much too straightforward in the principal overview of José Vicente Lopes, *Cabo Verde: os bastidores da independência* (Praia: Spleen, 2002).

⁷Arquivo da Câmara Municipal de São Vicente (ACMSV), Diversos – 1975/76, Daniel Henrique Cardoso Mendes, Delegate of Internal Administration in São Vicente, to National Internal Administration of Cabo Verde (n° 772/20.09/76), 10 Dec. 1976, I.

⁸Elisa Silva Andrade, *Les îles du Cap-Vert de la "Découverte" à l'Indépendance Nationale* (1460–1975) (Paris: Harmattan, 1996), 276-284; Elisa Silva Andrade, "Cape Verde," in Patrick Chabal, ed., *A History of Postcolonial Lusophone Africa* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2002): 264-290, 265-272. On the context of Swedish support for the PAIGC, see also Tor Sellström, *Sweden and National Liberation in Southern Africa* (Uppsala: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, 2000), II (*Solidarity and Assistance 1970–1994*), 59-72.

differentiated story. This article thereby intends to offer a social history of decolonization.

Studying decolonization: Lusophone exception or general lack of research progress?

The decolonization of the Portuguese territories in the African continent is an unusual story when compared to the decolonization experience of most parts of sub-Saharan Africa.10 The process was characterized by wars of liberation against an authoritarian regime in the metropole, which managed over more than a decade to organize a vigorous defense of two of the three territories in question. Moreover, the leadership of a part of the rebel movements was very well interconnected. The leaders of the parties and armed movements regarded as left-wing-the Movimento Popular de Libertação de Angola (MPLA), the Frente de Libertação de Moçambique (FRELIMO), and the PAIGC-frequently had a common background of radicalisation, in many cases during their presence as students in Portugal that were discriminated on racial grounds. In Cabo Verde, only a small part of the urban elite stood in contact with these networks during the years of the Portuguese authoritarian "New State" or Estado Novo.II However, the fact that a number of Cape Verdeans belonged to the leading circles of the PAIGC and participated in these leading positions during the successful struggle in Guinean territory, was of principal importance for the end of colonialism in the archipelago.¹² Even so, Ângela Countinho's impressive PhD thesis-which still awaits publication as a book-shows that it would be erroneous to regard the party and guerrilla movement in Guinea-Bissau pre-1974 as a Cape Verdean-dominated movement.¹³ But at the same time, the success on the mainland gave the PAIGC a reputation as a liberation

¹³Ângela S. Benoliel Coutinho, "Les dirigeants du PAIGC, parti africain pour l'indépendance de la Guiné-Bissau et du Cap-Vert: des origines à la scission: étude de parcours individuels, de stratégies familiales et d'idéologies," PhD Thesis (Université Paris I, 2005).

¹⁰See the overview in Martin Thomas, *Fight or Flight: Britain, France, and Their Roads from Empire* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), 208-262.

^{II}Dalila Cabrita Mateus, *A luta pela independência: A formação das elites fundadoras da FRELIMO, MPLA e PAIGC* (Mem Martins: Inquérito, 1999), 153-168.

¹²On the creation of the PAIGC and its roots in political events in Guinea-Bissau, see António E. Duarte Silva, "Guiné-Bissau: a causa do nacionalismo e a fundação do PAIGC," *Cadernos de Estudos Africanos* 9–10 (2006), consulted on 22 February 2016 (URL: http://cea.revues.org/I236; DOI: 10.4000/cea.1236).

movement that would obviously carefully prepare its ground for its activities in Cape Verde.

The analysis of these decolonization processes has been astonishingly superficial. Partly, this may be due to the activities of a first generation of historians of those processes, as many of the scholars in question were sympathizers and supporters of the liberation movements. Afterwards, little further progress has been made from the 1980s onwards. Although a number of important archives, initially in Portugal and later in the former colonies, have subsequently become available after 2000, this has not led to new analyses of the process. The fact that the overview of Norrie MacQueenwho in the end is a political scientist and not a historian-still counts as the principal study of Portuguese decolonization, speaks for itself.¹⁴ The experience of the war situation from various perspectives and concerning various types of agencies and groups of actors, has not really been interpreted.¹⁵ A recent attempt by Pamila Gupta to approach the experience of Portuguese decolonization, for example in Mozambique, is exemplary for the few existing attempts by favouring unsystematic interpretation without social historical context, through visual and oral accounts, over the systematic study of social processes.¹⁶ I am not saying here that such approaches—"ethnographic but ... attuned to history" as Gupta claims—are irrelevant. However, they only make wider analytic sense if based on the historical study of social processes.

However, this problem goes beyond the study of the officially Lusophone societies in sub-Saharan Africa. Certainly, the conditions of the "Lusophone

¹⁶Pamila Gupta, "Decolonization and (Dis)Possession in Lusophone Africa," in Darshan Vigneswaran and Joel Quirk, eds., *Mobility Makes States: Migration and Power in Africa* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), 169-193, esp. 173-176.

¹⁴Norrie MacQueen, *The Decolonization of Portuguese Africa: Metropolitan Revolution and the Dissolution of Empire* (London and New York: Longman, 1997).

¹⁵Only some issues of the war years have been studied so far. Road connections and the social history of Angola are analysed in Inge Brinkman, "Routes and the War for Independence in Northern Angola (1961–1974)," *Canadian Journal of African Studies* 40 (2) (2006): 205-234; the studies of Allen Isaacman, including the last on the history of the Cabora Bassa Dam in Mozambique, can be read in a similar way, see Allen F. Isaacman and Barbara S. Isaacman, *Dams, Displacement, and the Delusion of Development: Cabora Bassa and Its Legacies in Mozambique, 1965–2007* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2013), 95-121, 135-146. We can find a more profound interpretation of the guerrilla in Guinea-Bissau in the older study of Mustafah Dhada, *Warriors at Work: How Guinea was Really set Free* (Niwot/CO: University Press of Colorado, 1993).

countries" have provoked a particular type of politicization of the decolonization issue, in which the interest of scholars seems to have remained centered on specific deeds of the leaders of anticolonial movements and on some spectacular massacres.¹⁷ But the absence of a social history of populations during the decolonization years is a general phenomenon for a large number of African states and societies.¹⁸ This is likely to have to do with research priorities on the one hand, and with a problematic approach to available sources on the other. One principal if surprising problem of current research activities is the lack of engagement with postcolonial archival documentation-and even with late colonial archival resources. In some cases, this is a simple consequence of the fact that documents produced by the administrations of the independent states seem to be unavailable. However, in many circumstances, historians give too much credence to information pointing to the eventual destruction of entire archival holdings. This information frequently has little to do with the facts. Therefore, it has to be said that a recent special dossier in the journal History in Africa, comes to a surprisingly negative picture concerning the access to archives. This picture is erroneous in many cases.¹⁹ In a number of West African countries-I might just cite Benin, Togo, Ghana, Senegal, or Burkina Faso-greater progress could be made with regard to postcolonial archival holdings; a more

¹⁷See the excellent (if classical) Michel Cahen, "The Mueda Case and Maconde Political Ethnicity: Some Notes on a Work in Progress," *Africana Studia* 2 (1999): 29-46.

¹⁸One of the few exceptions is Kate Skinner, "Who Knew the Minds of the People? Specialist Knowledge and Developmentalist Authoritarianism in Postcolonial Ghana," *Journal* of Imperial and Commonwealth History 39 (2) (2011): 297-323.

¹⁹Within the dossier, see the exemplary article of Florence Bernault, "Suitcases and the Poetics of Oddities: Writing History from Disorderly Archives," *History in Africa* 42 (2015): 269-277. Only the article by John Straussberger – which discusses the potentials of a provincial archive in Guinea-Conakry – points into a different direction, see John Straussberger, "Fractures and Fragments: Finding Postcolonial Histories of Guinea in Local Archives," *History in Africa* 42 (2015): 299-307. A prognosis of the problem of postcolonial archives – an unsurprising problem – was already expressed by Stephen Ellis: "Bluntly stated, it is unlikely that historians seeking to write the history of Africa since independence will enjoy the same quality of documents as their colleagues studying the colonial period" (Stephen Ellis, "Writing Histories of Contemporary Africa," *Journal of African History* 43 (1) (2002): 1-26, 12-13 (see the quote on page 12)). And Ellis is right – but this does not mean that the historians will not find *any* documents! There are quite a lot in many cases.
concentrated effort towards undertaking and including archival research would indeed be helpful.

In the case of Cabo Verde, the potential for research progress is impressive. The Library and Archives of the Presidency in Praia are currently carrying out a project of classification of the archives of the president's office and of some ministries; this will in the future become a new important place of historical sources.²⁰ The National Archives of Cabo Verde have a number of projects to digitalise the archival documentation of town halls in the different islands, although little has come out of these attempts. The PAICV may in the future offer access to its own archives, which were during some time said to have been destroyed during the fall of the one-party regime in 1991.²¹ In some of the town halls the access to the municipal archives might be possible in the future (and especially if there is finally some interest of historians in their holdings), but in most cases this is not yet the case.

Elsewhere, access to postcolonial archives is already possible (if difficult), and my study is based on the interpretation of a number of unexplored archives. The archives of the Ministry of Rural Development, in Achada São Filipe, are important for the study of the local experience of decolonization in Praia and in the island of Santiago; similarly, the municipal archives of São Vicente are essential for an understanding of the local transition of power. These new sources allow for a dense history of both social and sociopolitical transitions.

Uneasy transition: the creation of a PAIGC platform in Praia and Mindelo

In many accounts, the situation of nationalist mobilization in Cabo Verde after 25 April 1974 tends to be presented as a straightforward story.²² This comes in part from the fact that the relatively few existing interpretations are mainly based on the narrated versions of leading politicians, such as the long-term Cape Verdean president, Aristides Pereira.²³ However, we find a

²⁰Conversation with Any Cardoso, director of the Library of the Presidential Palace, Praia, 11 January 2016.

²¹Conversation with the Administrative Secretary of the PAICV in Praia, PAICV Party Building, 11 January 2016.

²²An example of this approach is Leila Leite Hernandez, *Os filbos da terra do sol: a forma*ção do estado-nação em Cabo Verde (São Paulo: Solo Negro, 2002), 187-201.

²³Aristides Pereira, *O meu testemunho: uma luta, um partido, dois países* (Lisbon: Notícias, 2003); Jorge Querido, *Cabo Verde: Subsídios para a história da nossa luta de libertação* (Lisbon:

number of indications suggesting that the PAIGC, as the successful force of the struggle in Guinea-Bissau, where it was on the verge of victory already before the downfall of the authoritarian regime in Lisbon, was unprepared to quickly play a role in the archipelago. Only thanks to a number of supporters under the denomination of Frente Ampla Anticolonial, the presence of the PAIGC finally became dominant in Praia and Mindelo alike -although this was a gradual process, over a number of months, and in which the question of the support base remains complex.²⁴ In much of the existing literature, the December 1974 treaty is taken as evidence that Portuguese officials were so impressed by the party's dominance in the islands that they decided for a rapid transition of power. The remaining observations made by the few more analytical studies are then mainly interested in the unsuccessful steps towards creation of a union between Guinea-Bissau and Cabo Verde, which finally failed with the Guinean coup d'état in 1980. Cultural manifestations and sports events indicated a change towards the development of a Cape Verdean national identity, which was formed in the end without any link with Guinea.²⁵

How convincing is this description of the local support bases for 1974? Obviously, the initial absence of a more clearly visible rebel movement in the islands had to do with two factors: the activity of a (slightly overnervous) political police responding to any social movement with repression; and the commitment of a Cape Verdean elite—both in the archipelago and in other Portuguese colonies—which, in spite of experiences of racist discrimination, did not sympathise with the liberation movements.²⁶ The Portuguese Polícia Internacional e da Defesa do Estado (the political police: PIDE), converted into Directorate-General of Security Issues (Direcção-Geral

Vega, 1988).

²⁴Antero da Conceição Monteiro Fernandes, "Guiné – Bissau e Cabo Verde: Da Unidade à Separação," unpublished MA thesis, University of Porto, 2007, 34-35.

²⁵Víctor Andrade de Melo and Rafael Fortes, "Identidade em transição: Cabo Verde e a taça Amílcar Cabral," *Afro-Ásia* 50 (2014): 11-44, 14.

²⁶Alexander Keese, "Imperial Actors? Cape Verdean Mentality in the Portuguese Empire under the *Estado Novo*, 1926–1974," in Eric Morier-Genoud and Michel Cahen, eds., *Imperial Migrations: Colonial Communities and Diaspora in the Portuguese World* (Basingstoke and New York: PalgraveMacmillan, 2012): 129-148; a different picture, insisting on the role of the various resistance groups, dominates in José Augusto Pereira, *O PAIGC perante o dilemma Cabo-Verdiano* [1959–1974] (Lisbon: Casa da Comunicação, 2015), 140-147.

de Segurança: DGS), was rigorous in crushing, for example, a group of workers in Ribeira Grande, in Santo Antão, who were suspected to be communists and PAIGC supporters.²⁷ Jorge Querido, a key PAIGC middleman in both São Vicente and Praia, was efficiently neutralized during that and other occasions.²⁸ Moreover, police repression included pressures of PIDE agents against the families of suspicious Cape Verdean students in the metropole: the future director of the agricultural services of independent Cabo Verde, Horácio Constantino da Silva Soares, was part of a first generation of Cape Verdean students whose parents experienced such pressure.²⁹ This method was increasingly used in the 1960s and early 1970s.

The influence of a number of Cape Verdean administrators belonging to the elite was also instrumental in calming the spirits during the last years of colonial rule. While some of these members of the administrative core group had shown signs of opposition to the violence inherent in Portuguese colonial rule, most did not break with the colonial regime before the Carnation Revolution. The large majority of these officials fled from the archipelago in summer 1974, preferring a Lisbon exile to the struggle with the nationalist movement and especially the PAIGC, which they regarded as led by radicals.³⁰

In July 1974, Policarpo de Sousa Santos visited Cabo Verde as a special envoy of the revolutionary government. Sousa Santos is a complex witness, but highly interesting; his testimony is unique and can in my view be used for an analysis of the social forces in the months after 25 April. As an inspector and as acting administrator of Praia during the worst ravages of the

²⁷Arquivo Nacional da Torre do Tombo, Lisbon, Portugal (ANTT), PIDE/DGS, Del. CV Praia, 124/SR, NP 5409, Sub-inspector of the PIDE in Praia to Inspector of the Delegation of Cabo Verde, *Agitação de trabalhadores no concelho da Ribeira Grande – Santo Antão* (n° 8/I-S.R.), II Feb. 1969, 10.

²⁸ANTT, PIDE/DGS Del. CV Praia, 124/SR, NP 5409, José Vasco Meireles, Director of the Sub-Delegation of the PIDE in Praia, to Director-Geral of the PIDE, *Averiguações em Santo Antão relacionadas com a agitação dos trabalhadores em Fevereiro último.* (n° 64/S.R.), 22 May 1969, p. 4. On the broader role of Querido, see also Pereira, *PAIGC*, 129.

²⁹Arquivo Histórico Nacional de Cabo Verde, Praia, Cabo Verde (AHNCV), RPSAC, SC:A\SR:R\ Cx217, Tadeu do Carmo Monteiro, Administrator of District of São Nicolau, Commissioner of Post of Q.A., to Director of the Provincial Department of the Services of Civil Administration (n° 453/957/Jba), 14 Aug. 1957.

³⁰Luís Batalha, *The Cape Verdean Diaspora in Portugal: Colonial Subjects in a Postcolonial World* (Oxford: Lexington Books, 2004), 88-94.

1948 famine, this official had close contacts with the older generation of Cape Verdean officials; his vocal criticism of the colonial policy in the archipelago earned him a downturn in his career.³¹ As labour inspector in Mozambique in the 1960s, Sousa Santos remained a liberal; even so, he was loyal to the authoritarian regime. After the downfall of the Portuguese *Estado Novo*, this envoy opined that the cities of the archipelago were now dominated by a small minority of 'racist' radicals.³² His discussion was a mixture of wishful thinking and attentive empirical observation:

From here started in Santiago, and in particular in the city of Praia, half a dozen of individuals, to which just the *infamous colonialist regime*, the one that had endured for five hundred years in the archipelago, gave the chance—thanks to direct and indirect support of the Government, thanks to study grants and exceptions from inscription fees, university subsidies and other forms of support in the Metropole—to obtain a higher education diploma; this half a dozen of individuals, of which some are installed in the structures of official administration, this group of individuals started under the atmosphere of freedom instituted by the movement of 25 April, to disarticulate the structures of administrative organization themselves, by uncontrolled propaganda, by the activity of pamphleteers who do not refrain to use the meanest forms of personal attacks or of systematic defamation, of forthright offence against the institutions and the services of the State, arriving as it is publicly known to bring forth insults against the entities and functions in immediate relationship with the most representative levels of the sphere of government.³³

Certainly, the envoy of the revolutionary government underestimated the support base of the Frente Ampla, the nationalist group around Querido, Centeno, Rodrigues, Felisberto Vieira Lopes and David Hopffer Almeida.³⁴ The events of the Summer of 1974—and especially the commemor-

³¹Alexander Keese, "Managing the Prospect of Famine: Cape Verdean Officials, Subsistence Emergencies, and the Change of Elite Attitudes during Portugal's Late Colonial Phase, 1939–1961," *Itinerario* 35 (2) (2012): 48-69.

³²Arquivo Histórico Ultramarino, Lisbon, Portugal (AHU), Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, Policarpo de Sousa Santos, *Cabo Verde e a auto-determinação* (without number), without date [probably July 1974], 2-3.

³³AHU, Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, Policarpo de Sousa Santos, *Cabo Verde e a auto-determinação* (without number), without date [probably July 1974], 3.

³⁴AHU, Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, Policarpo de Santos Sousa, *Viagem ao Arquipélago de Cabo*

ation of the Pidjiguiti incident (which had taken place in Bissau in 1959)demonstrated that in the urban centres at least (if not in some of the rural districts of Santiago, where the residents were initially hostile against the movement), different groups were eager to be mobilized in solidarity with the Guinean activities. A principal observation of Sousa Santos was nevertheless accurate: the sympathizers of the PAIGC had been lucky to get control of the newspaper "Arquipélago" and of the Radio Clube de Cabo Verde, and they profited immensely by using the radio station to diffuse the programme "Grito de Cabo Verde" ("Cry from Cabo Verde").³⁵ This particular constellation reversed the initial relative weakness of the PAIGC supporters in Praia: the attacks against some individuals working for the administration, the burning of a number of cars and residences on 30 April and 1 May 1974, were first signals of this development.³⁶ Moreover, the activists of the PAIGC started to insist, especially, on the necessity of an agrarian reform that would benefit smallholders. In Santiago, this discourse allowed the party gaining some ground in the rural districts.³⁷

In São Vicente, it is even more complicated to measure the strength of the PAIGC by the Summer of 1974. Some of the most engaged activists of those months, such as Amiro Faria—technician working for the town hall in Mindelo—Júlio Vera-Cruz, the engineer Tito Lívio or António Augusto Costa—were able to profit from the sympathy of a part of the armed forces for the liberation movement, to strengthen an unstable position, converting poetry sessions into political meetings. In those months, control over the

Verde, em comissão eventual de serviço, determinada por despacho de S.Exa. o Secretário de Estado de Administração, em plena concordância com S.Exa. o Ministro de Coordenação Interterritorial: (without number), 30 July 1974, 5.

³⁵AHU, Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, Policarpo de Sousa Santos, *Cabo Verde e a auto-determinação* (without number), without date [probably July 1974], 2-3.

³⁶AHU, Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, *Apontamentos: Momento político após o "25 de Abril"* (without number), without date, I.

³⁷AHU, Espólio particular António Policarpo de Sousa Santos, Cx. I, Relatório sobre a viagem de serviço a Cabo Verde, Projecto de uma Mensagem a enviar ao Presidente da República e à Junta da Salvação Nacional apresentada pelo Eng°. Duarte Fonseca depois de Contactos com Elementos representativos de diversas Correntes de Opinião, e que será sujeita à Discussão na Reunião pública que se realiza no Dia 27 de Maio pelas 18 Horas na Sala de Conferências do Centro de Estudos, na Cidade da Praia. [...] (without number), without date, 3.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

THE CULTURES OF THE EMPIRE: GENDER, IDENTITY, MEMORY

55

Portuguese-speaking Goan Women Writers in Late Colonial India (1860-1940)

Filipa Lowndes Vicente Instituto de Ciências Sociais, Universidade de Lisboa

Introduction

In this article, I will propose a path for the identification and analysis of Goan women's written production within the late colonial context of Portuguese India.¹ To constitute an archival corpus of easily available sources ought to be the initial step, firstly, to promote a wider use of women's intellectual production within an intersectional analysis of gender, ethnicity, caste, class and sexuality in the fields of the intellectual and cultural history of India and of Portuguese India and, secondly, to trace life biographies and itineraries that will further complexify the historical narratives on Goa. The study of female authors along with what they authored can contribute to the wider study of the rich corpus of Goan print culture during this period. Here I will concentrate, however, on non-fiction texts, as the great majority of women during this period are not exploring fiction, as will happen later on, mainly from the 1960s onwards.

The Goan case, and the questions it suggests, may also be useful for researchers concentrating on other geographical spaces, both in Asia as well as in other spheres of the Portuguese colonial experience. The fact that I will concentrate on the works of Goan Indian women—and not on those written by Portuguese-born women writers on Goa—is deliberate. Despite the legitimacy, and the relevance, of analysing Portuguese women's participation in the colonial intellectual sphere, I will argue for the need of concentrating on the indigenous printed female word, from Goa, or away from Goa, as this is also the period of the great increase in the Goan diaspora. There are multiple questions to be raised in the intersection of gender and a

Portuguese Studies Review (PSR) 25 (1) 2017

BIBLID 25 (1) (2017) 315-345 | ISSN 1057-1515 print – \$ see back matter ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage

JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr



^IResearch for this article was carried out as part of the FAPESP thematic project "Pensando Goa" (proc. 2014/15657-8).

^{© 2017} Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

modern print culture, one that in the nineteenth and twentieth century grew enormously at a global level.² Both phenomena are intertwined—women started writing and publishing globally in a significant way when printed reproductive words became a much more easy, cheaper, democratic and multiple process. Goa, with its diverse and prolific print culture protagonised by Goans, fits particularly well into the new approaches of a global intellectual history, mainly one concentrated on Asia.

Many of the publications we will analyse confront us with the transnationality or frontier fluidity of sources.³ Should we place their study in a "Portuguese" centred historical approach to gender and empire? Or should we rethink our own "national" categories of analysis in order to allow for more intertwined histories, those that do not fit easily in a "Portuguese" or a "British" colonial frame? Would it not make more sense to place these cases of Goan women writers within an "Indian" frame, even in a colonial period? Would not this turn out to be a more legitimate lens understand multiple itineraries where being ethnically Indian, and being a woman, can be as relevant as the fact of being of Portuguese nationality or living in British India? The many cases of Goan women where mobility, migration and circulation are an intrinsic and determinant aspect of their paths and where "national" and "colonial" identities are not that straightforward, can encourage us to pursue histories that problematize the colonial as the central frame of analysis.⁴

²For the Goan case see Rochelle Pinto, *Between Empires. Print and Politics in Goa* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2007) and Sandra Ataíde Lobo's PhD thesis "O desassossego goês. Cultura e política em Goa do liberalismo ao Acto Colonial" (Faculdade de Ciência Sociais e Humanas, Universidade Nova de Lisboa, 2013). For the British Indian case see, for example, Ellen Brinks, *Anglophone Indian Women Writers, 1870–1920* (London: Routledge, 2013) or Robert Darnton, "Book Production in British India, 1850-1900," *Book History* 5 (2002): 239-262.

³Transnational approaches have been associated both with gender and with colonial spheres, resulting in extensive bibliographies. For two very interesting recent examples see Clare Midgley, Alison Twells and Julie Carlier, eds., *Women in Transnational History: Connecting the Local and the Global* (Abingdon, Oxon & New York, NY: Routledge, 2016); Pamela S. Nadell and Kate Haulman, eds., *Making Women's Histories: Beyond National Perspectives* (New York: New York University Press, 2013).

⁴Tony Ballantyne and Antoinette Burton, "Introduction: Bodies, Empires and World Histories," in T. Ballantyne and A. Burton, *Bodies in Contact: Rethinking Colonial Encounters in World History* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), 1-15; Bonnie G. Smith, *Women's History in Global Perspective*, vols. 1-3 (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2004).

A rich post-colonial historiography produced by historians from Goa from the 1990s onwards has included gender subjects and approaches within its wider reflection on Goa.⁵ It is not by chance that, as it has happened in other contexts, women's history became relevant only when women entered the historical professions beyond the status of "exceptions". Within this context, the work of Fátima da Silva Gracias should be acknowledged, namely for her book *Kaleidoscope of Women in Goa* or *The Many Faces of Sundorem. Women in Goa*, or her recent monograph on the Goan painter Angela Trindade.⁶

Goan women's writings in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries—in all forms and categories—as well as their visual production could be sources for multiple approaches. Literary and comparative studies, as well as anthropology⁷ have been much more active than history in finding rich sources and subjects in the entanglement of gender, the colonial and the lusophone.⁸ An acknowledgement of the rich British scholarship on the intersection of gender with the colonial, especially for the case of Colonial British India, is also necessary to reflect on the Goan case.⁹

⁸See e.g. Joana Passos' PhD thesis on women writers in Goa, "Micro-universes and Situated Critical Theory: Postcolonial and Feminist Dialogues in a Comparative Study of Indo-English and Lusophone Women Writers," PhD Dissertation (University of Utrecht, 2003); and Rosa Maria Perez, "The Rhetoric of Empire: Gender Representations in Portuguese India," *Portuguese Studies* 21 (2005): 126-141.

⁹Indira Ghose, Women Travellers in Colonial India. The Power of the Female Gaze (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1998); Geraldine Forbes, Women in Colonial India. Essays on Politics, Medicine, and Historiography (New Delhi: Chronicle Books, 2005); Sangeeta Ray, En-gendering India. Woman and Nation in Colonial and Postcolonial Narratives (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2000); Mary A. Procida, Married to the Empire: Gender, Politics and

⁵Celsa Pinto, "Women's Inheritance Rights: Conflict and Confrontation," in *Goa; Images and Perceptions* (Panjim: Prabhakar Bhide, 1996), 29-37; Fátima da Silva Gracias, *Kaleidoscope of Women in Goa, 1510-1961* (New Delhi: Concept Publication Company, 1994).

⁶Fátima da Silva Gracias, *Ângela Trindade: A Trinity of Light, Colour and Emotion* (Pangim: Fundação Oriente, 2016); Gracias, *Kaleidscope of Women in Goa, 1510-1961*; Gracias, *The Many Faces of Sundorem. Women in Goa* (Tirunelveli: Surya Publications, 2007); Gracias, "A mulher na literatura indo-portuguesa. Diversas facetas de Sundorem," *Mare Liberum* 9 (July 1995): 349-361.

⁷Given that the bibliography is extensive, here I will only reference a few examples. Many members of the International Project *Pensando Goa* have published widely on twentieth-century literature produced by Goan women, mainly for the period after that which concerns the scope of this article: Cielo Griselda Festino, Edith Melo Furtado, Fátima Gracias, Viviane Souza Madeira and Paul Melo e Castro. See e.g. Paul Melo e Castro and Cielo G. Festino, eds., "Goan Literature in Portuguese," *Muse India*, 70 (2016).

How can we find women's writings within the vastness of the public and private archive, the written and visual?¹⁰ After all, historical sources on women's issues are harder to locate.¹¹ Their names and traces in the archive are particularly prone to the vicious circle of invisibility—they are less studied because they are less available and visible; they are less available and visible because they have tended to be less valued, and thus less saved, less classified and, consequently, less studied. To identify and analyse the writings by women—in this case Goan women more than Portuguese women writing on Goa—in the late Portuguese colonial period could be, I would argue, a valuable mapping for further studies, and a way of calling attention to a rich body of primary sources that is largely unfamiliar. Through a historically embedded analysis, we could aim for an understanding of the specific and individual contexts that enabled some women—more, in number and influence, than is often acknowledged—to transgress the more traditional roles ascribed to them and become producers of knowledge in the public sphere.

I. Criteria and classification: bow to find women's printed words in the Goan archive

Amongst the many possible criteria for distinguishing different kinds of knowledge production by Goan women within the late Portuguese colonial period, I will propose two main lines of inquiry which could work as mere guidelines and be the first step to further approaches. Firstly, all published writings by Goan women, in all formats, autobiographical, academic, essayistic or journalistic texts, within books, newspapers, scientific journals or conference proceedings, in Portuguese colonial India, in British India, in Portugal or elsewhere. This section could be subsequently divided by sub-

Imperialism in India, 1883-1947 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2002).

¹⁰Nupur Chauduri, Sherry J. Katz and Mary Elizabeth Perry, eds., *Contesting Archives: Finding Women in the Sources*, foreword by Antoinette Burton (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2000).

^{II}Anjali Arondekar, For the Record: On Sexuality and the Colonial Archive in India (Durham: Duke University Press, 2009); Ann Laura Stoler, Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009); Ann Laura Stoler "Colonial Archives and the Arts of Governance," Archival Science 2 (1-2) (2002): 87-109; Gayatri Chakrabarty Spivak, "The Rani of Sirmur: An Essay in Reading the Archives," History and Theory 24 (1985): 247-272; Gayatri Chakrabarty Spivak, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" in Cary Nelson and Lawrence Grossberg, eds., Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1988): 271-313.

ject, including all the printed materials destined to wider publics, ranging from travel narratives and children's literature to pedagogical issues or the "woman question", a major global theme also much present in Goa. A major section should be dedicated to scientific writings: articles and reports on scientific missions; botanical and natural history, or the medical sciences. Another line of inquiry would concentrate on writings such as diaries and correspondence produced within a private sphere, but also family printed publications such as In Memoriams. Oral interviews—memoires and postmemoires—would be fundamental for research on more contemporary periods. I believe that visual sources—bi-dimensional documents often combining image and text, such as photography and book illustration—should not be isolated from textual ones and are central to understanding nineteenth and twentieth century print culture but, due to the limitations of this article, I will not include them in this analysis.

The limits such criteria entail are manifold, and I am aware of the subjectivity and problems they can imply. These working categories will only serve as guidelines, because the blurring of textual frontiers is a characteristic of writing itself during this period. Natural history knowledge, for example, can be especially problematic. Precisely because women had little or no access at all to writing in scholarly journals, they often presented their knowledge in other non-scholarly formats, such as travel narratives or newspaper articles. Moreover, there are discernible crossings and overlappings between these different divisions. As we shall see through specific cases, the same woman could write on different subjects and in different configurations. A biographical approach should overcome artificial writing divisions. Specific writings and images, their intellectual and creative production, would be used as a point of departure for an in-depth study of specific women's itineraries and biographies.

Having been under Portugal's hegemonic rule since the sixteenth century with active policies of religious, linguistic and cultural conversion meant that by the nineteenth century there was a thriving Indian Catholic elite, writing in Portuguese, and also in English, especially those living in Bombay, and with access to both British India and the print culture of Portuguese India. There were hierarchies and conflicts within this heterogeneous community, certainly, but access to writing in newspapers meant the existence of a common platform of multiple voices, including the voices of women. A Hindu elite also used the Portuguese language in their publications, to be able to dialogue with the dominant culture and to make their voice heard with the local government. The presence of Hindu women within this press should be an object of inquiry. A major limit to my proposal is that of language. Not being able to read Indian languages such as Konkani or Marathi, I am limited to those Goan printed sources in Portuguese and English, and this will necessarily determine the scope of the history I can write. In a way, this constraint, even if for very distinct reasons, has some similarities with the invisibility of women's sources. This limitation has historiographical repercussions that should be overcome by scholars who are able to dominate both Indian and European languages.

Another problematic aspect of the line of inquiry I propose, is the fact that they are centred on a minority of women who had access to a written, scientific and print culture, those who possessed intellectual agency, and therefore those instruments to transform their thoughts, research, ideas, complaints, doubts, fears, emotions, or ideological and political positions into a written or a visual form, mostly one which was projected into a public sphere. This implies the exclusion of the great majority of women who occupied multiple positions within the space of Goa. However, this exercise can also work as a mirror for those women who had no access to a written and public culture, as women could be closer to other women, both in activities and in spaces. In contexts where gender identities and roles were very differentiated, the knowledge produced by women could be more aware of other women's experiences, lives and specificities, also of those who could not read or write.

Apart from texts written by women on women's issues, another way of gendering Goan history during this period is by grasping ideas that were being quoted and translated or written by men, on women's issues. It was common for the Goan press to appropriate texts in foreign newspapers and translate them into Portuguese. In 1868, a small, unsigned, article on "The Political Rights of Women" appeared on the Goan *Jornal de Notícias*.¹² The "cause of women's equality in relation to the law", had a "new and powerful" defender, the article announces. Besides Stuart Mill, Gladstone had publicly accepted the legitimacy of women's demands. The Goan newspaper translates two letters quoting from the *Liverpool Mercury*: the one written by the

¹²"Direitos políticos da mulher," Jornal de Notícias (10 December 1868): 11.

activist Josephine E. Butler publicly referring to the letter Gladstone had written her, and Gladstone's letter. Josephine Butler had asked Gladstone about his position in relation to two pre-eminent questions, that of the right of married women to hold on to their own property, and not pass it on to their husbands as it happened in the British law, and that of extending the electoral vote to women. Her letter was accompanied by Gladstone's missive. Indeed, he approved of both measures, even though with a few reservations he does not mention. Reproducing both letters in Portuguese, the Goan newspaper ended with a short note: despite the reservations of the "illustrious member of parliament", in his answer to "Mrs. Butler", he is "formally adhering to the principle of feminine emancipation". Shortly after the event took place in England, a Goan newspaper shared it with its readers along with other worldwide news, from Spain or Brazil. This circulation of information in Goa in 1868, on women's political and economical empowerment in other parts of the world, is a relevant fact that should be acknowledged in an analysis of the "woman question" in nineteenth century Goa. One pertinent dimension I will not explore here is that of writings by Goan men on women's issues, specially on women's education.

Finally, there is another aspect of nineteenth and twentieth century print culture that can contribute to finding women's roles, agency and voices, i.e. newspaper advertisements. Gilberto Freyre, for Brazil, and Mário António Fernandes de Oliveira, for Angola, have already reflected on the possibilities of paid ads in newspapers for making a social history of a city or of a condition, such as that of slavery.¹³ In my own work, I have found advertisements to be a very useful source for the writing of a history of photography in Goa for a period where there are hardly any images available.¹⁴ The same could be done in relation to women.

What do travel narratives, autobiographical, historical, essayistic texts, children's literature and educational projects, published in the book or newspaper format have in common beyond the fact of being printed? These

¹³Gilberto Freyre, O escravo no anúncios de jornal brasileiros do século XIX (Recife: Imprensa Universitária, 1963); Mário António Fernandes de Oliveira, Aspectos sociais de Luanda inferidos dos anúncios publicados na sua imprensa (Coimbra: s.n., 1965), offprint from Actas V Colóquio Internacional de Estudos Luso-Brasileiros, vol. 3.

¹⁴Filipa Lowndes Vicente, "Viagens entre a Índia e o arquivo: Goa em fotografias e exposições," in F. L. Vicente, ed., *O império da visão: fotografia no contexto colonial português, 1860-1960* (Lisboa: Edições 70, 2014), 319-342.

are heterogeneous writings, the only common thread being the printed format, meant to be read by others. This readership was also characterised by its heterogeneity: women readers, when addressing domestic issues; children, when writing children's stories; or non-gender specific audiences, when tackling subjects that were not associated with a specific age or gender. Is there thus a gender specificity to the kinds of texts women were publishing and to the kinds of formats they were publishing in? My answer would be yes. Children's literature was an easier subject and format for a woman than an article on government policy, on industry or on property.

A major source for my search on Goan women's publications was the three-volume dictionary on Goan literature published by Aleixo Manuel da Costa in 1997. Organised alphabetically, women's names are scattered throughout their nominal entries, their presence much reduced when compared to the rich written production of Goan men. A study of Goan women's participation in print culture requires a thorough survey within the vast number of periodicals published in Goa, something I have not done for this article. Aleixo Manuel da Costa mentions some who have collaborated in the press but whose articles have not been identified. In 1913 and 1914, the poet Paulino Dias, along with Adolfo Costa, founded the Revista da Índia and Ana de Ayala and Eugénia Froilano de Melo were amongst the collaborators.¹⁵ Somewhat later, in Bombay, a tri-lingual magazine published articles by Ermelinda Gomes.¹⁶ To identify a specific women's press—one destined to a female readership—is certainly another line of research, even if it does not necessarily mean that women were involved. The Recreio das Damas, for example, which appeared in the capital of Nova Goa in 1863, had João Filipe de Gouveia as its main editor.¹⁷

Another, similar, research path would be to look for women's oral interventions in the public sphere—conferences, speeches, presentations, some of which may be subsequently printed, while others may only appear as a title in a program, but not wholly reproduced. This is the case, for example, of Teodolinda Álvares da Gama who made a speech along with two men, one of them her husband Acácio da Gama, from the Gama family of Vernã, at a

¹⁵Aleixo Manuel da Costa, "Revista da Índia," in *Dicionário de Literatura Goesa* (Macau: Instituto Cultural de Macau; Fundação Oriente, 1997), 3: 136.

¹⁶Costa, "Popular Magazine (The)," in Dicionário, 3: 87.

¹⁷Costa, "Recreio das Damas," in Dicionário, 3: 117.

literary salon in Bombay.¹⁸ The site was the *Instituto Luso-Indiano*, a Goan cultural center in the British Indian city, while the occasion was the first major historical date to be celebrated in the Lusophone world, the 1898 Fourth Centenary of Vasco da Gama's arrival in India.

2. Female science between pedagogy and profession: writing on medicine, natural history or geography

By the mid-twentieth century, a growing number of Goan women started studying at a higher level, in Goa itself, in India after 1947, or in the Portuguese metropolis, a path their male counterparts had taken since the early nineteenth century and even before.¹⁹ Independently of their national, ethnic or colonial identities, frequently these women were daughters or wives of male scientists, doctors or botanists. The ways in which personal relationships are intertwined with professional ones is a subject that has been explored in relation to writers, artists and scientists.²⁰ How do gender relations, hierarchies, and negotiations interfere and determine the possibilities of knowledge and creative production by women? The more invisible subjective dimensions had plenty of repercussions in the more visible and public aspects of women's career itineraries and professional choices. Other ambivalences were also at stake: the same relationships that might have contributed to women's participation in scientific practices and productions, could also contribute to subaltern their roles and subjugate their protagonism.

One case study I am now working on may exemplify these tensions. Gerson da Cunha (1844-1900)—historian and doctor, Goan, Catholic, Brahmin, a man of Portuguese nationality who lived in Bombay, British colonial India

¹⁸Quarto Centenário de D. Vasco da Gama. Discursos proferidos no sarau literário do Instituto Luso-Indiano. Na noite de 18 Maio de 1898 (Bombaim: Tip. Nicol's Printing Works, 1898); Teodolinda Maria Carlota Álvares was married in Vernã on 12 Feb. 1882 with Acácio da Gama, with whom she had a daughter and two sons. I thank Pedro do Carmo Costa for this reference.

¹⁹Miguel Vicente de Abreu, *Noção de alguns filhos distintos da India portuguesa que se ilustram fora da pátria* (Nova Goa: Imp. Nacional, 1874).

²⁰Helena Mary Pycior, Nancy G. Slack and Pnina G. Abir-Am, *Creative Couples in the Sciences* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1996); Marjorie Stone and Judith Thompson, *Literary Couplings: Writing Couples, Collaborators, and the Construction of Authorship* (Madison: Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 2006); Deborah Shepard, ed., *Between the Lives: Partners in Art* (Auckland: Auckland University Press, 2005).

—had three children. One of them, a girl, followed in her father's professional footsteps, no doubt encouraged by his belief in her talents and intelligence, which he communicated in a letter, to his friend Angelo De Gubernatis.²¹ Emmeline da Cunha studied in the same Bombay medical college where her father had studied, the Grant Medical College (1896) and, as he did, then went to Europe to broaden her knowledge. First, at the London School of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene, where she specialised in bacteriology, and then at the University of Florence. Upon her return to Bombay, she worked as a doctor in the port of Bombay during a crucial period—that of the Bombay bubonic plague, which prompted the creation of a globalised network of scientific research, and was involved in control and elimination of the disease. In a recent bibliography on women and medicine in India, Emmeline da Cunha appears as a pioneer, one of the first women doctors in India.²²

Her case suggests a range of gender related questions that may be pertinent for other case studies. The first part of her biography is one of transgression of gender limitations and expectations, and one is tempted to place her in the categories of "pioneer" and "heroine", while also acknowledging her father's role in her career. However, when we look at the second part of her life, we realise how marriage was a turning point. After marrying a doctor with a similar itinerary as hers, she disappeared from the map of written sources, leaving the public realm for a private, historically inaccessible, sphere. She ceases to work and she vanishes as a historical subject. This, I would argue, is also a historical fact in itself, and one that only a gender sensitive approach can grasp and identify. Marriage could be a turning point for women scientists in a way that has no correspondence to their male counterparts, in the same way that being single and childless were, recurrently, a condition for women to develop their professional careers.

An analogous case—also a nineteenth century Goan woman in Bombay, and with family ties to a prominent and scholarly Goan man—was that of D. Júlia Rodrigues. She was the wife of José Camilo Lisboa, born in Bardez like her, who belonged to the first generation of Goan men who studied

²¹Filipa Lowndes Vicente, Other Orientalisms. India between Florence and Bombay (1860-1900) (New Delhi: Orient Blackswan, 2012), 121.

²²Mridula Ramanna, Western Medicine and Public Health in Colonial Bombay, 1844-1895 (New Delhi: Orient Longman, 2002), 185.

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

War Narratives Then and Now: Ex-Combatants' Memories of Angola

Maria José Lobo Antunes CRIA – Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas, Universidade Nova de Lisboa

I. Introduction

On 15 January 1971, the luxury liner Vera Cruz arrived in Luanda. Once built to carry passengers on transatlantic journeys, Vera Cruz now carried hundreds of soldiers.¹ On that same Friday, eight military units started their tour of duty in Africa.² Among them was the Artillery Company 3313 (CART 3313), one of the three operating companies of the Artillery Battalion 3835. This unit, composed of 120 men led by a captain, was mainly formed by conscripts, recruited and trained to defend the integrity of the 'pluri-continental nation'. During the first year of their posting, CART 3313 was positioned close to the border with Zambia, in Eastern Angola. This region had, since the late 1960s, been the main focus of nationalist insurgency in the territory. In Eastern Angola, this army unit lived a daily routine of tension and waiting, interspersed with ambushes, combat actions against the guerrillas, and landmines. Dead and wounded inevitably followed. In January 1972, CART 3313 headed to the much more peaceful sector of Malanje. The Marimba headquarters, located in Baixa de Cassange region, was the operational centre of a military activity that focused on surveillance and on psychosocial



^IWhen war broke out in Angola in 1961, several Portuguese merchant navy vessels were drafted to transport troops and materials overseas. *Vera Cruz, Santa Maria* and *Príncipe Perfeito*, with a maximum capacity of a thousand passengers or more than two thousand soldiers, were the most frequently used vessels in that time. See Paulo Brázia, "A Marinha Mercante entre 1945 e 1985. As grandes armadoras," Tese de Mestrado em História Marítima (Faculdade de Letras da Universidade de Lisboa, 2010).

²According to *Livro da Unidade Bart 3835*, there were three battalions, two independent companies and two independent platoons travelling in Vera Cruz on that occasion. Arquivo Histórico Militar [AHM], *História da Unidade BART 3835* [HBART], PT/AHM/DIV/ 2/2/6/151.

action with local populations. Twenty-six months upon being deployed in Angola, CART 3313 was discharged and flew back to Portugal.

Based on an ethnography of war memory, this essay aims to explore the way Angola and its people are recalled by the men who were once part of CART 33I3.³ Ex-combatants' narratives reveal much more than a collection of memorable episodes in an exotic territory. The words selected, the stories told and the images conveyed reflect the ambiguities and contradictions that stem from two distinct historical moments: the *Estado Novo* (New State) period in which these men were called to arms, and the contemporary post-colonial time in which their memories are evoked.

CART 3313's conscripts were born in a country squeezed between the post-war international pressure for decolonization and the Estado Novo's determination to preserve its overseas territories. By the time they were schoolboys, an official rhetorical makeover was taking place: racial differences were banned from public discourse, the idea of empire was nowhere to be seen. From 1950s onwards, Portuguese exceptionalism was to be constructed around the alleged harmony that existed in all of its 'pluri-continental' parts. The Carnation Revolution of 1974 was to initiate a simultaneous process of democratization and decolonization. The Estado Novo's monolithic discourse vanished from the public sphere. By the end of 1975, the empire had collapsed and Portugal returned to the size of its European borders. For a few years, silence fell over the war and colonial past. With the turn of the century, this silence was replaced by a growing interest on the final years of the empire. The time had come for the emergence of "grey memories" (mémoires grises), reconfigurations of a colonial past with an uncertain hue that is engraved into a nebula of facts whose meaning is still under scrutiny.⁴

³This essay is based on my PhD dissertation in Anthropology, defended in 2015 at the Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas – Universidade Nova de Lisboa (FCSH-NOVA). The thesis presented an ethnography of war memory that combined several narratives: personal memories of thirty-one CART 3313's ex-combatants, the institutional army report on the unit's tour of duty, the war letters, and the literary narratives of António Lobo Antunes, conscript second-lieutenant and army doctor, as well as the public narratives about the war the colonial past. This research was funded by Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia (FCT) between 2009 and 2012. See Maria José Lobo Antunes, *Regressos quase perfeitos: Memórias da guerra em Angola* (Lisbon: Tinta-da-China, 2015).

Between these two moments in time, the men of CART 3313 went to war and lived to tell the tale. Compulsory military service made them grasp what before was nothing more than a set of abstract ideas, learned at school and echoed by the regime's propaganda. After their arrival in Angola, Africa became a tangible reality, infinitely more vivid and diverse than the images conveyed so far might have suggested. Forty years later, memories of these twenty-six months in Angola are shaped into a loose amalgam of episodes to which the ex-combatants seek to grant order and meaning on a constant journey where the imagined future (the greatness of the nation, exceptional racial harmony) is confronted with the recalled experience (the unequal distribution of resources between European settlers and Angolans). This journey between different temporalities is not a solitary one: it carries with it a multitude of mediations through which an image of the past can be produced in the present.⁵ Memory is, therefore, the result of a creative act of "composure" (as defined by Alistair Thomson), by which individuals construct their retrospective narratives and make these intelligible to others. Still, this process is not without difficulties: "Our attempts to compose are often not entirely successful and we are left with unresolved tension and fragmented, contradictory identities".⁶

Ex-combatants' memories of Angola entail a complex negotiation of meaning as it results from the articulation between the individual dimension of the lived experience and the social dimension of public rhetoric which organise personal narratives. Trapped between two moments in time (as well as to their respective chains of ideas, values, and national discourses), these memories combine disparate expressive resources, from the ethnocentric paternalism of the *Estado Novo*'s public rhetoric (the racist remains that survived the 1950s' official makeover), to the deconstruction of colonialism that emerged in the post-April 25 period. In the following pages,

⁴Christine Deslaurier and Aurélie Roger, "Mémoires grises. Pratiques politiques du passé colonial en Europe et Afrique,"*Politique Africaine* 102 (2006): 5-27.

⁵The ability to reconstruct past events is mediated through language, relationships with peers, rituals, social conventions. See, for instance, Paul Connerton, *Como as sociedades recordam* (Oeiras: Celta Editora, 1993); James Fentress e Chris Wickham, *Memória Social: Novas Perspectivas Sobre o Passado* (Lisbon: Teorema, 1992); Richard Johnson *et al.*, eds., *Making Histories: Studies in History Writing and Politics* (London: Hutchinson, 1982).

⁶Alistair Thomson, *Anzac Memories: Living With the Legend* (Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1994), 10.

350

the analysis of the ex-combatants' memories will map the ambiguities and contradictions contained in the narration process of Angola. The reconfiguration of those twenty-six months in Africa involves a double challenge for these men: it is not just a question of negotiating the meaning of their personal experience of the war (how to survive violence, courage or its absence). It is also about seeking, both in the past and present, elements that allow for the framing of this experience in the recent history of the country on behalf of which these men were asked to fight.

2. Narrating the Then and the Now

By mid-twentieth century, international pressure for decolonisation forced Portugal to reformulate the empire. In 1951, the Constitutional revision brought about a semantic change: the colonies were to be renamed as "overseas provinces" (províncias ultramarinas), and the empire gave way to a "pluri-continental nation" (*nação pluricontinental*).⁷ The concept of race was removed from the *Estado Novo*'s official discourse and social Darwinism was succeeded by a current of thought based on liberal humanism. However, the inability to truly integrate native African populations subsisted. It was no longer race that established the superiority over Africans, but "Western civilisation, imbued with Christian values of universal validity that black people will be able to attain if properly educated—this being Portugal's missionary responsibility".⁸

It was in this context of ideological reconfiguration that Gilberto Freyre's lusotropicalist theories won the attention they had lacked in the 30s and 40s.⁹ In 1951, Freyre was invited by the Ministry of Overseas for a six-month

⁷Reformulating the terms of the empire was no easy task. For an analysis of the resistances that surrounded the debate in the Corporatist Chamber (*Câmara Corporativa*) and National Assembly (*Assembleia Nacional*), see Cláudia Castelo 'O Modo Português de Estar no Mundo': O luso-tropicalismo e a ideologia colonial portuguesa (1933-1961) (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 1998), 48-61.

⁸Valentim Alexandre, "Portugal em África (1825-1974): Uma Perspectiva Global," *Penélope* 11 (1993): 64.

⁹In the 1930s and 1940s, Freyre's theories caused different reactions in Portuguese intellectual and political circles. Whilst the former showed interest for Freyre's ideas, the latter met the sociologist's work with distrust. See Yves Léonard, "Salazarisme et Lusotropicalisme, histoire d'une appropriation," *Lusotopie* (1997): 211-226 and Castelo, 'O Modo Português,' 69-87.

trip that included both the European "metropolis" and African and Asian "overseas provinces". The trip, which was carefully planned and supervised, represented the regime's political and ideological appropriation of Lusotropicalism.¹⁰ The propaganda of the regime echoed a simplified version of Freyre's ideas. This "lusotropicalist vulgate" provided the pillars for the reaffirmation of Portuguese exceptionalism, based on the alleged absence of racism and special ability to integrate cultures.¹¹ Promoted for both internal and external consumption, drained of the political intentions that dictated its adoption, the lusotropicalist vulgate helped naturalise the nationality concept it conveyed. Far from being viewed as a product of both an ideology and a concrete historical moment, the "Portuguese way of being-inthe-world" ("*o modo português de estar no mundo*") was taken as a timeless and unquestionable expression of its exceptional nature.

Contradictions were discernible beyond the surface of words. Legal paradoxes subsisted for ten years after the 1951 Constitutional revision. Immune to the good intentions of the apparently inclusive discourse of the multiracial nation, the State kept denying full citizenship to the overwhelming majority of the population of African territories. It was only in 1961, following the outset of the conflict in Angola, that the Indigenous Statute (*Estatuto do Indígena*) was revoked, putting an end to the legal distinction between natives and citizens. The system of mandatory crop production, which imposed living and labour conditions akin to slavery to African peasants, was abolished after the Baixa de Cassange insurgency.¹² The Rural Labour Code, issued in 1962, banned the practice of forced labour, thus freeing Africans from the moral obligation to work, and turning them into free subjects in the eyes of the law.¹³

¹⁰For an analysis of Freyre's trip and of its impact on the author's subsequent writing, see Castelo, '*O modo português*,' 87-96.

^{II}Yves Léonard, "Salazarisme et Lusotropicalisme", 225.

¹²For detailed analysis on the least known of the rebellions that shook the *Estado Novo* regime in the early sixties, see Aida Freudenthal "A Baixa de Cassange: algodão e revolta", *Revista Internacional de Estudos Africanos* 18-22 (1995-1999): 245-283 and René Pélissier *La Colonie du Minotaure: Nationalismes et révoltes en Angola (1926-1971)* (Orgeval: Pélissier,1978), 397-424.

¹³Legislative changes governing African labour were met with concern from some sectors of the settler population. See Cláudia Castelo, *Passagens para África: O Povoamento de Angola e Moçambique com Naturais da Metrópole* (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 2007) and

Paradoxes also existed in the way Africans were publicly represented. Until mid-twentieth century, the Portuguese media had portrayed Africans in subordinate positions, either as exotic natives immersed in their ancestral rituals, or as obedient and silent servants of the settlers.¹⁴ Race was the operative category that established essentialist distinctions between the Portuguese and the Africans. Subalternity was built around the attribution of an array of negative characteristics: indolence, irresponsibility, attachment to instincts and earthly pleasures. Official rhetorical makeover from the 1950s sought to dilute this image of subalternity. Censorship was reinforced with the outbreak of the conflict in Angola in early 1961. The images and words that reached the public affirmed in unison the unity and multiracial character of a nation spread throughout the world. Formulations suggesting racial distinction or insinuating a divide between the metropolis and the overseas provinces were carefully avoided.¹⁵

From the 1960s onwards, Africanisation of the media space was used to prove the plasticity of Portuguese culture. Overseas personalities and events acquired a new visibility and relevance. In spite of its public disappearance as a discursive category, race did not cease to work as a distinguishing element. Discursive bricolage recycled old ideas into new wordings, perpetuating the political relevance of the phenotype in the colonial context. Essentialisation persisted, albeit under a paternalistic guise. References to sensuality, physical strength or rhythmic uniqueness populated the news and accounts on overseas personalities or events. Occasional cracks emerged in the Portuguese self-proclaimed exceptionalism; humour shows in the

Douglas Wheeler e René Pélissier, História de Angola (Lisbon: Tinta da China, 2009 [1971]).

¹⁴A comprehensive analysis of Portuguese public discourses and images about Africans through movies, exhibitions, works of art, schoolbooks' reading materials and anthropological production, can be found in Patrícia Ferraz de Matos, *As Côres do Império: Representações Raciais no Império Colonial Português* (Lisbon: Imprensa de Ciências Sociais, 2006).

¹⁵These were two of the main guidelines that were provided by the draft norms produced in 1960 to steer Portuguese press censorship. See Cláudia Castelo, "A mensagem luso-tropical do colonialismo português tardio: o papel da propaganda e da censura" in Moisés de Lemos Martins, ed., *Lusofonia e Interculturalidade: Promessa e Travessia* (Famalicão: Edições Húmus, 2015), 433-49. The discursive surveillance that ensued can be illustrated through wordings like "dark-skinned men" ("homens morenos"), used by sports journalist Carlos Pinhão to designate football players that came from African territories. See Marcos Cardão, *Fado Tropical: O Luso-Tropicalismo na Cultura de Massas (1960-1974)* (Lisbon: Edições Unipop, 2014), 112.

1960s juggled with racist stereotypes.¹⁶ The "Portuguese way of being-in-the-world", presented in a seemingly benign tone, maintained the inequalities it claimed to fight.

This was the ideological context in which CART 3313's ex-combatants grew up and were drafted to military service. The overwhelming majority of CART 3313's ex-combatants recall having departed to the war believing that they would be taking part on an undeniably just moral cause.¹⁷ Decades later their discourses use expressions such as "homeland"(*pátria*) and the "defence of what was ours"(*a defesa do que é nosso*) to frame and retrospectively justify having followed the appeal to national unity. The vivid images of the UPA (Angolan People's Union) massacres of March 1961, which they had first seen as children, were lodged in their memories. The *Estado Novo* had used those pictures of horror in an unprecedented media campaign designed to create both absolute national unity and international solidarity.¹⁸

Military training defied official racial harmony claims. Ex-combatants recall being taught distrust as an imperative for survival. Given that any native (women, children, elderly) could be a 'terrorist', the colour of the skin acquired an absolute centrality in determining who could be one's foe. Carefully avoided by the official discourse, race was the visible element which drew the boundary that separated the nation from its enemies.

Four decades later, the memories of Angola are evoked in a totally different context. War and decolonisation, which had been relegated for years to a vast unpronounceable territory, slowly re-emerged in the public sphere. Por-

¹⁶Marcos Cardão analysed new forms of racialization in 1960s and 1970s Portuguese mass culture. The effects of lusotropicalism are discussed in areas as diverse as music, football, and beauty pageants. Humour shows are provided an occasion for amplifying and ridiculing presumed African mannerisms, as the accent or the alleged indolence. See Cardão, *Fado*.

¹⁷Only two of the 31 CART 3313's ex-combatants stated that they considered fleeing Portugal to avoid the war. By the late sixties these two men were living in Lisbon area, and they remember the political dissatisfaction that grew from 1969 onwards. Despite casting doubts about the justice of the Portuguese wars in Africa, these two ex-combatants eventually discarded desertion due to the retaliatory measures that their families could be subjected to. See Antunes, *Regressos*, 89-95.

¹⁸For an analysis of media campaign orchestrated by the *Estado Novo* after the UPA massacres of 1961, see Afonso Ramos, "Angola 1961, o horror das imagens," in Filipa Lowndes Vicente, ed., *O Império da Visão: Fotografia no contexto colonial português* (Lisbon: Edições 70, 2014), 399-434.

tuguese colonial war broke the silence it had been subjected to in the aftermath of the fall of the regime. Literature was a powerful "instrument for anamnesis", capable of breaking the historiographical, social, and political void of the last years of the empire.¹⁹ Civic intervention of ex-combatants' associations played an important role in acknowledging the devastating effect of trauma in ex-combatant's lives. A huge wave of public interest rose in the turn of the century. Two themes attracted (and still do) attention: the war and the colonial past. The re-visitation of the conflict, which happened in the form of critical investigations and collections of testimonies, has revealed small and large details of a historical event that was muted for years.²⁰ The colonial past, in turn, has been a subject of interest that feeds on literary, journalistic, iconographic or memorialist incursions—which, with just a few exceptions, paint nostalgic pictures of the world that vanished with the fall of the empire.²¹

Ambiguity marks this context of widespread evocation of the recent past of Portugal. The lack of an official politics of memory of the so-called Portuguese third empire, together with the impermeability of public memory to the critical questioning by recent historiography, has supported the institutionalized oblivion of the most brutal aspects of late colonialism.²² It is

²¹See, for instance, Paulo Salvador, *Recordar Angola: Fotos e Gentes, de Cabinda ao Cunene* (Lisbon: Quetzal Editores, 2004); Ana Sofia Fonseca, *Angola, Terra Prometida: A Vida que os Portugueses Deixaram* (Lisbon: A Esfera dos Livros, 2009). Two books break off the general nostalgic wave on the Portuguese colonial past: Dulce Maria Cardoso, *O retorno* (Lisbon: Edições Tinta da China, 2010) and Isabela Figueiredo, *Caderno de memórias coloniais* (Coimbra: Angelus Novus, 2009).

²²Cláudia Castelo, "Memórias coloniais: práticas políticas e culturais entre a Europa e África,"*Cadernos de Estudos Africanos 9/*10 (2006): 9-21.

¹⁹Paulo de Medeiros, "Hauntings: memory, fiction and the Portuguese colonial wars" in T.G. Ashplant et al, eds., *Commemorating War: The Politics of Memory* (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), 201-221. See also Margarida Calafate Ribeiro, *Uma história de regressos: império, guerra colonial e pós-colonialismo* (Porto: Edições Afrontamento, 2004).

²⁰See, among others, Aniceto Afonso e Carlos Matos Gomes, *Os anos da guerra colonial: 1961.1975* (Matosinhos: Quidnovi, 2010); Etelvino da Silva Batista, *Angola 1961-63: Diário de Guerra* (Lisbon: Três Sinais Editores, 2000); Manuel Catarino ed., *A Minha Guerra: Testemunhos de Combatentes. Angola 1961 50 Anos* (Lisbon: Presselivre/Correio da Manhã, 2011). Due to its impact in the general public, the TV documentary series *A Guerra* occupies a prominent place. The 42 episode series was aired by RTP, the Portuguese public broadcasting station, between 2007 and 2013. It combined archival images and dozens of interviews with direct witnesses. See Ansgar Schaefer, "Imagens de A Guerra. Interacção entre os discursos visual e verbal na série de Joaquim Furtado," *Práticas da História,* I (I) (2015): 33-60.

precisely in this marshland—where the transformation of historical circumstances was unable to challenge either old ideas or the vocabularies used in the ways the nation and its past are presented—that we must seek to understand the complexities and contradictions embedded in the memories of these ex-combatants.

3. Europeans, Africans and work.

By 1971, Angola had been dramatically transformed by rural resettlement. Used as a counterinsurgency strategy from the mid-sixties onwards, rural resettlement programme aimed to isolate the guerrillas from the logistical support that local communities could provide.²³ This resulted in massive population displacements. Communities were raided and subsequently dispersed throughout strategic resettlements located near Portuguese military sites. In Eastern Angola, the region where CART 3313 spent their first year of duty, rural resettlement was extremely effective: according to official data, 80% of the population of Moxico province had been already "recovered" in 1969, and lived in rural resettlements.²⁴ Distant from their original communities, displaced civilians were forced to rebuild their lives under very vulnerable conditions. Limited to a military-defined security perimeter, distant from their traditional livelihoods, permanently supervised by administrative and military authorities, "recovered" populations became dependant on the Portuguese authorities in multiple ways.

Unaware of the history of the strategic resettlements and violent displacement of the populations (and of the debate that, from late 1960s onwards, questioned the efficacy and benignity of this counterinsurgency strategy), CART 3313's combatants took what they saw as the unquestionable Angolan reality.²⁵ The presence of civilians in settlements near the barracks was presented as resulting from a spontaneous popular decision, as can be read in *Livro da Unidade BART 3835*: "insurgency forced the people who

²³For a comparative analysis of the resettlement programme in North, East, Central and South Angola see Gerald J. Bender, *Angola Under the Portuguese: The Myth and the Reality* (London: Heinemann, 1978), 165-194.

²⁴Bender, Angola, 171.

²⁵For a summary of the critical examinations on strategic resettlements presented at the Symposium on Counter-Subversion that took place in Luanda in January 1969, see Bender, *Angola*, 195-196. On this topic, see also Afonso e Gomes, *Os anos*, 577-580.

wished to remain under our control (...) to abandon their traditional living and working places, and to regroup along the military headquarters²⁶. This official wording is not innocent: it ignores the coercive nature of civilian displacement, and hides the violence of its effects on people's lives.²⁷

Following the same line of thought—as if local populations had chosen to live near military barracks—Portuguese authorities justified the one year limit of food assistance to local populations with the final goal of "forcing the natives to work for their livelihood, as otherwise we would have the State indefinitely feeding thousands of indigenous".²⁸ This paternalistic reasoning is based on the essentialist and negative representation of Africans that the lusotropicalist vulgate was unable to efface. Colonizers' depiction of natives' sloth seems to have been a common feature of European colonialism: it was a very useful instrument for drawing distinctions between groups of people and enforcing an advantageous labour framework. The discourse on idleness was used to distinguish between desirable and undesirable labour, and "pressure to work was, more accurately, pressure to alter traditional habits".²⁹

Several ex-combatants follow a similar storyline, echoing the idea of the alleged Africans' aversion to work. A soldier recalls the declining production of the villagers' farming after the departure of the local administrator:

The white [colonial] administrator was very demanding with the blacks.³⁰ Usually, men remain all day lying in the shade and the women go to work in the gardens, with small children on their back. But that didn't happen when this administrator was in charge. He came to the huts at six in the morning, 'Come

²⁸AHM, HBART, PT/AHM/DIV/2/2/6/151: III/15.

²⁹Anne McClintock, Imperial Leather. Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest (New York: Routledge, 1995), 252.

³⁰CART 3313's ex-combatants narratives are based on the distinction black/ white (branco/preto) when they recall their Angolan time. Decades after their tour of duty, racial distinction remains a central element in their depiction of Angola—it seems to have survived *Estado Novo*'s later effort to efface race from public discourse, and to have resisted decolonisation and the fall of empire.

356

²⁶AHM, HBART, PT/AHM/DIV/2/2/6/151: III/14.

²⁷For personal accounts of Portuguese ex-servicemen on the violence that surrounded the strategic resettlement of African populations in Angola in the sixties, see José Niza, *Golden Gate:Um Quase Diário de Guerra* (Lisbon: Publicações D. Quixote, 2012) and Daniel Gouveia, *Arcanjos e Bons Demónios: Crónicas da Guerra de África 1961-1974* (Lisbon: Hugin, 2002).

Portuguese Studies Review

PSR Previews : End of this article's preview



PORTUGUESE STUDIES REVIEW (PSR) BIBLID | ISSN 1057-1515 print ONLINE: through EBSCO and Gale/Cengage JOURNAL HOMEPAGES: http://www.maproom44.com/psr (URL permanently valid) and http://www.trentu.ca/admin/publications/psr (URL not valid after 05 June 2020) © 2014-2019 Portuguese Studies Review and Baywolf Press | All rights reserved

Subscription Information: The Portuguese Studies Review (an imprint of Baywolf Press & Éditions Baywolf) appears in two issues a year, in (1) August-September and (2) January. The PSR Editorial Office is presently located at Trent University, Peterborough, Ontario, K9L 0G2, Canada. The Portuguese Studies Review's e-mail address is psr@trentu.ca. To contact Baywolf Press, direct inquiries also to psr@ trentu.ca. All e-mail relating to the PSR is copied to the Baywolf Press office. Please visit our website at http://www.trentu.ca/psr or http://www.maproom44.com/psr for more information on subscriptions. Special rates are featured on our website, as is information for subscription agencies and resellers.

Manuscript Submissions: The *PSR* is a peer-reviewed journal (double-blind review process) devoted to promoting interdisciplinary scholarly study of the countries, regions, and communities that share, build on, or are transforming a Portuguese or Brazilian legacy. The *PSR* promotes a critical understanding of the historical and current evolution of political, economic, social and cultural networks incorporating Portugal, Brazil, and the various global or regional actors affected by Luso-Brazilian exploration, colonization, emigration, policy trends, trade agreements, and other linkages. The scope extends to all relevant parts of Europe, Asia, Africa, and the Americas. Contributions are invited from all disciplines. The *PSR* accepts papers combining pure and applied research. All articles are expected to be accessible to readers from diverse backgrounds.

Proposals and digital manuscripts should be sent to Prof. Ivana Elbl, Chief Editor, *Portuguese Studies Review*, Trent University, Peterborough, Ontario, K9L 0G2, Canada. Articles not exceeding 8,000 words are preferred (8,000 words exclusive of notes, tables, and graphics). Longer manuscripts will be considered, at the discretion of the Editors. Note format should follow the *PSR* house style (check our website). All manuscripts must include a 150-word abstract (articles in Portuguese, French, and Spanish should include an abstract both in the language of the paper and in English).

Submissions are to be made by e-mail, in a digital file. Reflecting open (recoverable/non-proprietary) format approaches, *OpenOffice* is the journal's *preferred* standard for submissions (*i.e.* .odt data file format, native or saved as .odt from other software), followed by MS-Word (.doc, .docx), or (only in emergency) as an RTF file. PDF (encoded) submissions are not accepted. The files *must* be IBM-compatible (Macintosh file formats will not be accepted). The *PSR* will not consider manuscripts currently submitted to another journal or press, or published or forthcoming elsewhere. If accepted, articles that do not follow the *PSR*'s style (capitalization, note format, *etc.*) will be required to conform prior to publication. Unsolicited book reviews will be accepted only at the discretion of the Editors.

- The *Portuguese Studies Review* declines all responsibility, direct, imputed, derivative, or otherwise legally construed, for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors to the *PSR*.
 - © Baywolf Press & Éditions Baywolf and Portuguese Studies Review, 2017. All rights reserved.

Claims for issues not received must be sent to the Editorial Office within three months of the date of publication of the issue. Changes of address should be reported promptly. The *Portuguese Studies Review* will not be responsible for copies lost owing to a failure to report a change of address. The *Review* cannot mail subscription copies to temporary summer or field research addresses.

Correspondence regarding editorial matters, contributions, and books for review should be sent to Prof. Ivana Elbl, Chief Editor, *Portuguese Studies Review*, Trent University, Peterborough, Ontario, K9J 7B8, Canada. **Permissions to Reprint:** Contact Martin Malcolm Elbl, Managing Editor, *Portuguese Studies Review*, Trent University, Peterborough, Ontario, K9L 0G2. **Advertising:** The *PSR* has ceased to accept advertising for the foreseeable future..

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in the Historical Abstracts, America: History and Life, Sociological Abstracts, and Worldwide Political Science Abstracts. The Portuguese Studies Review is networked through EBSCO, Gale/Cengage, and has reached an agreement with ProQuest. Previews of this journal are available on Google Books (up to spring 2016) and on our own site (trentu.ca/psr or maproom44.com/psr).



